



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

August 21, 2014

Mr. Christopher Garza
Assistant District Attorney
Brazoria County
111 East Locust, Suite 408A
Angleton, Texas 77515

OR2014-14712

Dear Mr. Garza:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 534277.

The Brazoria County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining to a named deceased individual.¹ You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.103, and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note some of the submitted information consists of grand jury subpoenas and information obtained pursuant to grand jury subpoenas. The judiciary is expressly excluded from the requirements of the Act. Gov't Code § 552.003(1)(B). This office has determined for purposes of the Act, a grand jury is a part of the judiciary and therefore not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decision No. 411 (1984). Further, records kept by a governmental body that is acting as an agent for a grand jury are considered records in the constructive possession of the grand jury, and are also not subject to the Act. *See* Open Records Decisions Nos. 513 (1988), 411, 398 (1983). Thus, to the extent the records at issue are in the custody of the sheriff's office as an agent for the grand jury, these records are in the grand jury's constructive possession and are not subject to the Act. However, to the extent this

¹We note the sheriff's office sought and received clarification of the information requested. *See* Gov't Code § 552.222 (providing if request for information is unclear, governmental body may ask requestor to clarify request); *see also* *City of Dallas v. Abbott*, 304 S.W.3d 380, 387 (Tex. 2010) (holding that when a governmental entity, acting in good faith, requests clarification or narrowing of an unclear or over-broad request for public information, the ten-day period to request an attorney general ruling is measured from the date the request is clarified or narrowed).

information is not in the custody of the sheriff's office as an agent for the grand jury, we will address your exceptions to disclosure for this information.

Next, we note the remaining information includes a custodial death report. Article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure provides the attorney general shall make the custodial death report available to any interested person, with the exception of any portion of the report that the attorney general determines is privileged. *See* Crim. Proc. Code art. 49.18(b). The format of a custodial death report was revised in May 2006 and now consists of four pages and an attached summary of how the death occurred. The Office of the Attorney General has determined the four-page report and summary must be released to the public but any other documents submitted with the revised report are confidential under article 49.18(b). Although you claim the submitted custodial death report and summary are protected by sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code, the exceptions to disclosure found in the Act do not generally apply to information that other statutes make public. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 623 at 3 (1994), 525 at 3 (1989). Accordingly, the sheriff's office must release this information, which we have marked, pursuant to article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure.

Next, we note some of the remaining information is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The submitted information includes completed investigations that are subject to subsection 552.022(a)(1). The sheriff's office must release the completed investigations pursuant to subsection 552.022(a)(1) unless they are excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or are made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* Although you raise section 552.103 of the Government Code for the entirety of the submitted information, this section is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive section 552.103); Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Therefore, you may not withhold the information subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, as information subject to subsection 552.022(a)(1) may be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code, we will consider your argument under section 552.108 of the Government Code for the completed investigations. Further as section 552.101 makes information

confidential under the Act, we will consider the applicability of this exception to the information subject to section 552.022. We will also consider your claims for the information not subject to section 552.022.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code exempts from public disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes. Section 261.201 of the Family Code provides, in part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find Exhibit E was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001 (defining “abuse” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of chapter 261 of the Family Code as person under 18 years of age who is not and has not been married or who has not had the disabilities of minority removed for general purposes). Accordingly, we find this information is subject to chapter 261 of the Family Code. As you do not indicate the sheriff’s office has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information, we assume no such regulation exists. Given that assumption, we conclude Exhibit E is confidential pursuant to section 261.201 of the Family Code and must be withheld in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code.² *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code exempts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply

²As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

to information requested). You state Exhibit F pertains to a criminal investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on this representation and our review, we agree section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the remaining information in Exhibit F.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the basic “front-page” offense and arrest information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). See Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the sheriff’s office may withhold the remaining information in Exhibit F under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.³

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides, in part:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person’s office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

Gov’t Code § 552.103(a), (c). The governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception is applicable in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing that (1) litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the department received the request for information, and (2) the information at issue is related to that litigation. *Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, *writ ref’d n.r.e.*); Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4 (1990). The governmental body must meet both prongs of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a).

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

The question of whether litigation is reasonably anticipated must be determined on a case-by-case basis. *See* Open Records Decision No. 452 at 4 (1986). To establish litigation is reasonably anticipated, the governmental body must furnish concrete evidence that litigation involving a specific matter is realistically contemplated and is more than mere conjecture. *Id.* Concrete evidence to support a claim that litigation is reasonably anticipated may include, for example, the governmental body's receipt of a letter containing a specific threat to sue the governmental body from an attorney for a potential opposing party.⁴ Open Records Decision No. 555 (1990); *see* Open Records Decision No. 518 at 5 (1989) (litigation must be "realistically contemplated"). On the other hand, this office has determined that if an individual publicly threatens to bring suit against a governmental body, but does not actually take objective steps toward filing suit, litigation is not reasonably anticipated. Open Records Decision No. 331 (1982). Further, the fact that a potential opposing party has hired an attorney who makes a request for information does not establish that litigation is reasonably anticipated. Open Records Decision No. 361 (1983).

You state, and submit documentation showing, the requestor is an attorney for the spouse of the named deceased individual. You state as part of the request for information the requestor included a release form signed by the named individual's spouse, which provides the requested information "will be used or given out for the purposes of handling" the requestor's law firm's "duties in the investigation and possible litigation of claims in which [the spouse] is involved." We note the information at issue concerns the death of the named individual, which occurred while in the custody of the sheriff's office. After reviewing your arguments and the information at issue, and based on the totality of the circumstances, we conclude, for purposes of section 552.103, you have demonstrated the sheriff's office reasonably anticipated litigation when it received the request for information. The sheriff's office also represents Exhibit G is related to the anticipated litigation for purposes of section 552.103. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may withhold Exhibit G under section 552.103 of the Government Code.⁵

Generally, however, once information has been obtained by all parties to the litigation through discovery or otherwise, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). Thus, information that has either been obtained from or provided to all parties to the anticipated litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a) and must be disclosed. Further, the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends once the litigation has been concluded or is no longer

⁴In addition, this office has concluded litigation was reasonably anticipated when the potential opposing party took the following objective steps toward litigation: filed a complaint with the Equal Employment Opportunity Commission, *see* Open Records Decision No. 336 (1982); hired an attorney who made a demand for disputed payments and threatened to sue if the payments were not made promptly, *see* Open Records Decision No. 346 (1982); and threatened to sue on several occasions and hired an attorney, *see* Open Records Decision No. 288 (1981).

⁵As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining argument against disclosure of this information.

anticipated. *See* Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 350 (1982).

In summary, to the extent the grand jury subpoenas and information obtained pursuant to grand jury subpoenas are in the custody of the sheriff's office as an agent for the grand jury, these records are in the grand jury's constructive possession and are not subject to the Act. The sheriff's office must release the custodial death report, which we have marked, pursuant to article 49.18(b) of the Code of Criminal Procedure. The sheriff's office must withhold Exhibit E in its entirety under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. With the exception of basic information, the sheriff's office may withhold the remaining information in Exhibit F under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office may withhold Exhibit G under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Thompson
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PT/dls

Ref: ID# 534277

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)