



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 16, 2014

Mr. William Schultz
Assistant District Attorney
Civil Division
Denton County Criminal District Attorney's Office
P.O. Box 2850
Denton, Texas 76202

OR2014-01035

Dear Mr. Schultz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 511219.

The Denton County Criminal District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for the entire case file for a specified case, including certain specified items. You state the district attorney's office has released some information to the requestor. You indicate the district attorney's office does not have information responsive to a portion of the request.¹ You claim the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.²

¹The Act does not require a governmental body to release information that did not exist when it received a request or to create responsive information. See *Economic Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App. — San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 555 at 1 (1990), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

²We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 261.201 of the Family Code provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law[.]

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l)(2). Upon review, we agree the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse. *See id.* § 261.001(1) (defining “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed

for general purposes). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. We note, and you acknowledge, the requestor is a parent of the child victim listed in the information, and is not alleged to have committed the abuse. Thus, pursuant to section 261.201(k), the information at issue may not be withheld from this requestor under section 552.101 of the Government Code on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). However, section 261.201(l)(2) states any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law must still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(l)(2). Accordingly, we will address your arguments under sections 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code for the submitted information.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code provides in part:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted from [required public disclosure] if:

...

(4) it is information that:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(4). A governmental body must reasonably explain how and why section 552.108 is applicable to the information at issue. *See id.* §§ 552.108, .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). In *Curry v. Walker*, 873 S.W.2d 379 (Tex. 1994), the Texas Supreme Court held a request for a district attorney's "entire litigation file" was "too broad" and, quoting *National Union Fire Insurance Co. v. Valdez*, 863 S.W.2d 458 (Tex. 1993) (orig. proceeding), held "the decision as to what to include in [the file] necessarily reveals the attorney's thought processes concerning the prosecution or defense of the case." *Curry*, 873 S.W.2d at 380. You state the instant request for information encompasses the entire prosecution file of the district attorney's office. Thus, you argue release of the information in Exhibit C would reveal the mental impressions or legal reasoning of prosecutors. Based on your representations and our review, we agree section 552.108(a)(4) is applicable to information in Exhibit C. Accordingly, the district

attorney's office may withhold Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(4) of the Government Code.³

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 560.003 of the Government Code, which provides, "[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act]." Gov't Code § 560.003; *see id.* § 560.001(1) ("biometric identifier" means retina or iris scan, fingerprint, voiceprint, or record of hand or face geometry). There is no indication the requestor has a right of access to the fingerprint in Exhibit D under section 560.002. *See id.* § 560.002(1)(A) (governmental body may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose individual's biometric identifier to another person unless the individual consents to disclosure). Accordingly, the district attorney's office must withhold the fingerprint we have marked in Exhibit D under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.⁴

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license or driver's license issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). Accordingly, the district attorney's office must withhold the driver's license information we have marked in Exhibit D under section 552.130 of the Government Code.⁵

Section 552.147(a) of the Government Code excepts the social security number of a living individual from public disclosure. *Id.* § 552.147(a). In this instance, Exhibit D includes the requestor's social security number. We note section 552.147 is based on privacy principles. *See id.* § 552.023(b) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates, or person's representative, solely on grounds that information is considered confidential by privacy principles). Thus, the requestor's own social security number may not be withheld from her. The district attorney's office may withhold the social security number we have marked in Exhibit D under section 552.147 of the Government Code.⁶

³As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not address your remaining arguments against its disclosure.

⁴We note Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009) is a previous determination authorizing all governmental bodies to redact certain categories of information, including fingerprints under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

⁵We note section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

⁶We note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

In summary, the district attorney's office may withhold the information in Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(4). The district attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked in Exhibit D under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code. The district attorney's office must withhold the information we have marked in Exhibit D under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The district attorney's office may withhold the information we have marked under section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kristi L. Wilkins
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KLW/bhf

Ref: ID# 511219

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)