



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 12, 2014

Ms. Amy L. Sims
Assistant City Attorney
City of Lubbock
P.O. Box 2000
Lubbock, Texas 79408-2000

OR2014-07977

Dear Ms. Sims:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 522144.

The Lubbock Police Department (the "department") received a request for information regarding a named individual. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation. Id.* at 683.

The doctrine of common-law privacy protects a compilation of an individual's criminal history, which is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm.*

for Freedom of the Press, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

You claim the present request requires the department to compile the named individual's criminal history and implicates the named individual's right to privacy. However, we note the requestor is a recruiter for the United States Army (the "Army"), the named individual is a potential enlistee in the Army, and the named individual provided the Army with a signed authorization for the release of the information at issue. Therefore, the requestor is acting as the authorized representative of the named individual and has a right of access pertaining to the named individual pursuant to section 552.023 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself). Accordingly, the department may not withhold any portion of the submitted information as a criminal history compilation under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by section 58.007 of the Family Code, which reads, in part, as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

...

(e) Law enforcement records and files concerning a child may be inspected or copied by a juvenile justice agency as that term is defined by

Section 58.101, a criminal justice agency as that term is defined by Section 411.082, Government Code, the child, and the child's parent or guardian.

...

(j) Before a child or a child's parent or guardian may inspect or copy a record or file concerning the child under Subsection (e), the custodian of the record or file shall redact:

...

(2) any information that is excepted from required disclosure under Chapter 552, Government Code, or other law.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c), (e), (j)(2). Section 58.007(c) is applicable to law enforcement records of juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03(a)-(b) (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision" for purposes of section 58.007). For purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). We find the submitted information involves allegations of juvenile delinquent conduct that occurred after September 1, 1997. Thus, this information is subject to section 58.007. As previously noted, however, the requestor is acting as the authorized representative of the juvenile suspect. Under section 58.007(e), the juvenile may inspect law enforcement records concerning himself. *Id.* § 58.007(e). Accordingly, the requestor has a right to inspect juvenile law enforcement records concerning this individual. However, we note section 58.007(j) also provides that information subject to any other exception to disclosure under the Act or other law must be redacted. *See id.* § 58.007(j)(2). Thus, pursuant to section 58.007(j)(2), we must consider whether the submitted information is otherwise excepted under the Act.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with [the Family Code] and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Id. § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find the submitted information consists of information used or developed in an investigation of alleged child abuse or neglect under chapter 261. Accordingly, we find the submitted information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of Family Code ch. 261); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of this section as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). You do not indicate the department has adopted a rule governing the release of this type of information; therefore, we assume that no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we find the submitted information is generally confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code.

As previously noted, the requestor is a recruiter for the Army, and the individual named in the requested information is a potential enlistee in the Army. The United States Department of Defense (the “DoD”) is authorized to perform background investigations of persons seeking to enlist to determine the eligibility of applicants for acceptance into armed services. *See* 5 U.S.C. § 9101(b)(1)(C); *see also id.* § 9101(a)(6)(A) (DoD is a covered agency for purposes of section 9101). The Army has a right to the criminal history record information (“CHRI”) of state and local criminal justice agencies when its investigation is conducted with the consent of the individual being investigated. *See id.* § 9101(b)(1), (c); *see also* 10 U.S.C. § 111(b)(6) (DoD includes the Department of the Army). CHRI is defined as “information collected by criminal justice agencies on individuals consisting of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, indictments, informations, or other formal criminal charges, and any disposition arising therefrom, sentencing, correction supervision and release” but does not include “identification information such as fingerprint records to the extent that such information does not indicate involvement in the criminal justice system” or “records of a State or locality sealed pursuant to law from access by State and local criminal justice agencies of that State or locality.” 5 U.S.C. § 9101(a)(2).

Federal law provides the Army’s right of access to CHRI preempts state confidentiality provisions. *Id.* § 9101(b)(4) (section 9101 “shall apply notwithstanding any other provision of law . . . of any State”). We conclude the Army’s right of access under federal law preempts the state confidentiality provision of section 261.201 of the Family Code and your claim under section 552.108 of the Government Code. *See English v. General Elec. Co.*, 496 U.S. 72, 79 (1990) (noting state law is preempted to extent it actually conflicts with federal law); *see also La. Pub. Serv. Comm’n v. FCC*, 476 U.S. 355, 369 (1986) (noting federal agency acting within scope of its congressionally delegated authority may preempt state regulation). However, federal law also provides the Army’s right of access is contingent on receiving written consent from the individual under investigation for the release of such

CHRI. *See* 5 U.S.C. § 9101(c). In this instance, because the individual at issue has given the Army written consent for the release of the information at issue, the department must release CHRI from the submitted information to this requestor and withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code.¹

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kristi L. Wilkins
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KLW/tch

Ref: ID# 522144

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

¹We note the requestor has a special right of access to the information being released. Because such information may be confidential with respect to the general public, if the department receives another request for this information from a different requestor, the department must again seek a ruling from this office.