



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 24, 2013

Mr. David F. Brown
Counsel for Texas Windstorm Insurance Association
Ewell, Bickham & Brown, L.L.P.
111 Congress Avenue, 28th Floor
Austin, Texas 78701

OR2013-16564

Dear Mr. Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 500193 (TWIA ID No. 000114).

The Texas Windstorm Insurance Association ("TWIA"), which you represent, received a request for (1) all records related to five named individuals, (2) all records related to a list of individuals and addresses, and (3) investigatory findings, reports, or communications related to a named individual. You state TWIA has no information responsive to categories one and three of the request.¹ You also state TWIA will redact information pursuant to sections 552.136 and 552.137 of the Government Code and Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).² Further, you state TWIA has released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of

¹We note the Act does not require a governmental body to disclose information that did not exist at the time the request was received. *Econ. Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision No. 452 at 3 (1986).

²Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain information, including an access device number and an e-mail address of a member of the public under sections 552.136 and 552.137 of the Government Code, respectively, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision. However, on September 1, 2011, the Texas legislature amended section 552.136 to allow a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.136(b) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See Gov't Code* § 552.136(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.136(e). *See id.* § 552.136(e). Thus, the statutory amendments to section 552.136 of the Government Code superseded Open Records Decision No. 684 on September 1, 2011. Therefore, a governmental body may only redact information subject to section 552.136(b) in accordance with section 552.136, not Open Records Decision No. 684.

the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. TWIA asserts portions of the submitted information are excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the Gramm-Leach-Bliley Act (the “GLB Act”) and relevant state insurance regulations. *See* 15 U.S.C. §§ 6801-6809; Ins. Code §§ 601.002 (covered entity must comply with 15 U.S.C. §§ 6802-6803), .051 (commissioner of insurance shall adopt rules necessary to carry out and keep privacy requirements consistent with GLB Act); 28 T.A.C. §§ 22.1-22.26. The purpose of the GLB Act is to promote competition in the financial services industry. *See* H.R. Conf. Rep. No. 106-434, at 245 (1999), *reprinted in* 1999 U.S.C.C.A.N. 245, 245. Reflecting Congressional concern regarding the dissemination of consumers’ personal financial information, the GLB Act provides certain privacy protections “to protect the security and confidentiality of [consumers’] nonpublic personal information.” 15 U.S.C. § 6801(a). The statute defines nonpublic personal information (“NPI”) as “personally identifiable financial information [“PIFI”] - (i) provided by a consumer to a financial institution; (ii) resulting from any transaction with the consumer or any service performed for the consumer; or (iii) otherwise obtained by the financial institution.” *Id.* § 6809(4)(A); *see id.* § 6809(4)(C)(i) (PIFI includes “any list, description, or other grouping of consumers (and publicly available information pertaining to them) that is derived using any [NPI]”). Federal regulations define PIFI as

any information: (i) [a] consumer provides to [a regulated financial institution] to obtain a financial product or service . . . ; (ii) [a]bout a consumer resulting from any transaction involving a financial product or service between [a regulated financial institution] and a consumer; or (iii) [a regulated financial institution] otherwise obtain[s] about a consumer in connection with providing a financial product or service to that consumer.

16 C.F.R. § 313.3(o)(1). Sections 6802(a) and (b) of title 15 of the United States Code provide in pertinent part as follows:

(a) Notice requirements

Except as otherwise provided in this subchapter, a financial institution may not, directly or through any affiliate, disclose to a nonaffiliated third party any

³We assume the “representative sample” of information submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

nonpublic personal information, unless such financial institution provides or has provided to the consumer a notice that complies with section 6803 of this title.

(b) Opt out

(1) In general

A financial institution may not disclose nonpublic personal information to a nonaffiliated third party unless—

(A) such financial institution clearly and conspicuously discloses to the consumer, in writing or in electronic form or other form permitted by the regulations prescribed under section 6804 of this title, that such information may be disclosed to such third party;

(B) the consumer is given the opportunity, before the time that such information is initially disclosed, to direct that such information not be disclosed to such third party; and

(C) the consumer is given an explanation of how the consumer can exercise that nondisclosure option.

15 U.S.C. § 6802(a), (b). “Nonaffiliated third party” is defined as “any entity that is not an affiliate of, or related by common ownership or affiliated by corporate control with, the financial institution, but does not include a joint employee of such institution.” *Id.* § 6809(5). Section 6809(3)(A) of title 15 of the United States Code defines financial institution as “any institution the business of which is engaging in financial activities as described in section 1843(k) of Title 12.” 15 U.S.C. § 6809(3)(A). Section 1843(k)(4)(b) of title 12 defines the following activity as financial in nature: “Insuring, guaranteeing, or indemnifying against loss, harm, damage, illness, disability, or death, or providing and issuing annuities, and acting as principal, agent, or broker for purposes of the foregoing, in any State.” 12 U.S.C. § 1843(k)(4)(B).

