ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

January 23, 2014

Mr. Michael B. Gary
Chief Legal Officer
Harris County Appraisal District
P.O. Box 920975
Houston, Texas 77292-0975

OR2014-01441

Dear Mr. Gary:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 512211 (ORR# 13-2609).

The Harris County Appraisal District (the "district") received a request for a specified iFile number. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.136 of the Government Code.[1] We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the requestor seeks only the specified iFile number. You have submitted a document that contains information beyond this specific piece of information. Thus, the portions of the submitted document that do not consist of the information requested are not responsive to the present request. This ruling does not address the public availability of any information that is not responsive to the request and the district is not required to release that information in response to the request.

Next, we note, and you acknowledge, the district has not complied with the time periods prescribed by section 552.301 of the Government Code in seeking an open records decision

[1]Although you also raise section 552.149 of the Government Code, you have not provided any arguments to support this exception. Therefore, we assume you have withdrawn your claim this section applies to the submitted information. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301. When a governmental body fails to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301, the information at issue is presumed public and must be released unless there is a compelling reason to withhold it. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason may exist to withhold information when the information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third party interests. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Because sections 552.101 and 552.136 of the Government Code can provide compelling reasons to overcome this presumption, we will address the applicability of these exceptions to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 22.27 of the Tax Code, which states in pertinent part:

> (a) Rendition statements, real and personal property reports, attachments to those statements and reports, and other information the owner of property provides to the appraisal office in connection with the appraisal of the property, including income and expense information related to a property filed with an appraisal office and information voluntarily disclosed to an appraisal office or the comptroller about real or personal property sales prices after a promise it will be held confidential, are confidential and not open to public inspection. The statements and reports and the information they contain about specific real or personal property or a specific real or personal property owner and information voluntarily disclosed to an appraisal office about real or personal property sales prices after a promise it will be held confidential may not be disclosed to anyone other than an employee of the appraisal office who appraises property except as authorized by Subsection (b) of this section.

Tax Code § 22.27(a). You argue the responsive information is confidential under section 22.27(a). However, we note the responsive information is included within a Notice of Appraised Value that was not provided by property owners. Thus, we find because the responsive information was not provided by property owners, the information is not confidential under section 22.27(a) of the Tax Code and may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. Accordingly, we will consider your argument under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code states "[n]otwithstanding any other provision of this chapter, a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential." Gov't Code § 552.136(b). Section 552.136(a) defines "access device" as "a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to . . . obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value [or] initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument." *Id.* § 552.136(a). You represent the responsive iFile number can be used to access confidential property information that is valuable to property owners and third party professionals involved in the protests of property tax appraisals. Based on your representations and our review, we agree the iFile number at issue is an access device number for purposes of section 552.136(a). Accordingly, the district must generally withhold the iFile number, which you have marked, under section 552.136(b) of the Government Code.

We note section 552.136 protects personal privacy. In this instance, you state the requestor may be the individual whose access device number is at issue. The owner of the access device number has a right of access to her own access device number under section 552.023 of the Government Code and it may not be withheld under section 552.136. *See id.* § 552.023(a) (governmental body may not deny access to person to whom information relates or person's agent on ground that information is considered confidential by privacy principles); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Accordingly, if the requestor is not the individual whose access device number is at issue, the district must withhold the iFile number you marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.[2] However, if the requestor is the individual whose access device number is at issue, the district must release the iFile number you marked to her.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/

---

[2]Section 552.136(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.136(b) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.136(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.136(e). *See id.* § 552.136(d), (e).

orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

Claire Morris Sloan

Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 512211

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)