



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

March 27, 2014

Ms. Elizabeth Hanshaw Winn
Assistant County Attorney
Travis County
P.O. Box 1748
Austin, Texas 78767

OR2014-05102

Dear Ms. Winn:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 519306.

The Travis County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining to the requestor's client, including a specified incident. The sheriff's office claims the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the claimed exceptions and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information made confidential by other statutes, including section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides in relevant part as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act] and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers

used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(k) Notwithstanding Subsection (a), an investigating agency, other than the [Texas Department of Family and Protective Services] or the Texas Youth Commission, on request, shall provide to the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child who is the subject of reported abuse or neglect, or to the child if the child is at least 18 years of age, information concerning the reported abuse or neglect that would otherwise be confidential under this section. The investigating agency shall withhold information under this subsection if the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of the child requesting the information is alleged to have committed the abuse or neglect.

(l) Before a child or a parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative of a child may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (k), the custodian of the record or file must redact:

(1) any personally identifiable information about a victim or witness under 18 years of age unless that victim or witness is:

(A) the child who is the subject of the report; or

(B) another child of the parent, managing conservator, or other legal representative requesting the information;

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under [the Act], or other law; and

(3) the identity of the person who made the report.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (k), (l). You assert arrest report number 09-2742 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201), 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of section 261.201). Upon review, we find this information is within the scope of section 261.201(a). However, the requestor represents one of the child victims at issue in this report, who is now an adult. Thus, the sheriff’s office may not withhold this report from the requestor on the basis of section 261.201(a). *See id.* § 261.201(k). Section 261.201(l)(1) states the identity of any other child victim or witness must be redacted before a governmental body releases information under section 261.201(l). *Id.* § 261.201(l)(1). Therefore, the sheriff’s office must withhold the identifying information of the other child victim in this report under

section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(1). In addition, section 261.201(1)(2) provides any information that is excepted from required disclosure under the Act or other law may still be withheld from disclosure. *Id.* § 261.201(1)(2). Therefore, we will consider whether the remaining information in this report is otherwise excepted from release under the Act.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Generally, only highly intimate information that implicates the privacy of an individual is withheld. However, in certain instances, where it is demonstrated the requestor knows the identity of the individual involved, as well as the nature of certain incidents, the entire report must be withheld to protect the individual's privacy. In addition, a compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

You argue arrest report number 10-8273 must be withheld in its entirety on the basis of common-law privacy. However, you have not demonstrated, nor does it otherwise appear, this is a situation in which the entirety of the submitted information must be withheld on the basis of common-law privacy. Thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold this information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. Nevertheless, we find some of the information in this report satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we conclude the remaining information at issue is not confidential under common-law privacy, and the sheriff's office may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground.

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). Generally, a governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.*

§§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state arrest report number 13-13368 relates to a pending criminal prosecution. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. Thus, with the exception of the basic front-page offense and arrest information, the sheriff's office may withhold arrest report number 13-13368 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Some of the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ Section 552.130(a) provides the following:

Information is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if the information relates to:

- (1) a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit issued by an agency of this state or another state or country;
- (2) a motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country; or
- (3) a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country or a local agency authorized to issue an identification document.

Gov't Code § 552.130(a). The sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.²

To conclude, the sheriff's office must withhold the identifying information of the child victim other than the requestor's client in arrest report number 09-2742 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(1)(1) of the

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 at 2 (1987), 480 at 5 (1987).*

²We note section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See Gov't Code § 552.130(c).* If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

Family Code. The sheriff's office must also withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy and under section 552.130 of the Government Code. With the exception of the basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold arrest report number 13-13368 under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must release the remaining information.³

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,


James L. Coggeshall
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JLC/tch

Ref: ID# 519306

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³The requestor has a right of access to information to some of the information being released. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Thus, the sheriff's office must again seek a decision from this office if it receives another request for the same information from another requestor. We also note the submitted information contains a social security number. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).