



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 11, 2013

Ms. Michelle M. Kretz
Assistant City Attorney
City of Fort Worth
1000 Throckmorton Street, 3rd Floor
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2013-17789

Dear Ms. Kretz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 502023 (City PIR No. W027502).

The City of Fort Worth (the "city") received a request for information related to five specified incidents. You state some information was or will be released to the requestor. You further state the city will redact the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers pursuant to Open Records Letter Nos. 2011-15641 (2011) and 2011-15956 (2011), certain motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code, and social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101.

¹Open Records Letter Nos. 2011-15641 and 2011-15956 are previous determinations issued to the city authorizing the city to withhold the originating telephone numbers and addresses, respectively, of 9-1-1 callers furnished to the city by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.218 of the Health and Safety Code, without requesting a decision from this office. See Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under section 552.301(a) of Government Code). Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. See Act of May 6, 2013, 83rd Leg., R.S., S.B. 458, § 1 (to be codified as an amendment to Gov't Code § 552.130(c)). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). See Gov't Code § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147(b).

Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987).

Upon review, we find most of the information you marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, with the exception of the information we have marked for release, the city must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the remaining information you seek to withhold is not highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public concern. Accordingly, none of the remaining information at issue, which we have marked for release, may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.² Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure “information [that] relates to . . . a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.130(a)(1). Upon review, we find the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the information we have marked for release, the city must withhold the information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.³

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

³We note the information being released contains information to which the requestor has a right of access under section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code §§ 552.023, .130; Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987). As previously noted, section 552.130(c) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact information protected by section 552.130(a) without the necessity of requesting a decision under the Act. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Additionally, we note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision under the Act. *See id.* § 552.147(b). Thus, if the city receives another request for this same information from a person who does not have such a right of access, section 552.130(c) and section 552.147(b) authorize the city to redact the requestor’s motor vehicle record information and social security number, respectively, without the necessity of requesting a decision under the Act.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read "Jennifer Burnett", with a horizontal line extending to the right.

Jennifer Burnett
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JB/tch

Ref: ID# 502023

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)