



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 16, 2014

Mr. Ricardo R. Lopez
Counsel for North East Independent School District
Schulman, Lopez & Hoffer, LLP
517 Soledad Street
San Antonio, Texas 78205-1508

OR2014-12242

Dear Mr. Lopez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 529300.

The North East Independent School District (the "district"), which you represent, received a request for personnel information regarding a named district employee. You state the district will redact social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147(b) of the Government Code.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the district's procedural obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code when requesting a decision from this office under the Act. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), within ten business days after receiving a written request the governmental body must request a ruling from this office and state the exceptions to disclosure that apply. Gov't Code § 552.301(b). Further, pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body must submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the

¹Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact the social security number of a living person without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. See Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

documents. *Id.* § 552.301(e). The district states it received the request for information on April 22, 2014. The district informs us it was closed on April 25, 2014. This office does not count the date the request was received or the date the governmental body was closed as business days for the purpose of calculating a governmental body's deadlines under the Act. Accordingly, the ten-business-day deadline was May 7, 2014, and the fifteen-business-day deadline was May 14, 2014. However, the district submitted the information required under section 552.301(e) in an envelope bearing a post-office cancellation mark of May 15, 2014. *See id.* § 552.308(a)(1) (describing rules for calculating submission dates of documents sent via first class United States mail, common or contract carrier, or interagency mail). Consequently, we find the district failed to comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with section 552.301 results in the legal presumption the requested information is public and must be released unless a compelling reason exists to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third-party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Although the district claims section 552.103 for the submitted information, that exception is discretionary in nature and may be waived. Accordingly, section 552.103 does not constitute a compelling reason to withhold information. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Accordingly, the district may not withhold any portion of the submitted information under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, the district also claims section 552.101 of the Government Code for the submitted information. Furthermore, we note sections 552.102, 552.117, 552.130, and 552.137 of the Government Code are applicable to some of the submitted information.² These sections can provide compelling reasons to overcome the presumption of openness. Therefore, we will address the applicability of these sections to the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information that other statutes make confidential, such as section 21.355 of the Education Code, which provides that “[a] document evaluating the performance of a teacher or administrator is confidential.” Educ.

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Code § 21.355. This office has interpreted section 21.355 to apply to any document that evaluates, as that term is commonly understood, the performance of a teacher or administrator. *See* Open Records Decision No. 643 (1996). In Open Records Decision No. 643, we determined for purposes of section 21.355, the word “teacher” means a person who is required to and does in fact hold a teaching certificate under subchapter B of chapter 21 of the Education Code and who is in the process of teaching, as that term is commonly defined, at the time of the evaluation. *See id.* at 4. Further, we determined an “administrator” for purposes of section 21.355 means a person who is required to, and does in fact, hold an administrator’s certificate under subchapter B of chapter 21 of the Education Code, and is performing the functions as an administrator, as that term is commonly defined, at the time of the evaluation. *Id.* The Third Court of Appeals has concluded a written reprimand constitutes an evaluation for purposes of section 21.355, because “it reflects the principal’s judgment regarding [a teacher’s] actions, gives corrective direction, and provides for further review.” *See Abbott v. North East Indep. Sch. Dist.*, 212 S.W.3d 364 (Tex. App.—Austin 2006, no pet.).

