



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 26, 2013

Mr. John R. Batoon
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2013-14892

Dear Mr. Batoon:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 501648.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified complaint report. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. You also provide correspondence from the 34th Judicial District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") claiming the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in pertinent part, the following:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent

with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). You state the submitted information pertains to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse. *See id.* § 261.001(1)(E) (definition of “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of Family Code includes sexual assault under Penal Code section 22.011); *see also* Penal Code § 22.011(c)(1) (defining “child” for purposes of section 22.011 as “a person younger than 17 years of age”). Accordingly, we conclude this information is within the scope of section 261.201(a). However, we note the requestor may be a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the alleged child victim at issue and the requestor is not alleged to have committed the alleged abuse. As such, this requestor may have a right of access to the information at issue pursuant to section 261.201(k). *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(k). Thus, if the requestor is not the child

victim's parent, managing conservator, or legal representative, then the submitted information must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. Otherwise, the department may not use section 261.201(a) to withhold this information from the requestor. *See id.* However, before the department provides any of the information at issue to the requestor, the department must redact any information that is otherwise excepted from required disclosure under the Act. *See id.* § 261.201(1)(2). Thus, we consider the remaining arguments against disclosure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be met. *Id.* at 681-82. The type of information considered intimate or embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation* included information relating to sexual assault, pregnancy, mental or physical abuse in the workplace, illegitimate children, psychiatric treatment of mental disorders, attempted suicide, and injuries to sexual organs. *Id.* at 683. Generally, only information that either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense must be withheld under common-law privacy. However, a governmental body is required to withhold an entire report when identifying information is inextricably intertwined with other releasable information or when the requestor knows the identity of the alleged victim. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 393 (1983), 339 (1982); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 440 (1986) (detailed descriptions of serious sexual offenses must be withheld).

You claim the submitted information is protected in its entirety by common-law privacy. However, as previously noted, the requestor may be a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child victim whose privacy interests are at issue, and therefore, may be acting as the child's authorized representative. Pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code, "[a] person's authorized representative has a special right of access, beyond the right of the general public, to information held by a governmental body that relates to the person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect that person's privacy interests." Gov't Code § 552.023(a); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning herself). Accordingly, if the requestor is the authorized representative of the child victim, the requestor has a right of access to the submitted information. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or

prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You inform us, and provide documentation from the district attorney’s office stating, the submitted information relates to a pending criminal prosecution. Based on this representation and our review, we determine the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases). Therefore, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Such basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-87; Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.¹

In summary, if the requestor is not the child victim’s parent, managing conservator, or legal representative, then the department must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. If the requestor is not the child victim’s parent, managing conservator, or legal representative, then with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the district attorney’s office remaining argument against disclosure for this information, except to note basic information is generally not excepted from public disclosure under section 552.103 of the Government Code. Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991).

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, consisting of several overlapping, sweeping lines that form a stylized representation of the name Ana Carolina Vieira.

Ana Carolina Vieira
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

ACV/ag

Ref: ID# 501648

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)