



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

October 21, 2013

Mr. John R. Batoon  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of El Paso  
P.O. Box 1890  
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2013-18293

Dear Mr. Batoon:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 502857.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for all information related to a specified case number. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information other statutes make confidential. Section 58.007 provides in part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e), (j)(2). Juvenile law enforcement records relating to delinquent conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007(c). *See id.* § 51.03(a) (defining "delinquent conduct" for purposes of section 58.007). For purposes of section 58.007(c), child means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age when the conduct occurred. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Upon review, we find the submitted information involves juvenile delinquent conduct occurring after September 1, 1997. Therefore, the information at issue is generally confidential under section 58.007(c). We note, however, the requestor is a parent of the juvenile offender listed in the report. Therefore, the requestor has a right to inspect juvenile law enforcement records concerning his juvenile child pursuant to section 58.007(e) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 58.007(e). Section 58.007(j)(2) provides, however, information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Accordingly, we will address the applicability of other exceptions to disclosure of the information at issue.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law;

(3) the identity of the person who made the report.

*Id.* § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2)-(3). Upon review, we find the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse. *See id.* §§ 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code), 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201 as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). Thus, the information at issue is subject to section 261.201 of the Family Code. We note the requestor is a parent of the child victim at issue and is not alleged to have

committed the suspected abuse. Thus, pursuant to section 261.201(k), the submitted information may not be withheld from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(l)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law must still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2). Accordingly, we will address your remaining claims under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code for the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information relates to an open, pending criminal investigation. Based on your representation and our review, we conclude the release of the submitted information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the submitted information.

However, we note section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov’t Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

We also understand you to claim the basic information is subject to the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is also encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code. Common-law privacy protects information that (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Upon review, we find some of the basic information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. However, as a parent of the minors with the privacy interests, the requestor has a special right of access to information that would ordinarily be withheld to protect the minors’ common-law privacy, and such information cannot be withheld from him on that

basis. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles). Accordingly, the department may not withhold any of the basic information pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of the basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Jennifer Burnett  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

JB/tch

Ref: ID# 502857

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>1</sup>Because the requestor has a special right of access to information being released pursuant to sections 58.007(e) and 261.201(k) of the Family Code, if the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, then the department should again seek a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302; Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001).