



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 26, 2013

Mr. John Ohnemiller
First Assistant City Attorney
City of Midland
P.O. Box 1152
Midland, Texas 79702

OR2013-10905

Dear Mr. Ohnemiller:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 491479 (Midland ID# 12143).

The Midland Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified police report. You indicate you will release some information to the requestor, with redactions of Texas license plate numbers pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009), information described in subsections 552.130(a)(1) and 552.130(a)(3) under section 552.130(c) of the Government Code, and social security numbers under section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You claim portions of the

¹Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact, without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office, the motor vehicle record information described in subsections 552.130(a)(1) and (a)(3). Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain information, including Texas license plate numbers under section 552.130 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision. However, the Texas legislature recently amended section 552.130 to allow a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a)(2) of the Government Code without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. Act of May 6, 2013, 83rd Leg., R.S., S.B. 458, § 1 (to be codified as an amendment to Gov't Code § 552.130(c)). Again, a governmental body must notify the requestor when redacting information subject to subsection 552.130(a)(2). *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(d), (e). Thus, the statutory amendment to section 552.130 of the Government Code supercedes Open Records Decision No. 684, and a governmental body may redact information subject to subsection 552.130(a)(2) only in accordance with section 552.130, not Open Records Decision No. 684. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147(b).

submitted information are excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center (the "NCIC") or by the Texas Crime Information Center (the "TCIC") is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *Id.* § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the NCIC network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). *See generally* Gov't Code §§ 411.081-.1409. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See id.* § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We note CHRI does not include driving record information. *Id.* § 411.082(2)(B). Although you claim some of the submitted information constitutes CHRI, we find none of that information consists of CHRI generated by the NCIC or TCIC. Consequently, you have failed to demonstrate how any portion of the information at issue constitutes CHRI for purposes of chapter 411 or federal law. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *See Indus. Found. v. Texas Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both elements of the test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 9-12 (1992), 545 at 4

(1990), 523 at 4 (1989), 373 at 4 (1983) (determination of whether public's interest in obtaining personal financial information is sufficient to justify its disclosure must be made on case-by-case basis). In addition, this office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987) (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps). Upon review, we find the information we have marked and indicated is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the department must withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the department has failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and a matter of no legitimate public interest. Therefore, no portion of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note the remaining information includes information subject to sections 552.130 and 552.136 of the Government Code.² Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136(b) of the Government Code provides, "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining "access device"). This office has concluded insurance policy numbers constitute access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. ORD 684 at 9. Thus, the department must withhold the insurance policy number we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked and indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code and the insurance policy number we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Michelle R. Garza", with a long horizontal line extending to the right.

Michelle R. Garza
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MRG/som

Ref: ID# 491479

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)