



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

GREG ABBOTT

June 12, 2013

Ms. Michelle M. Kretz
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2013-09844

Dear Ms. Kretz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 489997 (P.I.R. No. W024783).

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for the personnel file of a named officer.¹ You state the city will redact information as permitted by sections 552.130(c) and 552.147(b) of the Government Code and Open Records Decision Nos. 670 (2001) and 684 (2009).² You claim some of the submitted information is exempted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, and 552.117 of the Government Code.³ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹The city sought and received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request).

²Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact, without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office, the motor vehicle record information described in subsections 552.130(a)(1) and (a)(3). *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c); *see also id.* § 552.130(d)-(e) (requestor may appeal governmental body's decision to withhold information under section 552.130(c) to attorney general and governmental body withholding information pursuant to section 552.130(c) must provide certain notice to requestor). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision under the Act. *See id.* § 552.147(b). Open Records Decision No. 670 is a previous determination that authorizes all governmental bodies to withhold the home addresses and telephone numbers, personal cellular telephone and pager numbers, social security numbers, and family member information of peace officers under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision. Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information, including W-4 forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

³Although you do not raise section 552.117 of the Government Code in your brief, we understand you to raise this exception based on your markings.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065(b) states that except as provided by subsection (c) or subsection (e), accident reports are privileged and confidential. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). The requestor has not provided the city with two of the three requisite pieces of information specified by the statute. Accordingly, the city must withhold the submitted CR-3 accident report forms contained in Exhibits C-1 and C-2 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 143.089 of the Local Government Code. You state the city is a civil service city under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. Section 143.089 provides for the existence of two different types of personnel files relating to a police officer: one that must be maintained as part of the officer’s civil service file and another that the police department may maintain for its own internal use. *See* Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(a), (g). Under section 143.089(a), the officer’s civil service file must contain certain specified items, including commendations, periodic evaluations by the police officer’s supervisor, and documents relating to any misconduct in which the department took disciplinary action against the officer under chapter 143 of the Local Government Code. *Id.* § 143.089(a)(1)–(2). Chapter 143 prescribes the following types of disciplinary actions: removal, suspension, demotion, and uncompensated duty. *Id.* §§ 143.051–.055; *see* Attorney General Opinion JC-0257 (2000) (written reprimand is not disciplinary action for purposes of Local Gov’t Code chapter 143). In cases in which a police department investigates a police officer’s misconduct and takes disciplinary action against an officer, it is required by section 143.089(a)(2) to place all investigatory records relating to the investigation and disciplinary action, including background documents such as complaints, witness statements, and documents of like nature from individuals who were not in a supervisory capacity, in the police officer’s civil service file maintained under section 143.089(a). *See Abbott v. Corpus Christi*, 109 S.W.3d 113, 122 (Tex. App.—Austin 2003, no pet.). All investigatory materials in a case resulting in disciplinary action are “from the employing department” when they are held by or are in the possession of the department because of its investigation into a police officer’s misconduct, and the police department must forward them to the civil service commission for placement in the civil service personnel file. *Id.* Such records may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089 of the Local Government Code. *See* Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(f); Open Records Decision No. 562 at 6 (1990). However, a document relating to a police officer’s alleged misconduct may not be placed in his civil service file if there is insufficient evidence to sustain the charge of misconduct. Local Gov’t Code § 143.089(b). Information that reasonably relates to a police officer’s employment relationship with the police department and that is maintained in a police department’s internal file pursuant to section 143.089(g) is confidential and must not be released. *City of San Antonio v. San Antonio Express-News*, 47 S.W.3d 556

(Tex. App.—San Antonio 2000, pet. denied); *City of San Antonio v. Tex. Attorney Gen.*, 851 S.W.2d 946, 949 (Tex. App.—Austin 1993, writ denied).

You explain the remaining information in Exhibits C-1 and C-2 is maintained in the police department's internal file for the named officer, and this information relates to investigations that did not result in disciplinary action against the named officer. Based on your representations and our review, we find the city must withhold the remaining information in Exhibits C-1 and C-2 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. This office has found personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 600* (1992) (employee's designation of retirement beneficiary, choice of insurance carrier, election of optional coverages, direct deposit authorization, forms allowing employee to allocate pretax compensation to group insurance, health care or dependent care), 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), 455 at 9 (1987) (employment applicant's salary information not private), 423 at 2 (1984) (scope of public employee privacy is narrow). Upon review, we agree the information you have marked in Exhibit C-3 is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the city must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the *Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts*. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we find the city must withhold the date of birth that you have marked in Exhibit C-3 under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the current and former home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a peace officer, regardless of whether the peace officer made an election under section 552.024 or section 552.1175 of the Government Code to keep such information confidential. Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. Upon review, we agree the city must withhold the information you have marked in Exhibit C-3 under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code.

In summary, the city must withhold the submitted CR-3 accident report forms contained in Exhibits C-1 and C-2 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. The city must withhold the remaining information in Exhibits C-1 and C-2 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 143.089(g) of the Local Government Code. The city must withhold the information you have marked in Exhibit C-3 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and section 552.102 of the Government Code. The city must also withhold the information you have marked in Exhibit C-3 under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/bhf

Ref: ID# 489997

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)