



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

June 26, 2014

Ms. Melanie L. Hollmann
Counsel for Ector County Independent School District
Atkins, Hollmann, Jones, Peacock, Lewis & Lyon, P.C.
3800 East 42nd Street, Suite 500
Odessa, Texas 79762

OR2014-10955

Dear Ms. Hollmann:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 527082.

The Ector County Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for e-mails of a named employee during a specified time period.¹ You state you have released some information to the requestor. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.111, 552.117, 552.130, and 552.136 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, you state some of the submitted information is subject to the Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act ("FERPA"), section 1232g of title 20 of the United States Code. The United States Department of Education Family Policy Compliance Office has informed this office FERPA does not permit state and local educational authorities to disclose to this

¹You indicate the district sought and received clarification of the information requested. See Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing that if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); see also *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or over-broad request for public information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

office, without parental consent, unredacted, personally identifiable information contained in education records for the purpose of our review in the open records ruling process under the Act.² Consequently, state and local educational authorities that receive a request for education records from a member of the public under the Act must not submit education records to this office in unredacted form, that is, in a form in which “personally identifiable information” is disclosed. *See* 34 C.F.R. § 99.3 (defining “personally identifiable information”).

In this instance, the information at issue was obtained or created by the district’s police department (the “department”), and you indicate the information at issue is maintained by the department for a law enforcement purpose. FERPA is not applicable to records that were created by a law enforcement unit of an educational agency or institution for a law enforcement purpose and that are maintained by the law enforcement unit. *See* 20 U.S.C. § 1232g(a)(4)(B)(ii); 34 C.F.R. §§ 99.3, .8. Thus, to the extent the information at issue is maintained by the department, the information is not encompassed by FERPA. You do not indicate, however, whether the information at issue is maintained exclusively by the department. Records created by a law enforcement unit for a law enforcement purpose that are maintained by a component of an educational agency or institution other than the law enforcement unit are not records of the law enforcement unit. *See* 34 C.F.R. § 99.8(b)(2). Therefore, to the extent the information at issue is maintained by a component of the district other than the department, such records are subject to FERPA. Because our office is prohibited from reviewing education records to determine whether appropriate redactions under FERPA have been made, we will not address the applicability of FERPA to the information at issue. Such determinations under FERPA must be made by the educational authority in possession of the education record.³ We will, however, address the applicability of the claimed exceptions to the information at issue.

Next, we note some of the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part, the following:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

²A copy of this letter may be found on the Office of the Attorney General’s website at <http://www.oag.state.tx.us/open/20060725usdoe.pdf>.

³In the future, if the district does obtain parental consent to submit unredacted education records and the district seeks a ruling from this office on the proper redaction of those education records in compliance with FERPA, we will rule accordingly.

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The submitted information includes completed After Action Reports that are subject to section 552.022(a)(1). The district must release the completed reports pursuant to section 552.022(a)(1), unless they are excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or expressly made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* § 552.022(a)(1). Although the district raises section 552.111 of the Government Code for this information, that exception is discretionary in nature and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions), 470 at 7 (1987) (deliberative process privilege under statutory predecessor to section 552.111 subject to waiver). Therefore, the district may not withhold the completed After Action Reports subject to section 552.022 under section 552.111. As you raise no other exceptions to disclosure of the After Action Reports, they must be released.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Juvenile law enforcement records relating to conduct that occurred on or after September 1, 1997, are confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code, which reads as follows:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Fam. Code § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). You claim the information in Exhibit B is excepted pursuant to section 58.007. Upon review, we find some of the information at issue, which we have marked, involves juvenile delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision

that occurred after September 1, 1997. *See id.* § 51.03 (defining “delinquent conduct” and “conduct indicating a need for supervision” for purposes of Fam. Code § 58.007). It does not appear any of the exceptions in section 58.007 apply with respect to this information. Therefore, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information in Exhibit B consists of juvenile law enforcement records which involve a child engaged in delinquent conduct or conduct indicating a need for supervision. Therefore, the district may not withhold the remaining information in Exhibit B under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation. Id.* at 683.

