



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 10, 2014

Ms. Elizabeth Hanshaw Winn
Assistant County Attorney
Travis County
P.O. Box 1748
Austin, Texas 78767-1748

OR2014-18209

Dear Ms. Winn:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 538926.

The Travis County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information involving a named individual or two specified addresses during a particular time period. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

You inform us some of the requested information was the subject of a previous request for information, as a result of which this office issued Open Records Letter No. 2013-21281 (2013). In Open Records Letter No. 2013-21281, we determined to the extent the sheriff's office maintains law enforcement records depicting any of the named individuals as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff's office must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. You seek to rely on the prior ruling as a previous determination. However, the instant request only involves one of the individuals named in the prior request, and the named individual is not listed as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant in the information subject to the prior ruling. Thus, there has been a change in the law, facts, or circumstances on which the previous ruling was based. Accordingly, the sheriff's office may not rely on Open Records Letter No. 2013-21281 as a previous determination. *See* Open

Records Decision No. 673 (2001) (so long as law, facts, and circumstances on which prior ruling was based have not changed, first type of previous determination exists where requested information is precisely same information as was addressed in prior attorney general ruling, ruling is addressed to same governmental body, and ruling concludes that information is or is not excepted from disclosure). Therefore, we will address your arguments against disclosure of the requested information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82.

Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. A compilation of an individual’s criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep’t of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual’s criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Moreover, we find a compilation of a private citizen’s criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public.

The present request requires the sheriff’s office to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the individual named in the request, thus implicating the named individual’s right to privacy. Therefore, to the extent the sheriff’s office maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff’s office must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, information that refers to an individual solely as a victim, witness, or involved person is not a compilation of the individual’s criminal history and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on that basis. We note you have submitted information that does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information does not consist of a compilation of the named individual’s criminal history, and the sheriff’s office may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy as a compilation of an individual’s criminal history. Accordingly, we will address your arguments against disclosure of this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as section 261.201 of the Family Code, which provides, in relevant part, as follows:

(a) [T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under [the Act], and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

(1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] and the identity of the person making the report; and

(2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under [chapter 261 of the Family Code] or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of reports of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect confidential under section 261.201(a)(1) of the Family Code. *See id.* § 261.001(1), (4) (defining “abuse” and “neglect” for purposes of chapter 261 of Family Code); *see also id.* § 101.003(a) (defining “child” for purposes of section 261.201 of Family Code). You have not indicated the sheriff’s office has adopted a rule governing the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such regulation exists. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. However, you have failed to demonstrate any of the remaining information is subject to section 261.201(a), and the sheriff’s office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

You next raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 58.007 of the Family Code, which protects juvenile law enforcement records related to delinquent conduct and conduct indicating a need for supervision that occurred on or after September 1, 1997. Section 58.007 provides, in relevant part:

(c) Except as provided by Subsection (d), law enforcement records and files concerning a child and information stored, by electronic means or otherwise, concerning the child from which a record or file could be generated may not be disclosed to the public and shall be:

(1) if maintained on paper or microfilm, kept separate from adult files and records;

(2) if maintained electronically in the same computer system as records or files relating to adults, be accessible under controls that are separate and distinct from controls to access electronic data concerning adults; and

(3) maintained on a local basis only and not sent to a central state or federal depository, except as provided by Subchapters B, D, and E.

Id. § 58.007(c). For purposes of section 58.007(c), “child” means a person who is ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age at the time of the reported conduct. *See id.* § 51.02(2). Section 58.007(c) is not applicable to information that relates to a juvenile as a complainant, victim, witness, or other involved party and not as a suspect or offender.

You argue some of the submitted information is subject to section 58.007(c) of the Family Code. However, none of the information at issue identifies an individual who was ten years of age or older and under seventeen years of age as a suspect or offender. Thus, the sheriff’s office has failed to demonstrate how any of the information at issue is confidential under section 58.007(c) of the Family Code and the sheriff’s office may not withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release.¹ *See Gov’t Code* § 552.130. The sheriff’s office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the sheriff’s office maintains law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the sheriff’s office must withhold any such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff’s office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201(a) of the Family Code. The sheriff’s office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception such as section 552.130 on behalf of a governmental body. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 at 2 (1987), 480 at 5 (1987).*

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Cindy Nettles
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CN/dls

Ref: ID# 538926

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)