



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

October 24, 2014

Ms. Mary Ann Powell  
Counsel for the Memorial Villages Police Department  
Olson & Olson, L.L.P.  
2727 Allen Parkway, Suite 600  
Houston, Texas 77019-2133

OR2014-19209

Dear Ms. Powell:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 540615 (MVPD14-001).

The Memorial Villages Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for all files related to a named individual. You state some information will be released to the requestor. You state you will redact motor vehicle information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code and social security numbers pursuant to section 552.147 of the Government Code.<sup>1</sup> You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if it (1) contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication

---

<sup>1</sup>Section 552.130(c) allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *Id.* § 552.130(d), (e). In addition, section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *See id.* § 552.147(b).

of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be met. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. The request requires the department to compile unspecified law enforcement records concerning the named individual. We find such a request for unspecified law enforcement records implicates the individual's right to privacy. Accordingly, to the extent the department maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.<sup>2</sup> We note you have submitted reports that do not depict the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. Thus, these reports are not part of a criminal history compilation and may not be withheld under section 552.101 on this basis. Accordingly, we will address your remaining arguments for this information.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). You state the information at issue relates to concluded incidents that did not result in convictions or deferred adjudications. Based on your representation and our review, we find section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code is applicable to this information.

As you acknowledge, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure "basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime." *Id.* § 552.108(c). Section 552.108(c) refers to the basic "front-page" information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*. *See* 531 S.W.2d 177, 186-187 (Tex. Civ. App.—[14th Dist.] 1975). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the information at issue under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.<sup>3</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure.

<sup>3</sup>As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure.

We understand you to assert some of the basic information is subject to common-law privacy. As noted above, section 552.101 of the Government Code encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which is subject to the two-part test discussed above. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. See 540 S.W.2d at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. See Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). Upon review, we find the information we marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, in releasing basic information, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, you have failed to demonstrate the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Thus, the remaining information at issue may not be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

In summary, to the extent the department maintains unspecified law enforcement records depicting the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the department must withhold such information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy. With the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the information at issue under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. Further, in releasing basic information, the department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Lauren Dahlstein  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

LMD/som

Ref: ID# 540615

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)