



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

June 26, 2014

Mr. Robert G. Schleier, Jr.  
Counsel for City of Kilgore  
Law Office of Robert G. Schleier, Jr.  
116 North Kilgore Street  
Kilgore, Texas 75662

OR2014-10967

Dear Mr. Schleier:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 527111.

The Kilgore Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for the police reports pertaining to two specified incidents. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note you have submitted information related to only one of the incidents specified in the request. However, you have not submitted information responsive to the remaining portion of the request. To the extent such information existed and was maintained by the department on the date the department received the request for information, we assume it has been released. If the department has not released such information, it must do so at this time. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 664 (2000) (if governmental body determines no exceptions apply to requested information, it must release information as soon as possible).

Next, we must address the department's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must request a ruling from this office and state the exceptions to disclosure that apply within ten business days after

receiving the request for information. Gov't Code § 552.301(b). In this instance, the department received the request for information on April 2, 2014. Thus, the department's ten-business-day deadline under section 552.301(b) was April 16, 2014. We note, the postmark on the envelope in which the department mailed its request for a ruling is illegible, and we are otherwise unable to determine the department mailed its request for a ruling on or before April 16, 2014. *See id.* § 552.308 (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Consequently, we find the department has failed to establish that it complied with the procedural mandates of section 552.301(b) of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302, a governmental body's failure to comply with the requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless a compelling reason exists to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code for the submitted information, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (untimely request for decision resulted in waiver of discretionary exceptions), 177 at 3 (1997) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Thus, in failing to comply with section 552.301, the department has waived its argument under section 552.108, and may not withhold the submitted information on this basis. However, we note portions of the submitted information are subject to sections 552.101 and 552.130 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> Because these sections can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness, we will consider their applicability to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be established. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation. Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have failed to demonstrate that the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Therefore, the department may not withhold any of the remaining information on the basis of section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code exempts from disclosure information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration issued by an agency of this state or another state or country. Gov't Code § 552.130(a)(1)-(2). Upon review, we find portions of the remaining information consist of motor vehicle record information. Accordingly, the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Miriam A. Khalifa  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

MAK/akg

Ref: ID# 527111

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)