



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 4, 2014

Ms. M. Ann Montgomery-Moran
Assistant Ellis County and District Attorney
Ellis County and District Attorney's Office
109 South Jackson
Waxahachie, Texas 75165

OR2014-09531

Dear Ms. Montgomery-Moran:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 524723.

The Ellis County and District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for information pertaining to a specified incident. We understand the district attorney's office will withhold social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note some of the submitted information consists of grand jury subpoenas and information obtained pursuant to grand jury subpoenas. The judiciary is expressly excluded from the requirements of the Act. Gov't Code § 552.003(1)(B). This office has determined for purposes of the Act, a grand jury is a part of the judiciary and therefore not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 411 (1984). Further, records kept by a governmental body that is acting as an agent for a grand jury are considered records in the constructive possession of the grand jury, and are also not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decisions Nos. 513 (1988), 411, 398 (1983). Thus, to the extent the records at issue are in the custody of the district attorney's office as an agent for the grand jury, these records are in the grand jury's constructive possession and are not subject to the Act. However, to the extent this information is not in the custody of the district attorney's office as an agent for the grand jury, we will address your exceptions to disclosure for this information.

¹Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to withhold a living person's social security number without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

Next, we note the submitted information includes court-filed documents. Section 552.022(a)(17) of the Government Code provides for required public disclosure of "information that is also contained in a public court record[.]" unless the information is expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(17). Although the district attorney's office raises section 552.108 of the Government Code for the court-filed documents, that section is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the district attorney's office may not withhold the court-filed documents under section 552.108. However, as sections 552.101 and 552.130 can make information confidential for purposes of section 552.022, we will consider the applicability of those exceptions to the information subject to section 552.022. Further, we will address the district attorney's office's arguments against disclosure of the remaining information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, which reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), "child" means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). The information at issue involves juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining "delinquent conduct" and "conduct indicating a need for supervision" for purposes of Fam. Code § 58.007). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply.

Therefore, the submitted information is generally confidential pursuant to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

We note, however, the submitted information contains a CR-3 accident report completed pursuant to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. *See* Transp. Code § 550.064 (officer's accident report). Section 550.065(b) states, except as provided by subsection (c) or (e), accident reports are privileged and for the confidential use of certain specified entities. *Id.* § 550.065(b). Section 550.065(c)(4) provides for the release of accident reports to a person who provides two of the following three pieces of information: (1) the date of the accident; (2) the name of any person involved in the accident; and (3) the specific location of the accident. *Id.* § 550.065(c)(4). Under this provision, a governmental entity is required to release a copy of an accident report to a person who provides two or more pieces of information specified by the statute. *Id.* In this instance, the requestor has provided the district attorney's office with two of the requisite pieces of information specified by the statute.

Although the submitted information is generally confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, section 550.065(c)(4) requires the accident report to be released to the requestor because he supplied the required information. Therefore, there is a conflict between the provisions of section 58.007 of the Family Code and section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code. Where general and specific statutes are in irreconcilable conflict, the specific provision typically prevails as an exception to the general provision unless the general provision was enacted later and there is clear evidence the legislature intended the general provision to prevail. *See* Gov't Code § 311.026(b); *City of Lake Dallas v. Lake Cities Mun. Util. Auth.*, 555 S.W.2d 163, 168 (Tex. Civ. App.—Fort Worth 1977, writ ref'd n.r.e.). In this instance, although section 58.007(c) generally pertains to all juvenile law enforcement records, section 550.065(c)(4) specifically pertains to accident reports. Therefore, in this instance, section 550.065 governs the release of the submitted accident report.

Although you seek to withhold the accident report under section 552.108 of the Government Code, statutes governing the release of specific information prevail over the general exceptions to disclosure found in the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). Accordingly, the accident report may not be withheld under section 552.108. You also assert portions of the accident report are confidential under section 552.130 of the Government Code. Section 552.130 excepts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title, or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or county. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). As noted above, a statutory right of access generally prevails over the Act's general exceptions to disclosure. *See* ORDs 613 at 4, 451. However, because section 552.130 has its own access provisions, we conclude section 552.130 is not a general exception under the Act. Thus, we must address the conflict between the access provided under section 550.065 of the

Transportation Code and the confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Where information falls within both a general and a specific provision of law, the specific provision prevails over the general. See *Horizon/CMS Healthcare Corp. v. Auld*, 34 S.W.3d 887, 901 (Tex. 2000) (“more specific statute controls over the more general”); *Cuellar v. State*, 521 S.W.2d 277 (Tex. Crim. App. 1975) (under well-established rule of statutory construction, specific statutory provisions prevail over general ones); Open Records Decision Nos. 598 (1991), 583 (1990), 451. As mentioned above, section 550.065 specifically provides access only to accident reports of the type at issue, while section 552.130 generally excepts motor vehicle record information maintained in any context. Thus, we conclude the access to accident reports provided under section 550.065 is more specific than the general confidentiality provided under section 552.130. Accordingly, the district attorney’s office may not withhold any portion of the accident report under section 552.130. Therefore, the district attorney’s office must release the CR-3 accident report in its entirety to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c)(4).

In summary, to the extent the grand jury subpoenas and information obtained pursuant to the grand jury subpoenas are in the custody of the district attorney’s office as an agent for the grand jury, these records are in the grand jury’s constructive possession and are not subject to the Act. The district attorney’s office must release the submitted CR-3 accident report under section 550.065(c)(4) of the Transportation Code. The district attorney’s office must withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kristi L. Wilkins
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KLW/tch

Ref: ID# 524723

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)