



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

June 24, 2014

Ms. Ashley Wilson  
General Counsel  
Dallas County Schools  
612 North Zang Boulevard  
Dallas, Texas 75208

OR2014-10781

Dear Ms. Wilson:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 527509 (Reference Number: W000350-040814).

Dallas County Schools ("DCS") received a request for the bid tabulations pertaining to a specified request for proposals. Although you take no position as to whether the requested information is excepted under the Act, you state release of this information may implicate the proprietary interests of Rush Bus Centers and Thomas Bus Gulf Coast GP, Inc. (collectively, the "third parties"). Accordingly, you state, and provide documentation showing, you notified the third parties of the request for information and of their right to submit arguments to this office as to why the submitted information should not be released. *See Gov't Code § 552.305(d); see also Open Records Decision No. 542 (1990) (statutory predecessor to section 552.305 permits governmental body to rely on interested third party to raise and explain applicability of exception in the Act in certain circumstances).* We have reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information does not consist of the requested bid tabulations. Thus, this information is not responsive to the instant request for information. This ruling does not address the public availability of non-responsive information, and DCS is not required to release non-responsive information in response to this request.

Next, we must address the DCS's obligations under the Act. Pursuant to section 552.301(e) of the Government Code, a governmental body is required to submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving a request (1) general written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(e). As of the date of this letter, you have not submitted a copy or representative sample of the specific information requested. Therefore, we find the DCS failed to comply with the requirements of section 552.301.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to submit to this office the information required in section 552.301(e) results in the legal presumption that the information is public and must be released. Information that is presumed public must be released unless a governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information to overcome this presumption. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a governmental body may demonstrate a compelling reason to withhold information by showing the information is made confidential by another source of law or affects third party interests. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). We note, however, an interested third party is allowed ten business days after the date of its receipt of the governmental body's notice under section 552.305(d) to submit its reasons, if any, as to why requested information relating to that party should be withheld from disclosure. *See* Gov't Code § 552.305(d)(2)(B).

As of the date of this letter, this office has not received comments from the third parties explaining how the release of the requested information will affect their proprietary interests. Therefore, the third parties have not demonstrated that any of the requested information is proprietary for purposes of the Act. *See id.* § 552.110; Open Records Decision Nos. 661 at 5-6 (1999) (to prevent disclosure of commercial or financial information, party must show by specific factual evidence, not conclusory or generalized allegations, that release of requested information would cause that party substantial competitive harm), 552 at 5 (1990) (party must establish *prima facie* case that information is trade secret), 542 at 3. Further, because you have not submitted any of the responsive information, we have no basis for finding it confidential. Thus, we have no choice but to order the requested information released pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code. If you believe the requested information is confidential and may not lawfully be released, you must challenge this ruling in court pursuant to section 552.324 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Sarah Casterline  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

SEC/bhf

Ref: ID# 527509

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Richard Shively  
Thomas Bus Gulf Coast  
8806 Mississippi Street  
Houston, Texas 77029  
(w/o enclosures)

Mr. Lee Banks  
Rush Bus Centers  
16345 IH-35 North  
Selma, Texas 78154  
(w/o enclosures)