The doctrine of common-law privacy protects a compilation of an individual’s criminal history, which is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual’s privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one’s criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen’s criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. We note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf. Gov’t Code § 411.082(2)(B)* (criminal history record information does not include driving record information). Further, active warrant information or other information relating to an individual’s current involvement in the criminal justice system does not constitute criminal history information for the purposes of section 552.101. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person’s current involvement in the criminal justice system). Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See Open Records Decision No. 455* (1987). This office has also held common-law privacy protects the identity of a juvenile offender. *See Open Records Decision No. 394* (1983); *cf. Fam. Code § 58.007(c)*.

Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in

conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find no portion of the remaining information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public concern, and the district may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.”⁴ Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we find the district must withhold the dates of birth you have marked in the submitted information under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. Additionally, to the extent the dates of birth we have marked pertain to current or former district employees, the district must withhold those additional marked dates of birth under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.⁵

Section 552.108(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if: (1) release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why the release of the information at issue would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). You state the information you have indicated in Exhibit G relates to pending criminal investigations by the department. Based on this representation, we conclude the release of this information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-87 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (delineating law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Therefore, we agree section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to this information.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the information at issue relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred

⁴The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).*

⁵As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not address your remaining argument against its disclosure.

adjudication. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(2), .301(e)(1)(A). You state the remaining information in Exhibit G pertains to cases that concluded in results other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Therefore, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to this information. Accordingly, the district may withhold the information you have indicated in Exhibit G under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and the remaining information in Exhibit G under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.111 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[a]n interagency or intraagency memorandum or letter that would not be available by law to a party in litigation with the agency[.]” *Id.* § 552.111. This exception encompasses the deliberative process privilege. *See* Open Records Decision No. 615 at 2 (1993). The purpose of section 552.111 is to protect advice, opinion, and recommendation in the decisional process and to encourage open and frank discussion in the deliberative process. *See Austin v. City of San Antonio*, 630 S.W.2d 391, 394 (Tex. App.—San Antonio 1982, writ ref’d n.r.e.); Open Records Decision No. 538 at 1-2 (1990).

In Open Records Decision No. 615, we determined section 552.111 excepts from disclosure only those internal communications that consist of advice, recommendations, opinions, and other material reflecting the policymaking processes of the governmental body. *See* ORD 615 at 5. A governmental body’s policymaking functions do not encompass routine internal administrative or personnel matters, and disclosure of information about such matters will not inhibit free discussion of policy issues among agency personnel. *Id.*; *see also City of Garland v. Dallas Morning News*, 22 S.W.3d 351, 364 (Tex. 2000) (section 552.111 not applicable to personnel-related communications that did not involve policymaking). A governmental body’s policymaking functions include administrative and personnel matters of broad scope that affect the governmental body’s policy mission. *See* Open Records Decision No. 631 at 3 (1995). Further, section 552.111 does not protect facts and written observations of facts and events severable from advice, opinions, and recommendations. *Arlington Indep. Sch. Dist. v. Tex. Attorney Gen.*, 37 S.W.3d 152, 157 (Tex. App.—Austin 2001, no pet.); *see* ORD 615 at 5. But if factual information is so inextricably intertwined with material involving advice, opinion, or recommendation as to make severance of the factual data impractical, section 552.111 protects the factual information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 313 at 3 (1982).

This office has also concluded section 552.111 exempts from disclosure a preliminary draft of a document intended for public release in its final form because the draft necessarily represents the drafter’s advice, opinion, and recommendation with regard to the form and content of the final document. *See* Open Records Decision No. 559 at 2 (1990) (applying statutory predecessor). Section 552.111 protects factual information in the draft that also will be included in the final version of the document. *See id.* at 2-3. Thus, section 552.111 encompasses the entire contents of a preliminary draft of a policymaking document, including comments, underlining, deletions, and proofreading marks, that will be released to the public in its final form. *See id.* at 2.

