



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 1, 2014

Mr. Bryan McWilliams
Assistant City Attorney
City of Amarillo
P.O. Box 1971
Amarillo, Texas 79105-1971

OR2014-13360

Dear Mr. McWilliams:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 532111 (Reference No. 14-899).

The Amarillo Police Department (the "department") received a request for a specified police report. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To

¹We note the department failed to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301(b) of the Government Code by failing to meet its 10-business-day deadline. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(b) (requiring a governmental body to ask for the attorney general's decision and to state the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request). Nonetheless, the applicability of section 552.101 of the Government Code can constitute a compelling reason sufficient to overcome the presumption of openness caused by the failure to comply with section 552.301. *See id.* §§ 552.007, .302. Therefore, we will address the department's assertion of this exception.

demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be demonstrated. *See id.* at 681-82.

The submitted information pertains to a report of alleged sexual assault. In Open Records Decision No. 393 (1983), this office concluded generally, only information that either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense may be withheld under common-law privacy; however, because the identifying information was inextricably intertwined with other releasable information, the governmental body was required to withhold the entire report. Open Records Decision No. 393 at 2 (1983); *see* Open Records Decision No. 339 (1982); *see also Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information); Open Records Decision No. 440 (1986) (detailed descriptions of serious sexual offenses must be withheld). The requestor in this case knows the identity of the alleged victim. We believe in this instance, withholding only identifying information from the requestor would not preserve the victim's common-law right to privacy. Therefore, the department must withhold generally the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note the requestor is a representative of the Texas Air National Guard (the "Air National Guard") and may have a right of access to some of the information that would otherwise be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code. Section 411.089(a) of the Government Code provides that "[a] criminal justice agency is entitled to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] any criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] about a person." *See* Gov't Code § 411.089(a). In addition, section 411.087(a) of the Government Code provides in pertinent part:

(a) [a] person, agency, department, political subdivision, or other entity that is authorized by this subchapter to obtain from the [Department of Public Safety] criminal history record information maintained by the [Department of Public Safety] that relates to another person is authorized to:

...

(2) obtain from any other criminal justice agency in this state criminal history record information maintained by that criminal justice agency that relates to that person.

Id. § 411.087(a)(2). We note that "criminal history record information" is defined as "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." *See id.* § 411.082(2). Thus, the submitted information in this instance contains "criminal history record information."

However, a criminal justice agency that receives criminal history record information from another criminal justice agency pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) may only receive such information for a criminal justice purpose. *See id.* §§ 411.083(c), .087(b); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 655 (1997) (discussing limitations on release of criminal history record information). Although this information is confidential under common-law privacy, a statutory right of access prevails over common-law privacy. *Collins v. Tex Mall, L.P.*, 297 S.W.3d 409, 415 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2009, no pet.) (statutory provision controls and preempts common law only when statute directly conflicts with common law principle); *CenterPoint Energy Houston Elec. LLC v. Harris County Toll Rd.*, 436 F.3d 541, 544 (5th Cir. 2006) (common law controls only where there is no conflicting or controlling statutory law). Thus, notwithstanding the private nature of this information, to the extent the requestor represents a criminal justice agency, he is authorized to obtain criminal history record information from the department pursuant to section 411.087(a)(2) of the Government Code, but only for a criminal justice purpose. *See* Gov't Code §§ 411.083(c), .087(a)(2).

A “criminal justice agency” is defined in part as “a federal or state agency that is engaged in the administration of criminal justice under a statute or executive order and that allocates a substantial portion of its annual budget to the administration of criminal justice.” *Id.* § 411.082(3)(A). “Administration of criminal justice” has the meaning assigned to it by article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. *See id.* § 411.082(1). Article 60.01 of the Code of Criminal Procedure defines “administration of criminal justice” as the “performance of any of the following activities: detection, apprehension, pretrial release, post-trial release, prosecution, adjudication, correctional supervision, or rehabilitation of an offender. The term includes criminal identification activities and the collection, storage, and dissemination of criminal history record information.” Code Crim. Proc. art. 60.01(1).

In this case, the requestor states he is requesting the records in conjunction with an ongoing Air National Guard investigation. We cannot determine whether he is a representative of a criminal justice agency or whether he intends to use the criminal history record information for a criminal justice purpose. Consequently, if the department determines that this particular requestor is requesting the information on behalf of a criminal justice agency and intends to use the criminal history record information for a criminal justice purpose, we conclude that the department must make available to the requestor the criminal history record information from the documents that shows the type of allegation made and whether there was an arrest, information, indictment, detention, conviction, or other formal charges and their dispositions. *See* Open Records Decision No. 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exceptions to disclosure under the Act). In that instance, the department must withhold the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, if the department determines that this particular requestor is not requesting the information on behalf of a criminal justice agency or does not intend to use the criminal history record information for a criminal justice purpose, then the department must withhold the submitted information in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the department must generally withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, to the extent that the requestor has a right of access to the criminal history record information in the submitted information pursuant to subchapter F of Chapter 411 of the Government Code, the requestor is authorized to obtain that information in accordance with that chapter.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/bhf

Ref: ID# 532111

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)