



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

December 11, 2013

Mr. Daniel Ortiz  
Assistant City Attorney  
Office of the City Attorney  
City of El Paso  
P.O. Box 1890  
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2013-21567

Dear Mr. Ortiz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 508067.

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information pertaining to a specified address during a specified period of time. You state you have released some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note you seek to withhold information relating to 9-1-1 callers. In Open Records Letter No. 2003-0708 (2003), this office issued a previous determination that authorizes the department to withhold the originating telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772 of the Health and Safety Code under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 673 at 7-8 (2001) (listing elements of second type of previous determination under Gov't Code § 552.301(a)). Therefore, to the extent the submitted information consists of the telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers that were furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code in accordance with the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2003-0708. To the extent the submitted information does not consist of the telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers that were furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772, the

department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, which reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Portions of the submitted information involve juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision" for purposes of Fam. Code § 58.007). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply to the information at issue. Therefore, the department must withhold the information at issue, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. Upon review, however, we find no portion of the remaining information consists of juvenile law enforcement records for purposes of section 58.007. Therefore, none of the remaining information is confidential pursuant to section 58.007, and the department may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for

purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

*Id.* § 261.201(a). Portions of the remaining information consist of information used or developed in investigations of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect. *See id.* §§ 261.001 (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code), 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code). Accordingly, we find this information, which we have marked, is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. We have no indication the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the information we marked is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code, and the department must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public.<sup>1</sup> *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987).

Generally, only highly intimate information that implicates the privacy of an individual is withheld. However, in certain instances, where it is demonstrated the requestor knows the identity of the individual involved as well as the nature of certain incidents, the entire report must be withheld to protect the individual’s privacy. In this instance, you seek to withhold

---

<sup>1</sup>We note the department failed to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301(e-1) of the Government Code by not providing the requestor with any portion of its arguments under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.301(e-1) (requiring a governmental body that submits written comments to the attorney general to send a copy of those comments to the requestor within fifteen-business-days of receiving the request). Nonetheless, section 552.101 is a mandatory exception that constitutes a compelling reason sufficient to overcome the presumption of openness caused by the failure to comply with section 552.301. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302. Therefore, we will address the department’s assertion of common-law privacy.

the entirety of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, you have not demonstrated, nor does it otherwise appear, this is a situation in which the entirety of the information at issue must be withheld on the basis of common-law privacy. Accordingly, the department may not withhold the entirety of the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. However, upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find the department has failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and a matter of no legitimate public interest. Therefore, no portion of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, to the extent the submitted information consists of the telephone numbers and addresses of 9-1-1 callers that were furnished by a service supplier established in accordance with chapter 772, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 772.318 of the Health and Safety Code in accordance with the previous determination issued to the department in Open Records Letter No. 2003-0708. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with sections 58.007(c) and 261.201(a) of the Family Code and common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

PL/bhf

Mr. Daniel Ortiz - Page 5

Ref: ID# 508067

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)