



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 28, 2013

Ms. Halfreda Anderson-Nelson
Senior Assistant General Counsel
Dallas Area Rapid Transit
P.O. Box 660163
Dallas, Texas 75266-0163

OR2013-15034

Dear Ms. Anderson-Nelson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 497834 (DART ORR# 9979).

Dallas Area Rapid Transit ("DART") received a request for the qualifications of a named individual for a specified position, including the named individual's resume and training certificates, and the applicant pool and interview packets for the specified position. You state you have released some information. You state DART does not have information responsive to the request for training certificates.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.122 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern

¹The Act does not require a governmental body to release information that did not exist when it received a request or to create responsive information. See *Economic Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 555 at 1 (1990), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. We note, however, the public generally has a legitimate interest in information that relates to public employment and public employees. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 542 (1990), 470 at 4 (1987) (public has legitimate interest in job qualifications and performance of public employees), 444 at 5-6 (1986) (public has legitimate interest in knowing reasons for dismissal, demotion, promotion, or resignation of public employees), 432 at 2 (1984) (scope of public employee privacy is narrow). Upon review, we find no portion of the submitted information is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public interest. Accordingly, DART may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.122(b) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[a] test item developed by a . . . governmental body[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.122(b). In Open Records Decision No. 626 (1994), this office determined that the term “test item” in section 552.122 includes “any standard means by which an individual’s or group’s knowledge or ability in a particular area is evaluated,” but does not encompass evaluations of an employee’s overall job performance or suitability. ORD 626 at 6. The question of whether specific information falls within the scope of section 552.122(b) must be determined on a case-by-case basis. *Id.* Traditionally, this office has applied section 552.122 where release of “test items” might compromise the effectiveness of future examinations. *Id.* at 4-5; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 118 (1976). Section 552.122 also protects the answers to test questions when the answers might reveal the questions themselves. *See* Attorney General Opinion JM-640 at 3 (1987); ORD 626 at 8.

You seek to withhold the submitted interview guide, questions, and responses for the specified position under section 552.122 of the Government Code. You state release of the information at issue would provide an unfair advantage to future applicants for this position, thereby impairing DART’s ability to evaluate qualified individuals. Upon review, we find the information at issue, including the submitted interview questions, consist of general questions or statements evaluating the applicant’s individual abilities, personal opinions, general workplace skills, subjective ability to respond to particular situations, and overall suitability for employment, and do not test any specific knowledge of the applicant. We find you have failed to explain how the submitted information constitutes test items for purposes of section 552.122. Accordingly, we determine the information at issue does not consist of test items under section 552.122(b) of the Government Code and may not be withheld on that basis. As no further exceptions to disclosure have been raised, the submitted information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Kathleen J. Santos". The signature is fluid and cursive, with a long horizontal stroke extending to the right.

Kathleen J. Santos
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KJS/som

Ref: ID# 497834

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)