



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 6, 2014

Ms. Deborah Pullum
City Attorney
City of Tyler
P.O. Box 2039
Tyler, Texas 75710

OR2014-13704

Dear Ms. Pullum:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 531799 (Tyler File No. XWN-258450).

The Tyler Police Department (the "department") received a request for a copy of the 9-1-1 call that originated from a specified address between specified times. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the request only seeks a copy of the 9-1-1 call that originated from a specified address between specified times. Therefore, only the submitted 9-1-1 call is responsive to the request for information. Thus, the remaining information is not responsive to the instant request. This ruling does not address the public availability of nonresponsive information, and the department is not required to release nonresponsive information in response to this request.

We must address the department's obligations under the Act. Section 552.301 of the Government Code describes the procedural obligations placed on a governmental body that receives a written request for information it wishes to withhold. Pursuant to section 552.301(b), a governmental body must ask for a decision from this office and state the exceptions that apply within ten business days of receiving the written request.

See Gov't Code § 552.301(b). In this instance, you state the department received the request for information on May 13, 2014. Accordingly, the ten-business-day deadline was May 28, 2014. However, the department requested a ruling from our office in an envelope meter-marked May 29, 2014. *See id.* § 552.308(a) (deadline under the Act is met if document bears post office mark indicating time within the deadline period). Consequently, we find the department failed to comply with section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless a compelling reason exists to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381-82 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 630 (1994). Generally, a compelling reason to withhold information exists where some other source of law makes the information confidential or where third-party interests are at stake. Open Records Decision No. 150 at 2 (1977). Although you raise section 552.108 of the Government Code for the responsive 9-1-1 recording, this is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived; as such, this section does not constitute a compelling reason to withhold information for purposes of section 552.302. *See* Gov't Code § 552.007; Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 177 at 3 (1977) (statutory predecessor to section 552.108 subject to waiver). Therefore, the department may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.108. We note, however, a portion of the submitted information is subject to section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy, which does provide a compelling reason for non-disclosure; therefore, we will address section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find the information we have indicated satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we

have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, the department must withhold the information we have indicated pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Ellen Webking
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

EW/ac

Ref: ID#531799

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)