



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 18, 2013

Mr. Warren M. S. Ernst
Chief of the General Counsel Division
Office of the City Attorney
City of Dallas
1500 Marilla Street, Room 7DN
Dallas, Texas 75201

OR2013-12377

Dear Mr. Ernst:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 494776.

The City of Dallas (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to water testing in specified locations and a copy of the water pipeline system map for a specified area. You state the city will release some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the city's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures that a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. Subsection 552.301(b) requires that a governmental body ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Subsection 552.301(e) requires the governmental body to submit to the attorney general, not later than the fifteenth business day after the date of the receipt of the request: (1) written comments stating why the governmental body's claimed exceptions apply to the information that it seeks to withhold; (2) a copy of the written request for information; (3) a signed statement of the date on which the governmental body received the request or evidence sufficient to establish that date; and (4) the specific information that the governmental body seeks to withhold or representative samples if the information is

voluminous. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1). You state the city received the request for information on May 17, 2013. However, we note the submitted information reflects the requestor initially requested the information via e-mail on April 30, 2013. Because you do not inform this office the city was closed for business any of the days at issue, we find the city's ten- and fifteen-business-day deadlines were May 14, 2013 and May 21, 2013, respectively. However, the envelope in which the city provided the information required by subsections 552.301(b) and (e) was meter-marked May 22, 2013. *See id.* § 552.308 (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Thus, we find the city failed to comply with the requirements mandated by section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the information is public and must be released unless the governmental body overcomes this presumption by demonstrating a compelling reason to withhold the information. *Id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). A compelling reason generally exists when information is confidential by law or third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 at 3, 325 at 2 (1982). However, because section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to withhold information, we will consider the applicability of this exception to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. As part of the Texas Homeland Security Act ("HSA"), sections 418.176 through 418.182 were added to chapter 418 of the Government Code. These provisions make certain information related to terrorism confidential.

Section 418.181 of the Government Code provides "[t]hose documents or portions of documents in the possession of a governmental entity are confidential if they identify the technical details of particular vulnerabilities of critical infrastructure to an act of terrorism." *Id.* § 418.181. The fact that information may relate to a governmental body's security concerns does not make the information *per se* confidential under the HSA. *See* Open Records Decision No. 649 at 3 (1996) (language of confidentiality provision controls scope of its protection). Furthermore, the mere recitation by a governmental body of a statute's key terms is not sufficient to demonstrate the applicability of the claimed provision. As with any exception to disclosure, a governmental body asserting one of the confidentiality provisions of the HSA must adequately explain how the responsive records fall within the scope of the claimed provision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must explain how claimed exception to disclosure applies).

You state the submitted maps pertain to the city's water purification and distribution systems. We note the city's water purification and distribution systems are critical infrastructure. *See generally id.* § 421.001 (defining "critical infrastructure" to include "all public or private assets, systems, and functions vital to the security, governance, public health and safety, economy, or morale of the state or the nation"). You explain the release of the submitted information would expose potential vulnerabilities of the city's water purification and distribution systems by providing someone with placement and technical details. You further explain this information could be used to disrupt the city's water purification and distribution systems by causing extreme damage. Based on your arguments and our review of the information at issue, we find the city has shown that release of the submitted information would identify the technical details of particular vulnerabilities of the city's water purification and distribution systems to an act of terrorism. Thus, the submitted information must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 418.181 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lindsay E. Hale
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

LEH/tch

Ref: ID# 494776

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)