



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

July 31, 2014

Mr. David F. Brown
Counsel for the Texas Windstorm Insurance Association
Ewell, Brown & Blanke, L.L.P.
111 Congress Avenue, 28th Floor
Austin, Texas 78701

OR2014-13301

Dear Mr. Brown:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 531235 (TWIA ID# 000227).

The Texas Windstorm Insurance Association ("TWIA"), which you represent, received a request for all e-mails and attachments sent to or from fifteen named TWIA employees during a specified period of time that use one or more specified terms.¹ You claim the submitted information is exempted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, 552.107, 552.111, and 552.136 of

¹You state TWIA sought and received clarification of the information requested. See Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); see also *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or overbroad request for information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed). You also inform us the requestor was required to make a deposit for payment of anticipated costs for the request under section 552.263 of the Government Code, which TWIA received. See Gov't Code § 552.263(e) (if governmental body requires deposit or bond for anticipated costs pursuant to section 552.263, request for information is considered to have been received on date that governmental body receives deposit or bond).

the Government Code.² We have considered your arguments and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.³

Initially, we note some of the submitted information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part, the following:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108 [of the Government Code]; [and]

...

(3) information in an account, voucher, or contract relating to the receipt or expenditure of public or other funds by a governmental body; [and]

...

(5) all working papers, research material, and information used to estimate the need for or expenditure of public funds or taxes by a governmental body, on completion of the estimate[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1), (3), (5). The submitted information includes a completed report that is subject to subsection 552.022(a)(1). TWIA must release the completed report pursuant to subsection 552.022(a)(1) unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* § 552.022(a)(1). The submitted information also includes information in an account, voucher, or contract relating to the expenditure of funds by a governmental body that is subject to subsection 552.022(a)(3) and information used to estimate the need for or expenditure of public funds or taxes by a governmental body that is subject to subsection 552.022(a)(5), which must be released unless it is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* § 552.022(a)(3), (5). Although TWIA raises

²Although you raise Texas Rule of Evidence 503 and Texas Rule of Civil Procedure 192.5, we note the proper exceptions to raise when asserting the attorney-client privilege and the attorney work product privilege for information not subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code are sections 552.107 and 552.111 of the Government Code, respectively. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 676 at 1-2 (2002), 677 (2002).

³We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

section 552.103 of the Government Code for the information subject to section 552.022, this exception is discretionary in nature and does not make information confidential under the Act. See *Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Therefore, TWIA may not withhold any of the information subject to section 552.022, which we have marked, under section 552.103. However, TWIA raises sections 552.101 and 552.136 of the Government Code for this information. Because sections 552.101 and 552.136 make information confidential for purposes of section 552.022, we will consider the applicability of these sections to the information subject to section 552.022. Further, we will address TWIA's arguments against disclosure of the remaining information.

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides, in relevant part:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The governmental body claiming section 552.103 has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents sufficient to establish the applicability of section 552.103 to the information it seeks to withhold. To meet this burden, the governmental body must demonstrate: (1) litigation was pending or reasonably anticipated on the date of its receipt of the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. See *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.). Both elements of the test must be met in order for information to be excepted from disclosure under section 552.103. See Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990).

You argue the submitted information is related to pending litigation to which TWIA is a party. You inform us, and have provided documentation demonstrating, litigation styled *Brownsville Independent School District v. Texas Windstorm Insurance Association*, Cause

No. 2012-DCL-08605-A, is pending in the District Court of Cameron County, 107th Judicial District. You state the submitted information is related to the pending lawsuit. You further explain the plaintiff in the lawsuit has requested the same information in a discovery request. Based on your representations, the submitted documentation, and our review of the information, we find litigation was pending when TWIA received this request for information, and the information at issue is related to the pending litigation for the purposes of section 552.103. Therefore, we conclude TWIA may withhold the information not subject to section 552.022 under section 552.103 of the Government Code.⁴

