



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

February 25, 2014

Ms. Rachel L. Lindsay
Counsel for the City of McKinney
Brown & Hofmeister, L.L.P.
740 East Campbell Road, Suite 800
Richardson, Texas 75081

OR2014-03456

Dear Ms. Lindsay:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 514990.

The McKinney Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for arrest records of a named individual, including a specified arrest. You state you have released some information. You claim the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and

local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted that individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person does not implicate the privacy interest of the individual and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis.

The present request, in part, seeks any arrest reports pertaining to the named individual. This portion of the request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individual named in the request, thus implicating the named individual's right to privacy. Thus, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must generally withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

However, we note the requestor may have a right of access to some of the information at issue. Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides, "[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] any criminal history record information ["CHRI"] maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] about a person." *See* Gov't Code § 411.089(a). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides in pertinent part:

(a) [a] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] [CHRI] maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state [CHRI] maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). We note CHRI is defined as "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *See id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, in this instance, the requested information, to the extent it exists, may contain CHRI. However, a criminal justice agency that receives CHRI from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of CHRI). Thus, to the extent the requestor in this instance is a representative of a "criminal justice agency," she is authorized to obtain CHRI from the department pursuant

to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, but only for a criminal justice purpose. See Gov't Code §§ 411.083(c), .087(a)(2).

A "criminal justice agency" is defined in part as "a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice." *Id.* § 411.082(3)(A). "Administration of criminal justice" has the meaning assigned to it by article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. See *id.* § 411.082(1). Article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure defines "administration of criminal justice" as the "performance of any of the following activities: detection, apprehension, pretrial release, post-trial release, prosecution, adjudication, correctional supervision, or rehabilitation of an offender. The term includes criminal identification activities and the collection, storage, and dissemination of [CHRI]." Code Crim. Proc. art. 60.01(1).

In this instance, the requestor is a representative of the Probation and Pretrial Services Office of the United States District Court for the Eastern District of Texas. Although it appears the requestor is engaged in the administration of criminal justice, we cannot determine whether she intends to use the CHRI for a criminal justice purpose. Consequently, if the department determines the requestor intends to use the CHRI for a criminal justice purpose, then the department must make available to the requestor CHRI that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions, to the extent any such information exists. See *Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 515 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common-law only when statute directly conflicts with common-law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common-law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law); Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in the Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). In that instance, the department must withhold any remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. If the department determines the requestor does not seek this information for a criminal justice purpose, then to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such records in their entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/bhf

Ref: ID# 514990

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)