



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 10, 2013

Ms. Rebecca Hendricks Brewer
Counsel for the City of Frisco
Abernathy, Roeder, Boyd & Joplin, P.C.
P.O. Box 1210
McKinney, Texas 75070-1210

OR2013-09653

Dear Ms. Brewer:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 490161.

The Frisco Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for information regarding police calls or incidents involving a named individual at a specified address during a specified period of time. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note a portion of the submitted information, which we have marked, is not responsive to the request because it does not involve the named individual. This ruling does not address the public availability of the information that is not responsive to the request, and the department is not required to release this information in response to the instant request.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this

test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouses files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

We find the instant request requires the department to compile unspecified criminal history records concerning the individual named and, thus, implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note you have submitted records that do not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not implicate the privacy interest of the named individual and may not be withheld as a compilation of the individual's criminal history under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Therefore, we will consider your arguments against the disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes. You claim the information at issue is confidential under the federal Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 ("HIPAA"), 42 U.S.C. §§ 1320d-1320d-8. At the direction of Congress, the Secretary of Health and Human Services ("HHS") promulgated regulations setting privacy standards for medical records, which HHS issued as the Federal Standards for Privacy of Individually Identifiable Health Information. *See* Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996, 42 U.S.C. § 1320d-2 (Supp. IV 1998) (historical & statutory note); Standards for Privacy of Individually Identifiable Health Information, 45 C.F.R. Pts. 160, 164 ("Privacy Rule"); *see also* Attorney General Opinion JC-0508 at 2 (2002). These standards govern the releasability of protected health information by a covered entity. *See* 45 C.F.R. pts. 160, 164. Under these standards, a covered entity may not use or disclose protected health information, except as provided by parts 160 and 164 of the Code of Federal Regulations. *See id.* § 164.502(a).

This office has addressed the interplay of the Privacy Rule and the Act. In Open Records Decision No. 681 (2004), we noted section 164.512 of title 45 of the Code of Federal Regulations provides a covered entity may use or disclose protected health information to the extent such use or disclosure is required by law and the use or disclosure complies with and is limited to the relevant requirements of such law. *See id.* § 164.512(a)(1). We further

noted the Act “is a mandate in Texas law that compels Texas governmental bodies to disclose information to the public.” *See* ORD 681 at 8; *see also* Gov’t Code §§ 552.002, .003, .021. We, therefore, held the disclosures under the Act come within section 164.512(a). Consequently, the Privacy Rule does not make information confidential for the purpose of section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See Abbott v. Tex. Dep’t of Mental Health & Mental Retardation*, 212 S.W.3d 648 (Tex. App.—Austin 2006, no pet.); ORD 681 at 9; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 478 (1987) (as general rule, statutory confidentiality requires express language making information confidential). Thus, because the Privacy Rule does not make information that is subject to disclosure under the Act confidential, the department may withhold protected health information from the public only if the information is confidential by law or an exception in subchapter C of the Act applies.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. *See* Occ. Code §§ 151.001-168.202. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in part:

- (a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.
- (c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Id. § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Although you assert the information at issue must be withheld pursuant to the MPA, we find you have failed to demonstrate how this information consists of a physician-patient communication or a record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient that was created or maintained by a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Occ. Code § 159.002(a), (b). Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 611.002 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides for the confidentiality of records created or maintained by a mental health professional. Section 611.002 provides in part:

(a) Communications between a patient and a professional, and records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient that are created or maintained by a professional, are confidential.

(b) Confidential communications or records may not be disclosed except as provided by Section 611.004 or 611.0045.

Health & Safety Code § 611.002(a)-(b); *see also id.* § 611.001 (defining “patient” and “professional”). Section 611.001 defines a “professional” as (1) a person authorized to practice medicine, (2) a person licensed or certified by the state to diagnose, evaluate, or treat mental or emotional conditions or disorders, or (3) a person the patient reasonably believes is authorized, licensed, or certified. *See id.* § 611.001(2). Upon review, we find you have not demonstrated any of the information at issue consists of a mental health record for purposes of chapter 611 of the Health and Safety Code. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides in relevant part:

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

...

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

Id. § 773.091(b), (g). Except for the information specified in section 773.091(g), emergency medical services (“EMS”) records are deemed confidential under section 773.091 and may only be released in accordance with chapter 773 of the Health and Safety Code. *See id.* §§ 773.091-.094. Upon review, we find the information at issue is not an EMS record subject to chapter 773. Thus, the information at issue may not be withheld under

section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses sections 772.118, 772.218 and 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. Chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code authorizes the development of local emergency communication districts. Sections 772.118, 772.218, and 772.318 are applicable to emergency 9-1-1 districts established in accordance with chapter 772. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 (1996). These sections make the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers that are furnished by a service supplier confidential. *Id.* at 2. Section 772.118 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than two million. Section 772.218 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 860,000. Section 772.318 applies to an emergency communication district for a county with a population of more than 20,000.

You state the information at issue includes the originating telephone number and address of a 9-1-1 caller that was furnished by a service supplier. You do not inform us, however, whether the department is part of an emergency communication district established under section 772.118, section 772.218, or section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. Therefore, we must rule conditionally. Accordingly, if the department is part of an emergency communication district established under one of these sections, then the department must withhold the originating telephone number and address of the 9-1-1 caller that was furnished by a service supplier under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 772.118, section 772.218, or section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. If the department is not subject to section 772.118, section 772.218, or section 772.318, the department may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 on the basis of section 772.118, section 772.218, or section 772.318.

As previously noted, section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. Common-law privacy also protects the types of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court, which includes information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 683. In addition, this office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (1987) (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the department must withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the department has failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and

a matter of no legitimate public interest. Therefore, no portion of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit, title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, (1) to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (2) if the department is part of an emergency communication district established under section 772.118, section 772.218, or section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code, then the department must withhold the originating telephone number and address of the 9-1-1 caller that was furnished by a service supplier under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.118, section 772.218, or section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code; and (3) the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining responsive information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Michelle R. Garza", followed by a horizontal line extending to the right.

Michelle R. Garza
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MRG/som

Ref: ID# 490161

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)