



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 17, 2014

Ms. Margo Kaiser
Staff Attorney
Texas Workforce Commission
101 East 15th Street
Austin, Texas 78778-0001

OR2014-10458

Dear Ms. Kaiser:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 526429 (TWC Tracking No. 140326-013).

The Texas Workforce Commission (the "commission") received a request for the entire case file pertaining to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.116 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we must address the commission's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. Pursuant to section 552.301(b) of the Government Code, a governmental body must ask for the attorney general's decision and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days after receiving the request. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body must submit to this office within fifteen business

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

days of receiving an open records request (1) written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See id.* § 552.301(e). You state the commission received the instant request on March 26, 2014. Therefore, we find the commission's ten-business-day deadline under section 552.301(b) was April 9, 2014, and the commission's fifteen-business-day deadline under section 552.301(e) was April 16, 2014. However, the you did not request a ruling until April 10, 2014 and you did not submit the information required by section 552.301(e) until April 17, 2014. Consequently, we find the commission failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless a compelling reason exists to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Although you assert the submitted records are excepted under sections 552.108 and 552.116 of the Government Code, these sections are discretionary in nature. They serve only to protect a governmental body's interests, and may be waived; as such, they do not constitute compelling reasons to withhold information for purposes of section 552.302. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Thus, the submitted information may not be withheld under sections 552.108 and 552.116 of the Government Code. However, because section 552.101 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to withhold information, we will consider the applicability of this exception to the submitted information.

Section 3616 of title 42 of the United States Code authorizes the commission to utilize the services of state and local fair housing agencies to assist in meeting its statutory mandate to enforce laws prohibiting discrimination. *See* 42 U.S.C. § 3616. You state that, pursuant to this authorization, the commission's Civil Rights Division ("CRD") is currently operating under a cooperative agreement with the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development ("HUD") in the investigation and resolution of complaints of housing discrimination. Section 301.036 of the Property Code details that CRD shall receive, investigate, seek to conciliate, and act on complaints alleging violations of the Texas Fair

Housing Act. *See* Prop. Code § 301.036. Then, upon the filing of a complaint, both federal and state law mirror each other in language and encourage conciliation to the extent feasible. *See* 42 U.S.C. § 3610(b) (providing that during period beginning with filing of complaint and ending with filing of charge or dismissal, the commission shall engage in conciliation, to the extent feasible); Prop. Code § 301.085 (providing that commission shall, during period beginning with filing of a complaint and ending with filing of charge or dismissal by commission, to the extent feasible, engage in conciliation with respect to complaint).

You state the submitted information relates to a discrimination complaint filed with the commission under its cooperative agreement. You claim the information you have marked is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with both federal and state law. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Section 552.101 encompasses section 3610 of title 42 of the United States Code, which provides:

(d) Prohibitions and requirements with respect to disclosure of information

(1) Nothing said or done in the course of conciliation under this subchapter may be made public or used as evidence in a subsequent proceeding under this subchapter without the written consent of the persons concerned.

42 U.S.C. § 3610(d)(1). You argue the information you have marked is excepted from disclosure because the CRD’s efforts at conciliation are confidential under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 3610(d)(1) of title 42 of the United States Code. We note, however, that section 3610(d)(1) does not protect “conciliation efforts;” it protects things “said or done in the course of conciliation[.]” *Id.* Upon review, we find the information you have marked does not consist of things said or done in the course of a conciliation. Accordingly, we find the commission may not withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 3610(d)(1) of title 42 of the United States Code.

Section 552.101 also encompasses section 301.085(e) of the Property Code, which provides:

Statements made or actions taken in the conciliation may not be made public or used as evidence in a subsequent proceeding under this chapter without the written consent of the persons concerned.

Prop. Code § 301.085(e). You also state the information you have marked is excepted from disclosure because the CRD’s efforts at conciliation are confidential under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 301.085(e) of the Property Code. We note, however, section 301.085(e) does not protect “conciliation efforts;” it protects “[s]tatements made or

actions taken in the conciliation[.]” *Id.* Upon review, we find the information you have marked does not consist of statements made or actions taken in a conciliation. Accordingly, we find the commission may not withhold the information you have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 301.085(e).

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Furthermore, this office has concluded the names and present addresses of current or former residents of a public housing development are not protected from disclosure under the common-law right to privacy. *See* Open Records Decision No. 318 (1982). Likewise, the amounts paid by a housing authority on behalf of eligible tenants are not protected from disclosure under privacy interests. *See* Open Records Decision No. 268 (1981); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 at 9-10 (1992), 545 (1990), 489 (1987), 480 (1987).

In this instance, although we agree some of the information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*, we note some of this information pertains to the requestor. Section 552.023 of the Government Code gives a person a special right of access to information that is excepted from public disclosure under laws intended to protect that person’s privacy interests. *See generally* Gov’t Code § 552.023; Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individuals request information concerning themselves). Therefore, the requestor has a special right of access to his identifying information, and the commission may not withhold his information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find some of the remaining information which does not pertain to the requestor satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the commission must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the remaining information either does not identify a particular individual or is not highly intimate or embarrassing. Accordingly, none of the remaining information may be withheld under section 552.101 on this basis. As you raise no other exceptions to disclosure, the remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Britni Fabian
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

BF/tch

Ref: ID# 526429

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)