



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 16, 2013

Ms. P. Armstrong
Assistant City Attorney
City of Dallas
1400 South Lamar Street
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2013-16064

Dear Ms. Armstrong:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 504203 (ORR# 2013-08897).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. You claim some of the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.²

You acknowledge the department failed to meet the 10-business-day deadline prescribed by section 552.301(b) of the Government Code in requesting an open records decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). We note the department also failed to comply with its fifteen-business-day deadline under section 552.301(e). *See id.* § 552.301(e). Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with

¹Although you did not raise section 552.130 in your brief, we understand you to raise this exception based on your markings in the submitted information.

²We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a governmental body may demonstrate a compelling reason to withhold information by showing that the information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third party interests. *See* ORD 630. Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code, this is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body’s interests and may be waived. *See* 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). However, the interests of a governmental body, other than the one that failed to comply with section 552.301, to withhold information under section 552.108 can provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure under section 552.302. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 586 (1991), 469 (1987). You provide a representation that the Dallas County District Attorney’s Office (the “district attorney’s office”) asserts section 552.108 of the Government Code. Therefore, we will consider the whether the information at issue may be withheld on behalf of the district attorney’s office under section 552.108. Furthermore, because sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons for non-disclosure, we will also consider the applicability of these exceptions to the submitted information.

Next, we note some of the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

...

(17) information that is also contained in a public court record[.]

Gov’t Code § 552.022(a)(17). The submitted information contains court-filed documents that are subject to subsection 552.022(a)(17), which must be released unless they are made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* You seek to withhold the information subject to subsection 552.022(a)(17) under section 552.108 of the Government Code. However, section 552.108 is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* ORDs 665 at 2 n.5, 663 at 5, 177 at 3. Therefore, the marked court-filed documents may not be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state, and have provided a representation from the district attorney’s office stating, the information at issue pertains to a pending criminal prosecution. Additionally, the district attorney’s office objects to release of the information. Therefore, we conclude release of the remaining information you have marked would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976) (court delineates law enforcement interest that are present in active cases). Thus, the department may withhold the remaining information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1).³

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the information you have marked, as well as the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130.

In summary, the department must release the information we have marked under section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code. The department may withhold the remaining information you have marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the district attorney’s office. The department must withhold the information you have marked, as well as the additional information we have marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

³As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not consider your argument under section 552.101.

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Tamara H. Holland".

Tamara H. Holland
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

THH/ac

Ref: ID# 504203

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)