



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

September 16, 2014

Ms. J. Diaz  
Assistant City Attorney  
City of Dallas  
1400 South Lamar Street  
Dallas, Texas 75215

OR2014-16356

Dear Ms. Diaz:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 536164 (ORR No. 2014-3957).

The Dallas Police Department (the "department") received a request for information regarding a specified incident. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code. Section 261.201 provides, in part, as follows:

(a) Except as provided by Section 261.203, the following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume that the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. See Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

...

(h) This section does not apply to an investigation of child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under Chapter 42, Human Resources Code.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a), (h). You contend the submitted information is confidential under section 261.201(a). In this instance, however, the information at issue is related to an investigation of alleged abuse or neglect that occurred in a child care facility that was regulated by the Texas Department of Family and Protective Services under chapter 42 of the Human Resources Code at the time of the incident in question. Section 261.201 does not apply to an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect in a home or facility regulated under chapter 42. *Id.* § 261.201(h). Therefore, section 261.201(a) of the Family Code is not applicable to the submitted information, and the department may not withhold the submitted information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.108(b) of the Government Code provides in part the following:

An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if:

(1) release of the internal record or notation would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution; [or]

(2) the internal record or notation relates to law enforcement only in relation to an investigation that did not result in conviction or deferred adjudication[.]

Gov't Code § 552.108(b)(1)-(2). A governmental body raising section 552.108 must reasonably explain the applicability of section 552.108. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). A governmental body claiming subsection 552.108(b)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* § 552.108(b)(1); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You have not explained how release of the submitted information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. Thus, you have failed to

demonstrate the applicability of subsection 552.108(b)(1). A governmental body claiming subsection 552.108(b)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that has concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See* Gov't Code § 552.108(b)(2). You have not explained how the submitted information pertains to an investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. Thus, you have failed to demonstrate the applicability of subsection 552.108(b)(2). Therefore, the department may not withhold the submitted information under either subsection 552.108(b)(1) or subsection 552.108(b)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by section 773.091 of the Health and Safety Code, which provides in part:

(a) A communication between certified emergency medical services personnel or a physician providing medical supervision and a patient that is made in the course of providing emergency medical services to the patient is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(b) Records of the identity, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by emergency medical services personnel or by a physician providing medical supervision that are created by the emergency medical services personnel or physician or maintained by an emergency medical services provider are confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

...

(g) The privilege of confidentiality under this section does not extend to information regarding the presence, nature of injury or illness, age, sex, occupation, and city of residence of a patient who is receiving emergency medical services.

Health & Safety Code § 773.091(a)-(b), (g). The submitted information contains a record made and maintained by emergency medical services ("EMS") personnel. Upon review, we find section 773.091 is applicable to the information we have marked. Thus, with the exception of the information subject to section 773.091(g), which is not confidential, the department must withhold the marked EMS record under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of

this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find a portion of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the department must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of the information subject to section 773.091(g), which is not confidential, the department must withhold the marked EMS record under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 773.091(b) of the Health and Safety Code. The department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The department must release the remaining information.<sup>2</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Kristi L. Godden  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

KLK/cz

---

<sup>2</sup>We note some of the information being released contains information regarding the requestor's clients to which the requestor has a right of access. *See* Gov't Code § 552.023(a) (person or person's authorized representative has special right of access to information held by governmental body that relates to person and that is protected from public disclosure by laws intended to protect person's privacy interests); Open Records Decision No. 481 at 4 (1987) (privacy theories not implicated when individual requests information concerning himself).

Ms. J. Diaz - Page 5

Ref: ID# 536164

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)