You contend some of the submitted information constitutes confidential evaluations of the named district employee by the district, and you inform us the employee was certified as an administrator and was acting as an administrator at the time the evaluations were prepared. Upon review, we find some of the information at issue constitutes evaluations of the named district employee. Additionally, we find some of the information at issue constitutes evaluations of a district teacher, and we understand the teacher was certified as a teacher and was acting as a teacher at the time the evaluations were prepared. Accordingly, we conclude the information we have marked is confidential under section 21.355 of the Education Code and must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis. However, you have failed to demonstrate any portion of the remaining information at issue consists of confidential evaluations subject to section 21.355 of the Education Code, and the district may not withhold any of the remaining information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code, which provides an I-9 form and “any information contained in or appended to such form, may not be used for purposes other than for enforcement of this chapter” and for enforcement of other federal statutes governing crime and criminal investigations. *See* 8 U.S.C. § 1324a(b)(5); *see also* 8 C.F.R. § 274a.2(b)(4). Release of the submitted I-9 form in this instance would be “for purposes other than enforcement” of the referenced federal statutes. Accordingly, the district must withhold the submitted I-9 form under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the Family and Medical Leave Act (the “FMLA”). *See* 29 U.S.C. §§ 2601 *et. seq.* Section 825.500 of chapter V of title 29 of the Code of Federal Regulations identifies the record-keeping requirements for employers that are subject to the FMLA. Subsection (g) of section 825.500 states:

[r]ecords and documents relating to certifications, recertifications or medical histories of employees or employees' family members, created for purposes of FMLA, shall be maintained as confidential medical records in separate files/records from the usual personnel files, and if the ADA, as amended, is also applicable, such records shall be maintained in conformance with ADA confidentiality requirements[], except that:

- (1) Supervisors and managers may be informed regarding necessary restrictions on the work or duties of an employee and necessary accommodations;
- (2) First aid and safety personnel may be informed (when appropriate) if the employee's physical or medical condition might require emergency treatment; and
- (3) Government officials investigating compliance with FMLA (or other pertinent law) shall be provided relevant information upon request.

29 C.F.R. § 825.500(g). Upon review, we find the information we have marked is confidential under section 825.500 of title 29 of the Code of Federal Regulations. Further, we find none of the release provisions of the FMLA apply to this information. Accordingly, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the FMLA.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy[.]" Gov't Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we find the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.102(b) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure higher education transcripts of professional public school employees, but does not except the employee's name, the courses taken, and the degree obtained from disclosure. Gov't Code § 552.102(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 526 (1989). Thus, with the exception of the employee's name, courses taken, and degree obtained, the district must withhold the submitted college transcripts pursuant to section 552.102(b) of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of a governmental body who

requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(1). Section 552.117 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). Section 552.024(a-1) of the Government Code provides, "A school district may not require an employee or former employee of the district to choose whether to allow public access to the employee's or former employee's social security number." Gov't Code § 552.024(a-1). Thus, the district may only withhold under section 552.117 the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, and family member information of a current or former employee or official of the district who requests this information be kept confidential under section 552.024. Whether a particular item of information is protected by section 552.117(a)(1) must be determined at the time of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. *See* Open Records Decision No. 530 at 5 (1989). Thus, information may be withheld under section 552.117(a)(1) only on behalf of a current or former employee or official who made a request for confidentiality under section 552.024 prior to the date of the governmental body's receipt of the request for the information. Therefore, if the individuals at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code. However, the district may withhold the marked cellular telephone number under section 552.117(a)(1) only if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. Conversely, to the extent the individuals at issue did not timely request confidentiality under section 552.024, the district may not withhold any of the marked information under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license or permit, a motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of Texas or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the district must withhold the driver's license information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.137 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body" unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). The e-mail address at issue is not within the scope of section 552.137(c). Accordingly, the district must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consent to their release.

In summary, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 21.355 of the Education Code, section 1324a of title 8 of the United States Code, and the FMLA.

The district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code. With the exception of the employee's name, courses taken, and degree obtained, the district must withhold the submitted college transcripts pursuant to section 552.102(b) of the Government Code. If the individuals at issue timely requested confidentiality under section 552.024 of the Government Code, the district must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(1) of the Government Code; however, the marked cellular telephone numbers may only be withheld if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service. The district must withhold the driver's license information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The district must withhold the e-mail addresses we have marked under section 552.137 of the Government Code, unless the owners affirmatively consents to their release. The district must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kristi L. Godden
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

KLG/tch

Ref: ID# 529300

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)