



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

October 31, 2014

Ms. Donna L. Clarke
Assistant Criminal District Attorney
Civil Division
County of Lubbock
916 Main Street, Suite 1101
Lubbock, Texas 79401

OR2014-19724

Dear Ms. Clarke:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 541363.

The Lubbock County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for "any information, from the time of arrest until disposition of [a specified case]." You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.111 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.¹

Initially, we understand the requested information relates to a completed investigation. Section 552.022(a)(1) of the Government Code provides for the required disclosure of "a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body," unless it is excepted by section 552.108 of the Government Code or made confidential under the Act or other law. Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). You raise section 552.111 of the Government Code along with the attorney work-product privilege. However,

¹We assume the "representative sample" of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

section 552.111 is a discretionary exception that protects a governmental body's interests and does not make information confidential under the Act. Open Records Decision Nos. 677 at 8 (2002) (attorney work-product privilege under section 552.111 may be waived), 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions in general). Accordingly, the district attorney's office may not withhold the requested information under section 552.111 of the Government Code. We note the attorney work-product privilege is found at rule 192.5 of the Texas Rules of Civil Procedure, which has been held to be other law within the meaning of section 552.022. *See In re City of Georgetown*, 53 S.W.3d 328 (Tex. 2001). However, those rules are applicable only to "actions of a civil nature." *See* TEX. R. CIV. P. 2. Thus, because the submitted information pertains to a criminal case, rule 192.5 is not applicable to the submitted information. Therefore, the district attorney's office may not withhold the submitted information on the basis of the work-product privilege in Texas Rule of Civil Procedure 192.5. Nonetheless, because information subject to section 552.022(a)(1) may be withheld under section 552.108 of the Government Code, we will consider your assertion of that exception.

Section 552.108 of the Government Code states, in pertinent part, the following:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted [from required public disclosure] if:

...

(4) it is information that:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

...

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted [from required public disclosure] if:

...

(3) the internal record or notation:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(4), (b)(3). A governmental body claiming an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). In *Curry v. Walker*, 873 S.W.2d 379 (Tex. 1994), the Texas Supreme Court held a request for a district attorney's "entire litigation file" was "too broad" and, quoting *National Union Fire Insurance Co. v. Valdez*, 863 S.W.2d 458, 460 (Tex. 1993), held "the decision as to what to include in [the file] necessarily reveals the attorney's thought processes concerning the prosecution or defense of the case." 873 S.W.2d at 380. You indicate the request for information encompasses the entire prosecution file of the district attorney's office for the specified case. You further state the submitted information reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state in the case at issue. Upon review, we conclude sections 552.108(a)(4) and (b)(3) of the Government Code are applicable to the information at issue.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). Therefore, with the exception of basic information, the district attorney's office may withhold the submitted information under sections 552.108(a)(4) and (b)(3) of the Government Code and the court's ruling in *Curry*.

We understand you to claim the basic information is confidential pursuant to the doctrine of common-law privacy. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. In Open Records Decision No. 393 (1983), this office concluded information that

either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense must be withheld under common-law privacy. ORD 393 at 2; *see* Open Records Decision No. 339 (1982); *see also Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d at 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information). Upon review, we find no portion of the basic information is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate concern to the public. Accordingly, the district attorney's office may not withhold any of the basic information under section 552.101 on the basis of common-law privacy.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, which must be released, the district attorney's office may withhold the submitted information under sections 552.108(a)(4) and (b)(3) of the Government Code and the court's ruling in *Curry*.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Joseph Behnke
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

JB/som

Ref: ID# 541363

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)