



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 5, 2014

Mr. Daniel Ortiz
Assistant City Attorney
City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2014-02242

Dear Mr. Ortiz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 513416 (Ref. No. 13-1026-3776).

The City of El Paso (the "city") received a request for information relating to a specified incident. You state the city has released some of the submitted information. You state the city has redacted information pursuant to sections 552.130(c) and 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You claim the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains a CR-3 accident report form completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) states that, except as provided by subsection (c) or subsection (e), accident reports are privileged and confidential. *See id.* § 550.065(b).

¹We note section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) the date of the accident; (2) the name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) the specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, the Texas Department of Transportation or another governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides the agency with two or more of the items of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In this instance, the requestor has provided the city with at least two of the specified items of information. Although you seek to withhold the submitted CR-3 accident report form under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law and section 552.108 of the Government Code, statutes governing the release of specific information prevail over the general exceptions to disclosure in the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provision overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). Furthermore, when a statute directly conflicts with a common-law principle or claim, the statutory provision controls and preempts common-law. *See Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common-law only when the statute directly conflicts with common law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Accordingly, we need not consider the applicability of common-law privacy or section 552.108 and the city may not withhold the CR-3 accident report based on either claim. However, you also raise section 552.101 in conjunction with constitutional privacy for the CR-3 accident report. Under the Supremacy Clause of the United States Constitution, the United States Constitution and duly-enacted federal statutes are “the supreme law of the Land,” and states have a responsibility to enforce federal law. *See* U.S. Const., art. VI, cl. 2; *Howlett v. Rose*, 496 U.S. 356, 367-69 (1990). As a federal law, constitutional privacy preempts any conflicting state provisions, including section 550.065 of the Transportation Code. *See Equal Employment Opportunity Comm’n v. City of Orange, Tex.*, 905 F. Supp. 381, 382 (E.D. Tex. 1995) (federal law prevails over inconsistent provision of state law). Thus, we will address your argument under section 552.101 in conjunction with constitutional privacy for the CR-3 accident report.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the remaining information relates to a concluded case that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on your representation, we conclude section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information at issue.

Section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information made public by *Houston Chronicle*). We note basic information does not include information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. Thus, with the exception of basic information, the city may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

We understand you to claim the basic information is subject to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law. Section 552.101 excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law. Common-law privacy protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Upon review, you have failed to demonstrate any portion of the basic information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Thus, no portion of the basic information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We understand you to also claim the basic information and the CR-3 accident report is subject to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy. Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy, which consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual’s interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. Open Records Decision No. 455 at 4 (1987). The first type protects an individual’s autonomy within “zones of privacy” which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual’s privacy interests and the public’s need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the “most intimate aspects of human affairs.” *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). After review of the basic information and the CR-3 accident report, we find you have failed to demonstrate how any portion of the information at issue falls within the zones of privacy or implicates an individual’s privacy interests for purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, the city may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 on the basis of constitutional privacy.

In summary, the city must release the submitted CR-3 accident report form to this requestor in its entirety pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the city may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



David L. Wheelus
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DLW/akg

Ref: ID# 513416

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)