



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 3, 2014

Mr. Richard A. McCracken
Counsel for the City of Watauga
Law Offices of Evans, Daniel, Moore, Evans & Lazarus
115 West Second Street, Suite 202
Fort Worth, Texas 76102

OR2014-19887

Dear Mr. McCracken:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 541773 (Request No. 14-352).

The Watauga Police Department (the "department"), which you represent, received a request for all reports involving a specified address during a specified time period. The department states it has released some of the requested information. The department claims the submitted information is exempted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The department states the information in Exhibit B relates to an open criminal investigation. Upon review, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime.

See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information in Exhibit B.

Section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure information concerning an investigation that concluded in a result other than conviction or deferred adjudication. Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(2). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(2) must demonstrate the requested information relates to a criminal investigation that concluded in a final result other than a conviction or deferred adjudication. *See id.* § 552.301(e) (governmental body must provide comments explaining why exceptions raised should apply to information requested). The department states the information in Exhibit C relates to concluded cases that did not result in a conviction or deferred adjudication. Based on the department's representation, we conclude section 552.108(a)(2) is applicable to the information at issue.

Section 552.108, however, does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. *Id.* § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. *See* 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; *see also* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). We note basic information includes, among other categories of information, the identification and description of the complainant and a detailed description of the offense. *See* ORD 127 at 3-4. Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may generally withhold the information in Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and the information in Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code.¹

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses laws that make criminal history record information (“CHRI”) confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* at 10-12. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) of the Government Code authorize a criminal justice

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the department's remaining arguments against disclosure of this information.

agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for criminal justice purposes. *See id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Upon review, we find the information the department has marked constitutes confidential CHRI. This information must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. In Open Records Decision No. 393 (1983), this office concluded information that either identifies or tends to identify a victim of sexual assault or other sex-related offense must be withheld under common-law privacy. ORD 393 at 2; *see* Open Records Decision No. 339 (1982); *see also Morales v. Ellen*, 840 S.W.2d at 519 (Tex. App.—El Paso 1992, writ denied) (identity of witnesses to and victims of sexual harassment was highly intimate or embarrassing information and public did not have a legitimate interest in such information).

Upon review, we find some of the basic information, which we have marked, identifies a sexual assault victim, and therefore satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Additionally, we find the information we have marked in the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, the department has failed to demonstrate the remaining information it has marked is highly intimate or embarrassing and of no legitimate public interest. Thus, the department may not withhold the remaining information it has marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Some of the basic information may be subject to section 552.1175 of the Government Code.² Section 552.1175 provides, in part, the following:

(a) This section applies only to:

(1) peace officers as defined by Article 2.12, Code of Criminal Procedure[.]

(b) Information that relates to the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, date of birth, or social security number of an individual to whom this section applies, or that reveals whether the individual has family members is confidential and may not be disclosed to the public under this chapter if the individual to whom the information relates:

(1) chooses to restrict public access to the information; and

(2) notifies the governmental body of the individual's choice on a form provided by the governmental body, accompanied by evidence of the individual's status.

Gov't Code § 552.1175(a)(1), (b). We have marked some of the basic information that relates to a peace officer of another department. Accordingly, to the extent the information at issue pertains to a peace officer who elects to restrict access to his marked information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Conversely, if the officer at issue does not elect to restrict access to his information in accordance with section 552.1175(b), the department may not withhold the information we have marked under section 552.1175.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's or driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information it has marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the information in Exhibit B under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code and the information in Exhibit C under section 552.108(a)(2) of the Government Code. The department must withhold (1) the

²The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body. Open Records Decision No. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

information it has marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code; (2) the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (3) the information we have marked under section 552.1175 of the Government Code, to the extent the information at issue pertains to a peace officer who elects to restrict access to his marked information in accordance with section 552.1175(b); and (4) the motor vehicle record information it has marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The department must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



David L. Wheelus
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DLW/bhf

Ref: ID# 541773

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)