



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

January 16, 2014

Mr. Donald A. Stricklin  
Assistant District Attorney  
Brazoria County Criminal District Attorney's Office  
111 E. Locust, Suite 408A  
Angleton, Texas 77515

OR2014-01052

Dear Mr. Stricklin:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 511228.

The Clute Police Department (the "department") received a request from an investigator with the Texas Education Agency (the "TEA") for all offense, incident, and investigative reports regarding a named individual, including information pertaining to a specified charge. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find the submitted information was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse; thus, this information falls within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201 as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes), 261.001(1)(E) (definition of “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code includes sexual assault under Penal Code section 22.011). As you do not indicate the department has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, and based on our review, we determine the submitted information is generally confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).*

However, section 261.201 of the Family Code also provides information encompassed by subsection (a) may be disclosed “for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law.” Fam. Code § 261.201(a). As noted above, the requestor is an investigator with the TEA, which has assumed the duties of the State Board for Educator Certification (the “SBEC”).<sup>1</sup> The requestor claims section 22.082 of the Education Code gives the SBEC a right to the requested information and indicates the requested information is related to an SBEC investigation of an individual who has applied for or currently holds educator credentials.<sup>2</sup> Section 22.082 of the Education Code provides the SBEC “may obtain from any law enforcement or criminal justice agency all criminal history record information and all records contained in any closed criminal investigation file that relate to a specific applicant for or holder of a certificate issued under Subchapter B, Chapter 21.” Educ. Code § 22.082. You state the case at issue is closed. Thus, as the submitted information consists of a closed criminal investigation of an applicant for or a holder of a certificate issued under subchapter B, Chapter 21 of the Education Code, we find section 22.082 of the Education Code gives the TEA a statutory right of access to the submitted information in its entirety.

---

<sup>1</sup>The 79th Texas legislature passed House Bill 1116, which required the transfer of SBEC’s administrative functions and services to TEA, effective September 1, 2005.

<sup>2</sup>The requestor also claims a right to the information at issue under sections 261.308 and 261.406 of the Family Code. However, these statutes apply to information held by the Department of Family and Protective Services and not the department. *See Fam. Code §§ 261.308, .406.*

*See id.*; cf. *Brookshire v. Houston Indep. Sch. Dist.*, 508 S.W.2d 675, 678-79 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1974, no writ) (when legislature defines term in one statute and uses same term in relation to same subject matter in latter statute, later use of term is same as previously defined).

However, section 261.201(a) states the release must be “for purposes consistent with the Family Code.” *See* Fam. Code § 261.201(a). This office cannot determine whether release of the submitted information is consistent with the Family Code. Consequently, if the department determines release of the submitted information is not consistent with the Family Code, then the department must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.201(b)-(g), (i), (k) (listing circumstances under which section 261.201 information can be released); Attorney General Opinions DM-353 at 4 n.6 (1995) (finding interagency transfer of information prohibited where confidentiality statute enumerates specific entities to which release of information is authorized and where potential receiving governmental body is not among statute’s enumerated entities), JM-590 at 4-5 (1986). If the department determines release of the submitted information is consistent with the Family Code, then section 261.201 does not prohibit the release of the submitted information to the requestor in this case. *Id.* Although you also claim the submitted information is excepted under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and section 552.108 of the Government Code, a specific statutory right of access to information prevails over the common-law and general exceptions to disclosure under the Act. *Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W. 3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). Therefore, the department may not withhold the submitted information pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy or section 552.108. Nevertheless, in that situation, we must consider whether the submitted information is otherwise excepted from disclosure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by federal law, such as section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code. Section 1324a governs I-9 forms and their related documents. This section provides an I-9 form and “any information contained in or appended to such form, may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter” and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). Release of the submitted I-9 form in this instance would be “for purposes other than enforcement” of the referenced federal statutes. Section 1324a, as a federal law, preempts any conflicting state provisions, including section 22.082 of the Education Code. *See Equal Employment Opportunity Comm’n v. City of Orange, Texas*, 905 F. Supp. 381, 382 (E.D.

Tex. 1995) (federal law prevails over inconsistent provision of state law). Accordingly, we conclude the submitted I-9 form and its attachments, which we have marked, are confidential pursuant to section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code. Prior decisions of this office have held section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code renders federal tax return information confidential. *See* Attorney General Opinion H-1274 (1978) (tax returns); Open Records Decision No. 600 (1992) (W-4 forms). Section 6103(b) defines the term "return information" as "a taxpayer's identity, the nature, source, or amount of his income, payments, receipts, deductions, exemptions, credits, assets, liabilities, net worth, tax liability, tax withheld, deficiencies, overassessments, or tax payments . . . or any other data, received by, recorded by, prepared by, furnished to, or collected by the Secretary [of the Treasury] with respect to a return or with respect to the determination of the existence, or possible existence, of liability . . . for any tax, penalty, interest, fine, forfeiture, or other imposition, or offense[.]" *See* 26 U.S.C. § 6103(b)(2)(A). Federal courts have construed the term "return information" expansively to include any information gathered by the Internal Revenue Service regarding a taxpayer's liability under title 26 of the United States Code. *See Mallas v. Kolak*, 721 F. Supp. 748, 754 (M.D.N.C. 1989), *aff'd in part*, 993 F.2d 1111 (4th Cir. 1993). As noted above, section 6103(a), as a federal law, preempts any conflicting state provisions, including section 22.082 of the Education Code. *See Equal Employment Opportunity Comm'n v. City of Orange, Texas*, 905 F. Supp. at 382 (E.D. Tex. 1995). Thus, the submitted W-4 form, which we have marked, constitutes tax return information that is confidential under section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code.

We note the remaining information contains information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code, which provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.<sup>3</sup> Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1). Upon review, we find the driver's license information we have marked is generally confidential under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Because the remaining information includes confidential information under section 552.130 of the Government Code, we must consider whether the requestor in this case, as a TEA investigator, may nevertheless obtain the information at issue. Because section 22.082 of the Education Code authorizes the requestor to obtain information in its entirety, while section 552.130 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure portions of the remaining

---

<sup>3</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision No. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

information, we find section 22.082 is in conflict with section 552.130 of the Government Code. Where information falls within both a general and specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. *See Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) (“more specific statute controls over the more general”); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones); Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986). Although section 22.082 of the Education Code generally allows a TEA investigator access to files of a closed criminal investigation, section 552.130 of the Government Code specifically protects motor vehicle record information. This section specifically permits release to certain parties and in circumstances that do not include the TEA representative’s request in this instance. We therefore conclude, notwithstanding section 22.082, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

We note some of the remaining information may be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. Open Records Decision No. 180 at 3 (1977). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception applies to the information. *Id.*; *see* Open Records Decision No. 109 (1975). If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit.

In summary, if the department determines the release of the submitted information at issue is not consistent with the Family Code, then the submitted information must be withheld from the requestor in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. If the department determines the release of information is consistent with the Family Code, then the department must withhold the I-9 form and its attachments, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code, the W-4 form we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code, and the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code and must release the remaining information to this requestor pursuant to section 22.082 of the Education Code; however, any information subject to copyright may be released only in accordance with copyright law.<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>4</sup>Because this requestor may have a special right of access to some of the submitted information, the department must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for this same information from another requestor.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



David L. Wheelus  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

DLW/akg

Ref: ID# 511228

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)