Section 552.111 can also encompass communications between a governmental body and a third party, including a consultant or other party, with which the governmental body establishes it has a privity of interest or common deliberative process. *See* Open Records Decision No. 561 at 9 (1990) (section 552.111 encompasses communications with party with which governmental body has privity of interest or common deliberative process). For section 552.111 to apply, the governmental body must identify the third party and explain the nature of its relationship with the governmental body. We note a governmental body does not share a privity of interest with a third party when the governmental body and the third party are involved in contract negotiations, as the parties interests are adverse.

The district states the information not subject to section 552.022 in Exhibit A consists of advice, opinions, and recommendations relating to the district's policymaking. The district also states the information at issue contains draft policymaking documents. Upon review, we find the district may withhold the information we have marked in Exhibit A under section 552.111 of the Government Code. However, we find the district has failed to demonstrate how it shares a privity of interest or common deliberative process with some of the individuals in the remaining communications at issue. Further, some of the remaining information at issue consists of either general administrative information that does not relate to policymaking or information that is purely factual in nature. Thus, we find the district has failed to demonstrate how the remaining information at issue is excepted under section 552.111. Accordingly, the district may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.111 of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the district must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.⁶

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security numbers, and family member information of current or former officials or employees of a governmental body who request that this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code, except as provided by section 552.024(a-1). *Id.* §§ 552.117(a)(1), .024. Section 552.024(a-1) of the Government Code provides, "A school district may not require an employee or former employee of the district to choose whether to allow public access to the employee's or former employee's social security number." *Id.* § 552.024(a-1). Thus, the district may only withhold under section 552.117(a)(1) the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, and family member information of a current

⁶As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not address your remaining argument against its disclosure.

or former employee or official of the district who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024. We note section 552.117 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). Whether a particular piece of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time the request for it is made. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Therefore, a governmental body must withhold information under section 552.117(a)(1) on behalf of a current or former employee only if the individual made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date on which the request for the information was made.

You contend the information you have marked in Exhibit C is subject to section 552.117, and you state these individuals timely elected to keep their information confidential pursuant to section 552.024. However, we note one of the telephone numbers you have marked in Exhibit C is not held by the district in the employment context. Accordingly, the district may not withhold that telephone number under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. The district must withhold the remaining home address and home telephone number in Exhibit C, which we have marked, under section 552.117(a)(1). You also state Exhibits D, E, and F contain information subject to section 552.117; however, we are unable to discern if the individuals in these exhibits are current or former employees of the district. Accordingly, if the individuals at issue are current or former employees of the district, and to the extent those individuals timely elected to keep their information confidential pursuant to section 552.024, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. However, the district may only withhold the marked cellular telephone number if it is not paid for by a governmental body. We find no portion of the remaining information consists of the home address, home telephone number, or family member information of a current or former district employee, and the district may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b). Section 552.136(a) defines “access device” as “a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to . . . obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value [or] initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.” *Id.* § 552.136(a). Upon review, we find some of the information at issue consists of access device numbers. Accordingly, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. However, we find you have not demonstrated how the remaining

information you marked consists of access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Accordingly, the district may not withhold the remaining information you marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address at issue is not excluded by subsection (c). Therefore, the district must withhold the personal e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owner affirmatively consents to its public disclosure.

Section 552.139 of the Government Code provides, in part:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information that relates to computer network security, to restricted information under Section 2059.055 [of the Government Code], or to the design, operation, or defense of a computer network.

(b) The following information is confidential:

(1) a computer network vulnerability report; [and]

(2) any other assessment of the extent to which data processing operations, a computer, a computer program, network, system, or system interface, or software of a governmental body or of a contractor of a governmental body is vulnerable to unauthorized access or harm, including an assessment of the extent to which the governmental body’s or contractor’s electronically stored information containing sensitive or critical information is vulnerable to alteration, damage, erasure, or inappropriate use[.]

