



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

October 16, 2014

Ms. Regina Edwards  
First Assistant City Attorney  
Office of the City Attorney  
City of Carrollton  
1945 East Jackson Road  
Carrollton, Texas 75006

OR2014-18638

Dear Ms. Edwards:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 540571 (ORR# 3253).

The City of Carrollton (the "city") received a request for information pertaining to a specified arrest of a named individual. You state the city has released some of the requested information. You claim some of the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.130, 552.137, and 552.147 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). You state the submitted information pertains to an active criminal investigation or prosecution.

---

<sup>1</sup>Although you do not raise section 552.101 of the Government Code in your brief, we understand you to raise this exception based on your markings.

Based on your representation, we conclude the release of the information you have marked would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information you marked.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information includes, among other items, a detailed description of the offense. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. In this instance, you have marked most of the narrative portion of the submitted incident report as information you seek to withhold under section 552.108. The remaining information at issue does not contain information sufficient to satisfy the requirement that a “detailed description of the offense” be released as basic information. *See id.* Accordingly, we determine the city must release a sufficient portion of the narrative to encompass a detailed description of the offense. Thus, with the exception of the basic information, the city may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information you have marked, and the additional information we marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

The remaining documents also include information that is subject to section 552.136 of the Government Code.<sup>2</sup> Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “Notwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” Gov't Code § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). Accordingly, the city must withhold the partial credit card numbers we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

<sup>3</sup>As our ruling is dispositive for this information, we need not address your claim under section 552.101 of the Government Code against its disclosure.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision No. 545 (1990) (common-law privacy protects mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history). Upon review, we agree the remaining information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the city must withhold the remaining information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.137 excepts from disclosure “an e-mail address of a member of the public that is provided for the purpose of communicating electronically with a governmental body” unless the member of the public consents to its release or the e-mail address is of a type specifically excluded by subsection (c). *See id.* § 552.137(a)-(c). Section 552.137 is not applicable to an e-mail address that a governmental entity maintains for one of its officials or employees. The e-mail address you have marked is maintained by the city for one of its employees. Accordingly, the city may not withhold the marked e-mail address under section 552.137 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147(a) of the Government Code excepts the social security number of a living individual from public disclosure. Gov’t Code § 552.147(a). Accordingly, the city may withhold the social security number you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of the basic information, the city may withhold the information you marked under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code. The city must withhold (1) the motor vehicle record information you marked, and the additional information we marked, under section 552.130 of the Government Code; (2) the partial credit card numbers we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code; and (3) the remaining information you marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city may withhold the social security number you have marked under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Claire V. Morris Sloan  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 540571

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)