Generally, however, once information has been obtained by all parties to the litigation through discovery or otherwise, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). Thus, information that has either been obtained from or provided to all parties to the pending litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a) and must be disclosed. Further, the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends once the litigation has been concluded. *See* Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 350 (1982).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. TWIA asserts portions of the remaining information are excepted from public disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the Gramm-Leach-Bliley Act (the “GLB Act”) and relevant state insurance regulations. *See* 15 U.S.C. §§ 6801-6809; Ins. Code §§ 601.002 (covered entity must comply with 15 U.S.C. §§ 6802-6803), .051 (commissioner of insurance shall adopt rules necessary to carry out and keep privacy requirements consistent with GLB Act); 28 T.A.C. §§ 22.1-22.26. The purpose of the GLB Act is to promote competition in the financial services industry. *See* H.R. Conf. Rep. No. 106-434, at 245 (1999), *reprinted in* 1999 U.S.C.C.A.N. 245, 245. Reflecting Congressional concern regarding the dissemination of consumers’ personal financial information, the GLB Act provides certain privacy protections “to protect the security and confidentiality of [consumers’] nonpublic personal information.” 15 U.S.C. § 6801(a). The statute defines nonpublic personal information (“NPI”) as “personally identifiable financial information [“PIFI”] - (i) provided by a consumer to a financial institution; (ii) resulting from any transaction with the consumer or any service performed for the consumer; or (iii) otherwise obtained by the financial institution.” *Id.* § 6809(4)(A); *see id.* § 6809(4)(C)(I) (PIFI includes “any list, description, or other grouping of consumers (and publicly available information pertaining to them) that is derived using any [NPI]”). Federal regulations define PIFI as

any information: (i) [a] consumer provides to [a regulated financial institution] to obtain a financial product or service . . . ; (ii) [a]bout a consumer resulting from any

⁴As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not consider your remaining arguments against its disclosure.

transaction involving a financial product or service between [a regulated financial institution] and a consumer; or (iii) [a regulated financial institution] otherwise obtain[s] about a consumer in connection with providing a financial product or service to that consumer.

16 C.F.R. § 313.3(o)(1). Sections 6802(a) and (b) of title 15 of the United States Code provide in pertinent part as follows:

(a) Notice requirements

Except as otherwise provided in this subchapter, a financial institution may not, directly or through any affiliate, disclose to a nonaffiliated third party any nonpublic personal information, unless such financial institution provides or has provided to the consumer a notice that complies with section 6803 of this title.

(b) Opt out

(1) In general

A financial institution may not disclose nonpublic personal information to a nonaffiliated third party unless –

(A) such financial institution clearly and conspicuously discloses to the consumer, in writing or in electronic form or other form permitted by the regulations prescribed under section 6804 of this title, that such information may be disclosed to such third party;

(B) the consumer is given the opportunity, before the time that such information is initially disclosed, to direct that such information not be disclosed to such third party; and

(C) the consumer is given an explanation of how the consumer can exercise that nondisclosure option.

15 U.S.C. § 6802(a), (b). “Nonaffiliated third party” is defined as “any entity that is not an affiliate of, or related by common ownership or affiliated by corporate control with, the financial institution, but does not include a joint employee of such institution.” *Id.* § 6809(5). Section 6809(3)(A) of title 15 of the United States Code defines financial institution as “any institution the business of which is engaging in financial activities as described in section 1843(k) of Title 12.” 15 U.S.C. § 6809(3)(A). Section 1843(k)(4)(B) of title 12 defines the following activity as financial in nature: “Insuring, guaranteeing, or indemnifying against loss, harm, damage, illness, disability, or death, or providing and issuing annuities, and acting as principal, agent, or broker for purposes of the foregoing, in any State.” 12 U.S.C. § 1843(k)(4)(B).

Similarly, subchapter A of chapter 22 of the Texas Administrative Code governs the treatment of nonpublic personal financial individuals by covered entities. 28 T.A.C. § 22.1(a); *see id.* § 22.1(b) (providing scope of subchapter A of chapter 22). A covered entity is defined as “[a]n individual or entity who receives an authorization from the Texas Department of Insurance[.]” including an individual or entity to which chapter 82 of the Insurance Code is applicable. *Id.* § 22.2(11) (defining “covered entity”); *see also* Ins. Code § 82.002 (listing types of companies to which chapter 82 of Insurance Code applies). For purposes of subchapter A, “nonpublic personal financial information” includes

- (i) personally identifiable financial information;
- (ii) any list, description or other grouping of consumers (and publicly available information pertaining to them) that is derived using any personally identifiable financial information that is not publicly available; and
- (iii) any list of individuals’ names and street addresses that is derived in whole or in part using personally identifiable financial information that is not publicly available, such as account numbers.

