



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 24, 2013

Ms. Tiffany N. Leal
Chief Civil Prosecutor
Comal County
150 North Seguin Avenue, Suite 307
New Braunfels, Texas 78130

OR2013-18569

Dear Ms. Leal:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 503654 (Comal County File No. 13-OR-083).

The Comal County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for a copy of all traffic accident reports in Comal County involving serious bodily injury or fatality from January 1, 2003 to the date of the request, and the total amount of donations from Elks organizations to the Department of Public Safety, New Braunfels Police Department, and the sheriff's office from January 1, 2003 to the date of the request.¹ You state the sheriff's office will withhold information pursuant to section 552.147 of the Government Code.² You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note you have not submitted any information relating to donations from Elks organizations to the Department of Public Safety, New Braunfels Police Department, and the

¹We note the sheriff's office sought and received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or over-broad request for public information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

²Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

sheriff's office from January 1, 2003 to the date of the request. Therefore, to the extent information responsive to this aspect of the request exists, we assume you have released it to the requestor. *See* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body concludes that no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible). If you have not released any such information, you must do so at this time. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301(a), .302.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." *Id.* § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065(b) states that except as provided by subsection (c) or subsection (e), accident reports are privileged and confidential. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065. You claim the submitted information is subject to section 550.065 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to accident report forms completed pursuant to chapter 550 or section 601.004 of the Transportation Code. *See id.*; *see also id.* § 550.064 (discussing information required in accident report form). Upon review, we find the submitted information consists of dispatch call records and sheriff's office incident reports, which were not completed pursuant to chapter 550 or section 601.004 of the Transportation Code. Therefore, the submitted information is not subject to section 550.065 of the Transportation Code and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code.³ This section provides in relevant part:

(a) Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

³The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find a portion of the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation of possible child abuse or neglect under chapter 261 of the Family Code, so as to fall within the scope of section 261.201(a). *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201 as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). As you do not indicate the sheriff’s office has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume that no such rule exists. We therefore conclude that this information, which we have marked, is confidential under section 261.201(a). Accordingly, this information must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. We note the purpose of section 552.130 is to protect the privacy interests of individuals. Some of the motor vehicle record information in the remaining information pertains solely to deceased individuals. Because the right of privacy lapses at death, motor vehicle record information that pertains solely to a deceased individual may not be withheld under section 552.130. *See Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex. App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref’d n.r.e.); *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984), H-917 (1976); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981). In addition, the submitted information contains motor vehicle record information pertaining to a vehicle which was being driven by an individual who is now deceased. To the extent a living person owns an interest in this vehicle, the sheriff’s office must withhold the motor vehicle record information pertaining to this vehicle under section 552.130 of the Government Code. To the extent a living individual does not own an interest in the vehicle at issue, this information may not be withheld under section 552.130. In either case, the remaining motor vehicle record information we have

marked pertaining to living individuals or vehicles owned by living individuals must be withheld under section 552.130 of the Government Code.⁴

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code to the extent this information pertains to living persons or vehicles owned by living persons. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/dls

Ref: ID# 503654

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

⁴We note section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(d), (e).