



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 12, 2013

Ms. Sharon Alexander
Associate General Counsel
Texas Department of Transportation
125 East 11th Street
Austin, Texas 78701-2483

OR2013-09912

Dear Ms. Alexander:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 490075.

The Texas Department of Transportation (the "department") received a request for all documents and reports, including studies and data on traffic conditions, accidents, safety, visibility, repairs, and proposals for changing road conditions or improving safety, related to a specified intersection from March 26, 2003 to the date of the request. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.111 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Exhibit C consists of CRB-3 and CR-3 accident report forms that were completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the

¹We assume the "representative sample" of information submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than those submitted to this office.

Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) states that except as provided by subsection (c) or (e), accident reports are privileged and confidential. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the department is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* The requestor has not provided the department with two of the three pieces of information; thus, the department must withhold the accident report forms in Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code.

You assert Exhibit B is excepted under section 552.111 of the Government Code, which excepts from disclosure “[a]n interagency or intraagency memorandum or letter that would not be available by law to a party in litigation with the agency[.]” Section 552.111 encompasses information protected by civil discovery privileges. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 647 at 3 (1996), 251 at 2-4 (1980). You contend Exhibit B is excepted from disclosure under section 552.111 because it would be privileged from discovery under section 409 of title 23 of the United States Code. Section 409 provides the following:

Notwithstanding any other provision of law, reports, surveys, schedules, lists, or data compiled or collected for the purpose of identifying, evaluating, or planning the safety enhancement of potential accident sites, hazardous roadway conditions, or railway-highway crossings, pursuant to sections 130, 144, and 148 of this title or for the purpose of developing any highway safety construction improvement project which may be implemented utilizing Federal-aid highway funds shall not be subject to discovery or admitted into evidence in a Federal or State court proceeding or considered for other purposes in any action for damages arising from any occurrence at a location mentioned or addressed in such reports, surveys, schedules, lists, or data.

23 U.S.C. § 409. Federal courts have stated section 409 excludes from evidence data compiled for purposes of highway and railroad crossing safety enhancement and construction for which a state receives federal funding, in order to facilitate candor in administrative evaluations of highway safety hazards and to prevent federally required record keeping from being used for purposes of private litigation. *See Harrison v. Burlington N. R.R.*, 965 F.2d 155, 160 (7th Cir. 1992); *Robertson v. Union Pac. R.R.*, 954 F.2d 1433, 1435 (8th Cir. 1992); *see also Pierce County v. Guillen*, 123 S.Ct. 720 (2003) (upholding constitutionality of 23 U.S.C. § 409, relied on by county in denying request under state's Public Disclosure Act).

You state the subject roadways are part of the national highway system under section 103 of title 23 of the United States Code and are federal-aid highways for the purposes of section 409 of title 23. You further state the information at issue was collected and compiled for highway safety purposes. You contend the information at issue would be privileged from discovery in civil litigation under section 409, and is, therefore, excepted from disclosure under section 552.111 of the Government Code. Based on your representations and our review, we conclude the department may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.111 of the Government Code.

To conclude, the department must withhold Exhibit C under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. The department may withhold Exhibit B under section 552.111 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/index_orl.php, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act must be directed to the Cost Rules Administrator of the Office of the Attorney General, toll free at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



James D. Cypert
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JDC/ac

Ref: ID# 490075

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)