



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 9, 2013

Mr. Charles H. Weir
Assistant City Attorney
City of San Antonio
P.O. Box 839966
San Antonio, Texas 78283-3966

OR2013-13859

Dear Mr. Weir:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 496028 (File No. W014292).

The San Antonio Police Department (the "department") received a request for case numbers 12-165208, 12-060614, 11-288857, and 11-288661. We understand you will redact social security numbers under section 552.147 of the Government Code.¹ You claim the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information, portions of which consist of representative samples.² We have also received and considered comments submitted by the requestor. *See* Gov't Code § 552.304 (providing that interested party may submit comments stating why information should or should not be released).

¹Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b). We note the requestor has a right, however, to his own social security number. *See generally id.* § 552.023(b) (government body may not deny access to person to whom information relates, or that person's representative, solely on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles).

²We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Initially, we must address the department's obligations under the Act. Section 552.301 of the Government Code describes the procedural obligations placed on a governmental body that receives a written request for information it wishes to withhold. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), the governmental body must request a ruling from this office and state the exceptions to disclosure that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See id.* § 552.301(b). Pursuant to section 552.301(e), the governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving the request (1) written comments stating the reasons why the state exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See id.* § 552.301(e).

You state the department received the request for information on March 25, 2013. Thus, the ten-business-day deadline for requesting a ruling from this office was April 8, 2013, and the fifteen-business-day deadline was April 15, 2013. However, the envelope in which you requested a ruling from this office and submitted the information required by section 552.301(e) bears a meter mark of June 4, 2013. *See id.* § 552.308 (prescribing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Consequently, we find the department failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of the Act results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); Open Records Decision No. 319 (1982). The presumption information is public under section 552.302 can be overcome by demonstrating that the information is confidential by law or third-party interests are at stake. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 630 at 3 (1994), 325 at 2 (1982). Because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to withhold information, we will address your arguments under these sections. We will also consider whether any of the submitted information must be withheld under section 552.137 of the Government Code, which also can provide a compelling reason to withhold information.³

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information made confidential by other statutes. Section 261.201 of the Family Code provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find some of the submitted information consists of files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, or working papers used or developed in an investigation under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for purposes of ch. 261 of Fam. Code); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). As you do not indicate the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume that no such rule exists. Therefore, we conclude the information in Exhibit III is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code and the department must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code.⁴ *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as chapter 411 of the Government Code, which deems confidential criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. CHRI means “information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions.” Gov’t Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. *See* Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* at 10-12. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Texas

⁴As we make this determination, we do not address your remaining claims for this information.

Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-127. Furthermore, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of CHRI the department must withhold from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses constitutional privacy, which protects two kinds of interests. *See Whalen v. Roe*, 429 U.S. 589, 599-600 (1977); Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 3-5 (1992), 478 at 4 (1987), 455 at 3-7 (1987). The first is the interest in independence in making certain important decisions relating to the “zones of privacy” pertaining to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education the United States Supreme Court has recognized. *See Fado v. Coon*, 633 F.2d 1172 (5th Cir. 1981); ORD 455 at 3-7. The second constitutionally protected privacy interest is in freedom from public disclosure of certain personal matters. *See Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Tex.*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985); ORD 455 at 6-7. This aspect of constitutional privacy balances the individual’s privacy interest against the public’s interest in the information. *See* ORD 455 at 7. Constitutional privacy under section 552.101 is reserved for “the most intimate aspects of human affairs.” *Id.* at 5 (internal quotations omitted) (quoting *Ramie*, 765 F.2d at 492).

Federal courts have recognized individuals have a constitutional right to privacy in their unclothed bodies. Quoting the United States Court of Appeals for the Ninth Circuit, which concluded, “[w]e cannot conceive of a more basic subject of privacy than the naked body[.]” the United States Court of Appeals for the Second Circuit has found “there is a right to privacy in one’s unclothed or partially unclothed body, regardless [of] whether that right is established through the auspices of the Fourth Amendment or the Fourteenth Amendment.” *Poe v. Leonard*, 282 F.3d 123, 138-39 (2d Cir. 2002) (quoting *York v. Story*, 324 F.2d 450, 455 (9th Cir. 1963)). We note one of the photographs in Exhibit V and the submitted video recording depict the unclothed or partially unclothed body of an individual. We conclude the department must withhold the photograph and the portions of the video recording that contain images of the unclothed or partially unclothed body, which we have indicated, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the common-law right to privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both elements of this test must be met. *Id.* at 681-82.

Common-law privacy protects the types of information held to be intimate or embarrassing in *Industrial Foundation*. *See id.* at 683 (information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs). Additionally, this office has found some kinds of medical information or information indicating disabilities or specific illnesses are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 470 (illness from severe emotional and job-related stress), 455 (prescription drugs, illnesses, operations, and physical handicaps).

Upon review, we find the information we have marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Therefore, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. You have failed to demonstrate, however, that any of the remaining information is private and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information that relates to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit, title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked in the remaining records under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

We note the remaining information contains e-mail addresses that are subject to section 552.137 of the Government Code. Section 552.137 excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail addresses at issue are not excluded by subsection (c). Therefore, the department must withhold the personal e-mail addresses we have marked in Exhibit IV and indicated in the video under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with (1) section 261.201 of the Family Code, (2) section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law, (3) constitutional privacy, and (4) common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle

record information we have marked in the remaining records under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the personal e-mail addresses we have marked in Exhibit IV and indicated in the video under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their public disclosure. The department must release the remaining information.⁵

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 496028

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁵We note the requestor has a special right of access to some of the information being released in this instance. See Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access, beyond right of general public, to information held by governmental body that relates to person and is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect person's privacy interests). Because such information may be confidential with respect to the general public, if the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office.