



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 3, 2014

Ms. Delietrice Henry
Open Records Assistant
Plano Police Department
P.O. Box 860358
Plano, Texas 75086-0358

OR2013-00242

Dear Ms. Henry:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 509810 (ORR No. THOD100313A).

The Plano Police Department (the "department") received a request for police records pertaining to a named individual and calls for service at a specified address during a specified period of time. You state some of the responsive information has been released to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public

records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find that a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

In this instance, the requestor seeks, in part, access to unspecified law enforcement records relating to the named individual. Thus, that portion of the request requires the department to compile the named individual's criminal history and thereby implicates her right to privacy. Accordingly, to the extent the department maintains any information that depicts the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note you have submitted records that do not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not implicate the privacy interest of the named individual and may not be withheld as a compilation of the individual's criminal history under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we will consider your arguments against the disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides:

(a) Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). You assert the information at issue, which we have marked, is confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code. Upon review, we agree the information at issue was used or developed in an investigation of alleged child abuse or neglect under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of Family Code chapter 261); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). We note the information at issue does not relate to the child over whom the requestor has

asserted she has guardianship. The department has not indicated it has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, the information we have marked is confidential under section 261.201 of the Family Code, and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

The department also claims common-law privacy and constitutional privacy for portions of the remaining information. As previously noted, section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information, which we have marked, satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the department has failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and a matter of no legitimate public interest. Therefore, no portion of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy. Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. ORD 455 at 4. The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy" which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the "most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate how any of the remaining information falls within the constitutional zones of privacy or implicates an individual's privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with constitutional privacy.

We note some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception, such as section 552.130, on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). Accordingly, the department must withhold the driver's license information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.²

In summary, to the extent the department maintains any information that depicts the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold (1) the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code; (2) the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; and (3) the driver's license information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Michelle R. Garza
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

MRG/som

²We note section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

Ref: ID# 509810

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)