



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

September 3, 2014

Ms. Michelle T. Rangel
Assistant County Attorney
Fort Bend County
401 Jackson Street, Third Floor
Richmond, Texas 77469

OR2014-15462

Dear Ms. Rangel:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 534871.

The Fort Bend County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for (1) report number 14-15231, involving a named individual, and (2) all records involving the requestor and the same named individual during the last five years. You state the sheriff's office will release some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82.

A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. We note, however, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person does not implicate the privacy interest of the individual and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. In addition, active warrant information or other information relating to an individual's current involvement in the criminal justice system does not constitute criminal history information for the purposes of section 552.101. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement in the criminal justice system).

The present request, in part, requires the sheriff's office to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individual named in the request, thus implicating the named individual's right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the sheriff's office maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff's office must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, you have submitted records that do not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, as well as the specifically requested report. This information does not implicate the named individual's privacy. Therefore, this information is not confidential under common-law privacy as a compilation of criminal history, and the sheriff's office may not withhold it under section 552.101 on that ground. We will, however, consider your arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. CHRI means "information collected about a person by a criminal justice agency that consists of identifiable descriptions and notations of arrests, detentions, indictments, informations, and other formal criminal charges and their dispositions." Gov't Code § 411.082(2). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI obtained from the National Crime Information Center network or other states. *See* 28 C.F.R. § 20.21. The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Texas Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except DPS may disseminate this

information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083.

Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with Government Code chapter 411, subchapter F. We note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to an individual's current involvement in the criminal justice system. *Id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement with the criminal justice system). Further, CHRI does not include driving record information. *Id.* § 411.082(2)(B).

Upon review, we find the sheriff's office has failed to demonstrate any of the information at issue constitutes confidential CHRI. Therefore, the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the information at issue under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information made confidential by section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides in relevant part as follows:

[T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Id. § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find some of the submitted information consists of files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, or working papers used or developed by the department in an investigation under chapter 261. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of section 261.201); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of section 261.201). Thus, the information at issue is confidential under section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. You do not indicate the sheriff's office has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such rule exists. Given that assumption, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction

with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code.² See Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

As discussed above, information protected by common-law privacy is subject to the two-part test discussed in *Industrial Foundation*. See *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. See *id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); see also *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977).

You state call slip number P120920094 and offense report number 14-15231, along with its related call slip, relate to pending criminal cases. Based on your representation and our review, we find the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. See *Houston Chronicle Publ’g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref’d n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976).

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . it is information that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate that the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. See *id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested).

You state some of the remaining information relates to a closed case that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication. Thus, we agree that section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information we have marked.

²As we make this determination, we do not address your remaining arguments regarding disclosure of this information.

We note, however, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure “basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime.” *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic front-page information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-87; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information does not include information subject to section 552.130 of the Government Code. See ORD 127. Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the sheriff’s office may withhold call slip number P120920094 and offense report number 14-15231, along with its related call slip, under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and the information we have marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.³

Section 552.130 provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. See Gov’t Code § 552.130. Upon review, we find portions of the remaining information consist of motor vehicle record information. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the sheriff’s office maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff’s office must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff’s office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with (1) section 261.201(a) of the Family Code and (2) common-law privacy. With the exception of the basic information, the sheriff’s office may withhold call slip number P120920094 and offense report number 14-15231, along with its related call slip, under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and the information we have marked under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The sheriff’s office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.⁴

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

⁴We note the information to be released includes social security numbers. Section 552.147 of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person’s social security number, other than the requestor’s, without requesting a decision from this office. See Gov’t Code § 552.147(b).

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 534871

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)