(3) a photocopy or other copy of an identification badge issued to an official or employee of a governmental body.

Id. § 552.139(a), (b)(1)-(3). Section 2059.055 of the Government Code provides in part:

(b) Network security information is confidential under this section if the information is:

(1) related to passwords, personal identification numbers, access codes, encryption, or other components of the security system of a state agency;

(2) collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental entity to prevent, detect, or investigate criminal activity; or

(3) related to an assessment, made by or for a governmental entity or maintained by a governmental entity, of the vulnerability of a network to criminal activity.

Id. § 2059.055(b). We understand the remaining information contains a personal identification number and a password that can be used to securely access the district's substitute teacher database. Additionally, a portion of the remaining information consists of a copy of a district identification card. Accordingly, the district must withhold the marked personal identification number and password under section 552.139(a) of the Government Code and the marked district identification card under section 552.139(b)(3) of the Government Code.

Section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code provides, "The social security number of an employee of a school district in the custody of the district is confidential." *Id.* § 552.147(a-1). Section 552.147 makes the social security numbers of school district employees confidential, without such employees being required to first make a confidentiality election under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *Id.* § 552.024(a-1) (school district may not require current or former district employee to choose whether to allow public access to employee's social security number). The legislative history of sections 552.024(a-1) and 552.147(a-1) reflects the protection afforded by section 552.147(a-1) was intended to extend to both current and former school district employees. *See* House Comm. on Gov't Efficiency and Reform, Bill Analysis, Tex. H.B. 2961, 83rd Leg., R.S. (2013) ("H.B. 2961 seeks to protect the social security number of a school district employee or former employee from public disclosure."). Thus, when reading sections 552.024(a-1) and 552.147(a-1) together, and upon review of the legislative history of these two amendments, we conclude section 552.147(a-1) makes confidential the social security number of a current or former school district employee. Accordingly, if the individuals whose information is at issue are current or former district employees, the district must withhold the social security numbers we have marked under section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code.⁷

We also note that some of the remaining information may be protected by copyright. A custodian of public records must comply with the copyright law and is not required to furnish copies of records that are copyrighted. *See* Open Records Decision No. 180 at 3 (1977). A governmental body must allow inspection of copyrighted materials unless an exception

⁷To the extent the individuals at issue are not district employees, we note section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

applies to the information. *See id.*; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 109 (1975). If a member of the public wishes to make copies of copyrighted materials, the person must do so unassisted by the governmental body. In making copies, the member of the public assumes the duty of compliance with the copyright law and the risk of a copyright infringement suit.

In summary, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and common-law privacy. The district must withhold the dates of birth you have marked in the submitted information under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code; and to the extent the dates of birth we have marked pertain to current or former district employees, the district must withhold those additional marked dates of birth under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. The district may withhold the information you have indicated in Exhibit G under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code, the remaining information in Exhibit G under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code, and the information we have marked in Exhibit A under section 552.111 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the home address and home telephone number we have marked in Exhibit C under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. The district must withhold the additional information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code if the individuals at issue are current or former employees of the district and to the extent those individuals timely elected to keep their information confidential pursuant to section 552.024 of the Government Code; however, the district may only withhold the marked cellular telephone number if it is not paid for by a governmental body. The district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the e-mail address we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code unless the owner consents to its disclosure. The district must withhold the marked personal identification number and password under section 552.139(a) of the Government Code and the marked district identification card under section 552.139(b)(3) of the Government Code. The district must withhold the social security numbers we have marked under section 552.147(a-1) of the Government Code if the individuals whose information is at issue are current or former district employees. The district must release the remaining information; however, the district may release information subject to copyright only in accordance with copyright law.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at <http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/>

[orl_ruling_info.shtml](#), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Kristi L. Wilkins', with a stylized flourish at the end.

Kristi L. Wilkins
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KLW/tch

Ref: ID# 527082

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)