



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

July 17, 2013

Mr. John R. Batoon  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of El Paso  
P.O. Box 1890  
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2013-12209

Dear Mr. Batoon:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 493427.

The City of El Paso (the "city") received a request for all documents relating to a named individual, including information pertaining to incidents that occurred during a specified period of time. You state you have released some of the requested information to the requestor. You claim that the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision."<sup>1</sup> Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82. This office has found a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request seeks all documents pertaining to a named individual. This request requires the city to compile the named individual's criminal history and implicates the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not a compilation of the individual's criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. We note you have submitted information that does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not consist of a compilation of the named individual's criminal history, and it may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. Accordingly, we will address the applicability of your claimed exception to disclosure of this information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime [if] release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state report numbers 12-175158, 12-111038, 08-340316, 07-074110, and 06-234230 relate to pending criminal investigations by the city's police department. Based on your representation, we conclude the release of report numbers 12-175158 and 12-111038 would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to report numbers 12-175158 and 12-111038.

However, we note report 07-074110 involves an allegation of aggravated assault with a deadly weapon that occurred on May 15, 2007. The statute of limitations for the offense

described in this report is three years. *See* Penal Code § 22.02(b) (aggravated assault is felony of second degree); Crim. Proc. Code art. 12.01(7) (providing an indictment or information on felony not listed in articles 12.01(1)-(6) may be presented within three years from the date of the commission of the offense, and not afterward). Further, report numbers 08-340316 and 06-234230 pertain to misdemeanor assaults that occurred in 2008 and 2006. *See* Penal Code § 22.01(b) (offense under subsection 22.01(a)(1) is Class A misdemeanor). The statute of limitations for a misdemeanor is two years from the date of the offense. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 12.02. More than three years have elapsed since the events giving rise to the investigation in report 07-074110, and more than two years have elapsed since the events giving rise to the investigations in report numbers 08-340316 and 06-234230. You have not informed this office any criminal charges were filed within the limitations periods for any of these offenses. Thus, we find you have not demonstrated release of the remaining reports at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. Therefore, the city may not withhold report numbers 08-340316, 07-074110, and 06-234230 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-87; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Therefore, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold report numbers 12-175158 and 12-111038 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold report numbers 12-175158 and 12-111038 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

---

<sup>2</sup>We note the remaining information contains a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Sarah Casterline', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Sarah Casterline  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

SEC/tch

Ref: ID# 493427

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)