Similarly, subchapter A of chapter 22 of the Texas Administrative Code governs the treatment of nonpublic personal financial individuals by covered entities. 28 T.A.C. § 22.1(a); *see id.* § 22.1(b) (providing scope of subchapter A of chapter 22). A covered entity is defined as “[a]n individual or entity who receives an authorization from the Texas Department of Insurance[,]” including an individual or entity to which chapter 82 of the Insurance Code is applicable. *Id.* § 22.2(11) (defining “covered entity”); *see also* Ins. Code § 82.002 (listing types of companies to which chapter 82 of Insurance Code applies). For purposes of subchapter A, “nonpublic personal financial information” includes

- (i) personally identifiable financial information;
- (ii) any list, description or other grouping of consumers (and publicly available information pertaining to them) that is derived using any personally identifiable financial information that is not publicly available; and
- (iii) any list of individuals' names and street addresses that is derived in whole or in part using personally identifiable financial information that is not publicly available, such as account numbers.

22 T.A.C. 22.2(21). Section 22.14 of title 28 of the Texas Administrative Code provides as follows:

(a) Conditions for disclosure. Except as otherwise authorized in this subchapter, a covered entity may not, directly or through any affiliate, disclose any nonpublic personal financial information about a consumer to a nonaffiliated third party unless:

- (1) the covered entity has provided to the consumer an initial notice as required under § 22.8 of this title (relating to Initial Privacy Notice);
- (2) the covered entity has provided to the consumer an opt out notice as required in § 22.11 of this title (relating to Form of Opt Out Notice to Consumers and Opt Out Methods);
- (3) the covered entity has given the consumer a reasonable opportunity, before it discloses the information to the nonaffiliated third party, to opt out of the disclosure; and
- (4) the consumer does not opt out.

28 T.A.C. § 22.14(a). For purposes of section 22.14, a nonaffiliated third party is “[a]n entity that is not an affiliate of, or related to by common ownership or affiliated by corporate control with, the covered entity.” *Id.* § 22.2(20).

TWIA is an association composed of all property insurers authorized to engage in the business of property insurance in Texas, other than insurers prevented by law from writing on a statewide basis coverages available through TWIA. Ins. Code § 2210.051(a); *see id.* §§ 2210.006, .051(b) (to engage in business of insurance in Texas, property insurer must be member of TWIA); *see also* 28 T.A.C. § 5.4001(c)(2)(D). The primary purpose of TWIA is to provide an adequate market for windstorm and hail insurance in Texas seacoast territories. Ins. Code § 2210.001. In addition, you state TWIA is an insurance company. *See id.* §§ 2210.053(a)(1), .203(a); *see also Tex. Windstorm Ins. Ass'n v. Poole*, 255

S.W.3d 775, 777 (Tex. App.—Amarillo 2008, pet. denied) (TWIA has “attributes of a private insurance business while operating under a governmental cloak”). Based on these representations, we agree TWIA is a financial institution for purposes of the GLB Act and a covered entity for purposes of section 22.14. You state the requestor is a non-affiliated third party. See 15 U.S.C. § 6809(5); 28 T.A.C. § 22.2(20).

The information you seek to withhold regarding policy holders under the GLB Act and chapter 22 of title 28 of the Texas Administrative Code includes: name, address, telephone numbers, and other contact information, policy numbers, lenders and loan information, liability limits, coverage amounts, premium information, claim information and other financial information, such as valuations, depreciation, an deductible amounts, and property information, such as inspections, square footage, and layouts. You state this information was provided to TWIA for the purpose of obtaining insurance and is also information resulting from transactions with insureds or services performed for insureds by TWIA, a regulated financial institution. See 15 U.S.C. § 6809(4)(A), 16 C.F.R. § 313.3(o)(1). You state TWIA has not provided opt out notices to the insureds. Because the names and contact information were provided to TWIA by the insureds in order to obtain a service, this information falls under the definition of PIFI. See generally *Individual Reference Servs. Group, Inc. v. Federal Trade Comm’n*, 145 F. Supp. 2d 6, 26-31 (D.D.C. 2001) (discussing language, structure, and history of GLB Act to determine whether certain information meets definition of PIFI). We also find this information consists of nonpublic personal financial information for purposes of section 22.14. Based on your representations and our review, we determine TWIA is prohibited by section 6802(a) and (b) of title 15 of the United States Code and section 22.14(a) of title 28 of the Texas Administrative Code from releasing the insureds’ names and contact information, which we have marked; therefore, TWIA must withhold this information from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the GLB Act. Upon review, however, we find the remaining information at issue does not personally identify claimants. Accordingly, we find you have not established the remaining information constitutes PIFI or nonpublic personal financial information, and TWIA may not withhold it under section 552.101 in conjunction with the GLB Act or section 22.14(a).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. See Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. However, we note this information pertains to individuals who have been

de-identified and whose privacy interests are thus protected. Further, TWIA has failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and a matter of no legitimate public interest. Therefore, no portion of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note some of the remaining information may be protected by copyright law. A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 180 at 3 (1977); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 109 (1975). A custodian of public records also must comply with copyright law, however, and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. *See* ORD 180 at 3. A member of the public who wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit.

In summary, TWIA must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the GLB Act. TWIA must release the remaining information, but any information subject to copyright only may be released in accordance with copyright law.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jennifer Burnett
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JB/tch

Ref: ID# 500193

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)