



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

April 4, 2014

Ms. Lysia H. Bowling  
City Attorney  
Office of the City Attorney  
City of San Angelo  
72 West College Avenue  
San Angelo, Texas 76903

OR2014-05605

Dear Ms. Bowling:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 518736.

The San Angelo Police Department (the "department") received a request for the criminal records of two named individuals. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the department's procedural obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code when requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body must submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. Gov't Code § 552.301(e). The department received the request for information on January 14, 2014. You inform us January 20, 2014 was a holiday. This office does not count the date the request was received or holidays as business days for purposes of calculating a governmental body's deadlines under the Act. Accordingly, you were required to provide the information required by subsection 552.301(e) by February 5, 2014. However, you submitted the required information in an envelope

postmarked February 6, 2014. *See id.* § 552.308(a)(1) (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Accordingly, we conclude the department failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless a compelling reason exists to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). The department claims section 552.101 of the Government Code for the submitted information. Furthermore, we note some of the submitted information is subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> Because these sections provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will address the applicability of these sections to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. Upon review, we find the present request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individuals. Accordingly, we find the request implicates the named individuals' rights to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting either of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision No. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

department must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. We note, however, you have submitted reports which do not list the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants. This information does not constitute criminal history compilations protected by common-law privacy and may not be withheld on that basis under section 552.101.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* at 10-12. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) of the Government Code authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for criminal justice purposes. *See id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Upon review, we find you have failed to demonstrate any of the submitted information constitutes confidential CHRI. Thus, no portion of the submitted information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code, which states that except as provided by subsection (c) or subsection (e), accident reports are privileged and confidential. *See* Transp. Code § 550.065. Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) date of the accident; (2) name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). We note the requestor has not provided the department with two of the three requisite pieces of information specified by the statute. Accordingly, the department must withhold the CR-3 crash report form we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code.

We note the remaining information contains information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit or motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). Accordingly, we find the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup>We note section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

In summary, to the extent the department maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individuals as suspects, arrestees, or criminal defendants, the department must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the CR-3 crash report form we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.<sup>3</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lana L. Freeman  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

LLF/bhf

Ref: ID# 518736

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>3</sup>We note the information being released includes social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. See Gov't Code § 552.147(b).