28 T.A.C. § 22.2(21). Section 22.14 of title 28 of the Texas Administrative Code provides as follows:

(a) Conditions for disclosure. Except as otherwise authorized in this subchapter, a covered entity may not, directly or through any affiliate, disclose any nonpublic personal financial information about a consumer to a nonaffiliated third party unless:

- (1) the covered entity has provided to the consumer an initial notice as required under § 22.8 of this title (relating to Initial Privacy Notice);
- (2) the covered entity has provided to the consumer an opt out notice as required in § 22.11 of this title (relating to Form of Opt Out Notice to Consumers and Opt Out Methods);
- (3) the covered entity has given the consumer a reasonable opportunity, before it discloses the information to the nonaffiliated third party, to opt out of the disclosure; and
- (4) the consumer does not opt out.

28 T.A.C. § 22.14(a). For purposes of section 22.14, a nonaffiliated third party is “[a]n entity that is not an affiliate of, or related to by common ownership or affiliated by corporate control with, the covered entity.” *Id.* § 22.2(20).

TWIA is an association composed of all property insurers authorized to engage in the business of property insurance in Texas, other than insurers prevented by law from writing on a statewide basis coverages available through TWIA. Ins. Code § 2210.051(a); *see id.* §§ 2210.006, .051(b) (to engage in business of insurance in Texas, property insurer must be member of TWIA); *see also* 28 T.A.C. § 5.4001(c)(2)(D). The primary purpose of TWIA is to provide an adequate market for windstorm and hail insurance in Texas seacoast territories. Ins. Code § 2210.001. In addition, you state TWIA is an insurance company. *See id.* §§ 2210.053(a)(1), .203(a); *see also Tex. Windstorm Ins. Ass'n v. Poole*, 255 S.W.3d 775, 777 (Tex. App.—Amarillo 2008, pet. denied) (TWIA has “attributes of a private insurance business while operating under a governmental cloak”). Based on these representations, we agree TWIA is a financial institution for purposes of the GLB Act and a covered entity for purposes of section 22.14. You state the requestor is a non-affiliated third party. *See* 15 U.S.C. § 6809(5); 28 T.A.C. § 22.2(20).

You seek to withhold individual policy holders’ names under the GLB Act and chapter 22 of title 28 of the Texas Administrative Code. You state this information was provided to TWIA for the purpose of obtaining insurance and is also information resulting from transactions with the insured or services performed for the insured by TWIA, a regulated financial institution. *See* 15 U.S.C. § 6809(4)(A), 16 C.F.R. § 313.3(o)(1). You state TWIA has not provided opt out notices to the insured. Because the names at issue were provided to TWIA by the insured in order to obtain a service, this information falls under the definition of PIFI. *See generally Individual Reference Servs. Group, Inc. v. Federal Trade Comm’n*, 145 F. Supp. 2d 6, 26-31 (D.D.C. 2001) (discussing language, structure, and history of GLB Act to determine whether certain information meets definition of PIFI). We also find this information consists of nonpublic personal financial information for purposes of section 22.14. Based on your representations and our review, we determine TWIA is prohibited by section 6802(a) and (b) of title 15 of the United States Code and section 22.14(a) of title 28 of the Texas Administrative Code from releasing the individual policy holders’ names, which you have marked; therefore, TWIA must withhold this information from disclosure under section 552.101 in conjunction with the GLB Act.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov’t Code § 552.136(b). Section 552.136(a) defines “access device” as “a card, plate, code, account number, personal identification number, electronic serial number, mobile identification number, or other telecommunications service, equipment, or instrument identifier or means of account access that alone or in conjunction with another access device may be used to . . . obtain money, goods, services, or another thing of value [or] initiate a transfer of funds other than a transfer originated solely by paper instrument.” *Id.* § 552.136(a). This office has determined insurance policy numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. *See* Open Records Decision No. 684 at 9 (2009). Accordingly, TWIA must withhold the insurance policy numbers we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. However, you have not explained, and we cannot discern, how the claim numbers you have marked in the remaining

information are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Therefore, TWIA may not withhold the remaining information you have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

In summary, TWIA may withhold the information that is not subject to section 552.022 under section 552.103 of the Government Code. TWIA must withhold the information you have marked in the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the GLB Act. TWIA must withhold the insurance policy numbers we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code and release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Nicholas A. Ybarra
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

NAY/bhf

Ref: ID# 531235

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)