



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

May 30, 2014

Ms. Ashley D. Dierker
Counsel for the City of Crowley
Taylor Olson Adkins Sralla Elam, L.L.P.
6000 Western Place, Suite 200
Fort Worth, Texas 76107-4654

OR2014-09298

Dear Ms. Dierker:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 524430.

The City of Crowley (the "city"), which you represent, received a request for six categories of information relating to a named individual. You state you will withhold certain information pursuant to Open Records Letter No. 684 (2009), motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code, and social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You claim the remaining requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.102, and 552.117 of the Government Code.² We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

¹Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain categories of information, including W-4 forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 6103(a) of title 26 of the United States Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision. Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in section 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e). Section 552.147(b) authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *Id.* § 552.147(b).

²Although you do not raise section 552.117 of the Government Code, we understand you to raise this exception based on your markings.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the Medical Practice Act (the “MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code. The MPA provides in relevant part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient’s behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004; Open Records Decision No. 598 (1991). This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that were created by a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. Therefore, this information is confidential under the MPA and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate any portion of the remaining information consists of a physician-patient communication or a record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that was created or is maintained by a physician. Therefore, no portion of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with the MPA.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial*

Foundation. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has also found that personal financial information not relating to the financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992) (public employee's withholding allowance certificate, designation of beneficiary of employee's retirement benefits, direct deposit authorization, and employee's decisions regarding voluntary benefits programs, among others, protected under common-law privacy); 523 (1989) (common-law privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information); 545 (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history). Upon review, we find a portion of the information, which we have marked, satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the city must withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate how the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate concern to the public. Accordingly, none of the remaining information at issue may be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy[.]" Gov't Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we find the information we have marked must be withheld under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(1). Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Thus, information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) only on behalf of a current or former official or employee who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. Therefore, the city must withhold the information you have marked, as well as the information we have marked, under section 552.117(a)(1) if the employees at issue made timely elections to keep the information confidential; however, the city may only withhold the cellular telephone numbers marked under section 552.117(a)(1) if the cellular telephone service was not provided to the employees at issue at public expense.

In summary, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. Lastly, the city must withhold the information you have marked, as well as the information we have marked, under section 552.117(a)(1) if the employees at issue made timely elections to keep the information confidential under section 552.024; however, the city may only withhold the cellular telephone numbers marked under section 552.117(a)(1) if the cellular telephone service was not provided to the employees at issue at public expense.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cristian Rosas-Grillet
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CRG/dls

Ref: ID# 524430

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)