



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

November 19, 2014

Mr. Wesley N. Hinch
County Attorney
County of Liberty
P.O. Box 9127
Liberty, Texas 77575

OR2014-21040

Dear Mr. Hinch:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 546304.

The Liberty County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for the personnel file of a named sheriff's deputy. You state the sheriff's office has released some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.117, 552.115, and 552.130 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we note the submitted information contains a peace officer's Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("commission") identification number.² In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is

¹Although you cite to section 552.1175 of the Government Code for the information at issue, we note section 552.117 is the proper exception for information the sheriff's office holds in an employment capacity.

²The Texas Commission on Law Enforcement Officer Standards and Education was renamed the Texas Commission on Law Enforcement by the 83rd Legislature. *See* Act of May 6, 2013, 83rd Leg., R.S., ch. 93, § 1.01, 2013 Tex. Gen. Laws 174, 174.

not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. ORD 581 at 5. We understand a peace officer's commission identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in the commissioner's electronic database, and may be used as an access device number on the commissioner's website. Accordingly, we find the peace officer's commission identification number in the submitted information does not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the commission identification number is not subject to the Act and the sheriff's office is not required to release it to the requestor.

Next, we note the sheriff's office has redacted portions of the responsive information. You state the sheriff's office has redacted information subject to section 552.117 of the Government Code as permitted by section 552.024(c) of the Government Code.³ You also state the sheriff's office has redacted motor vehicle record information pursuant to section 552.130(c) of the Government Code.⁴ We understand the sheriff's office redacted an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code pursuant to Open Records Decision No. 684 (2009).⁵ However, you have also redacted dates of birth; a post office box number; current net monthly income; a work telephone number; a place of birth; and the year, make, model, color, and owner of a motor vehicle from the submitted documents. You do not assert, nor does our review of the records indicate, you have been authorized to withhold this information without seeking a ruling from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.301(a); Open Records Decision No. 673 (2001). Therefore, information must be submitted in a manner that enables this office to determine whether the information comes within the scope of an exception to disclosure. In this instance, we can discern the nature of the redacted information; thus, being deprived of this information does not inhibit our ability to make a ruling. In the future, however, the sheriff's office should refrain from redacting any information it is not authorized to withhold in seeking an open records ruling. Failure to do so may result in the presumption the redacted information is public. *See* Gov't Code § 552.302.

³Section 552.117 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure the home addresses and telephone numbers, emergency contact information, social security numbers, and family member information of a peace officer, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with sections 552.024 and 552.1175 of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). Section 552.024 of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to withhold information subject to section 552.117 without requesting a decision from this office if the current or former employee or official chooses not to allow public access to the information. *See id.* § 552.024(c).

⁴Section 552.130(c) of the Government Code allows a governmental body to redact the information described in subsection 552.130(a) without the necessity of seeking a decision from the attorney general. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(c). If a governmental body redacts such information, it must notify the requestor in accordance with section 552.130(e). *See id.* § 552.130(d), (e).

⁵Open Records Decision No. 684 is a previous determination to all governmental bodies authorizing them to withhold certain information, including an e-mail address of a member of the public under section 552.137 of the Government Code, without the necessity of requesting an attorney general decision.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.” Gov’t Code § 552.101. This exception encompasses information other statutes make confidential. The submitted information contains L-2 Declaration of Medical Condition and L-3 Declaration of Psychological and Emotional Health forms required by the commission. These forms are confidential under section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code, which is encompassed by section 552.101 of the Government Code. Section 1701.306 provides the following:

(a) The commission may not issue a license to a person unless the person is examined by:

(1) a licensed psychologist or by a psychiatrist who declares in writing that the person is in satisfactory psychological and emotional health to serve as the type of officer for which a license is sought; and

(2) a licensed physician who declares in writing that the person does not show any trace of drug dependency or illegal drug use after a blood test or other medical test.

(b) An agency hiring a person for whom a license is sought shall select the examining physician and the examining psychologist or psychiatrist. The agency shall prepare a report of each declaration required by Subsection (a) and shall maintain a copy of the report on file in a format readily accessible to the commission. A declaration is not public information.

Occ. Code § 1701.306(a)-(b). Therefore, the sheriff’s office must withhold the submitted L-2 and L-3 declaration forms, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information (“CHRI”) generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety (“DPS”) maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in

chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. We note section 411.083 does not apply to driving record information. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B). Upon review, we find some of the submitted information, which we have marked, consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Thus, the sheriff's office must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. However, we find you have not demonstrated how any portion of the remaining information consists of CHRI for purposes of chapter 411 of the Government Code, and the sheriff's office may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. The doctrine of common-law privacy protects a compilation of an individual's criminal history, which is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. United States Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (when considering prong regarding individual's privacy interest, court recognized distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of information and noted individual has significant privacy interest in compilation of one's criminal history). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. However, criminal history information provided by a peace officer as part of an application for employment with the sheriff's office was not compiled by any governmental body. Further, when a peace officer's criminal history information is compiled in the course of the officer's pre-employment screening, there is a legitimate public interest in the information. We note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf. Gov't Code* § 411.082(2)(B) (criminal history record information does not include driving record information). Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See Open Records Decision No. 455* (1987). This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is excepted from required public disclosure under common-law privacy. *See Open Records Decision Nos. 545* (1990) (deferred compensation information, participation in voluntary investment program, election of optional insurance coverage, mortgage payments, assets, bills, and credit history), *523* (1989) (common-law

privacy protects credit reports, financial statements, and other personal financial information), 373 (1983) (sources of income not related to financial transaction between individual and governmental body protected under common-law privacy). However, there is a legitimate public interest in the essential facts about a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body. *See* ORD 545 (financial information pertaining to receipt of funds from governmental body or debts owed to governmental body not protected by common-law privacy). Upon review, we find some of the remaining information satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Therefore, the sheriff's office must withhold this information, which we have marked, under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. However, we find you have not demonstrated how any of the remaining information at issue is highly intimate or embarrassing and not of legitimate public concern. Thus, the sheriff's office may not withhold any portion of the remaining information under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

You raise section 552.115 of the Government Code for the submitted birth certificate. Section 552.115 excepts from disclosure “[a] birth or death record maintained by the bureau of vital statistics of the Texas Department of Health or a local registration official[.]” Gov’t Code § 552.115(a). Section 552.115 is applicable only to information maintained by the bureau of vital statistics or local registration officials. *See* Open Records Decision No. 338 (1982) (finding that statutory predecessor to section 552.115 excepted only those birth and death records which are maintained by the bureau of vital statistics and local registration officials). Because section 552.115 does not apply to information held by the sheriff's office, the submitted birth certificate may not be withheld on this basis.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy.”⁶ Gov’t Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336 (Tex. 2010). Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the employee's date of birth we have marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home address, home telephone number, emergency contact information, and social security number of a peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with sections 552.024 and 552.1175 of the Government Code. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.117(a)(2).

⁶The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Section 552.117(a)(2) applies to peace officers as defined by article 2.12 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. We note section 552.117 is also applicable to personal cellular telephone numbers, provided the cellular telephone service is not paid for by a governmental body. *See* Open Records Decision No. 506 at 5-6 (1988) (section 552.117 not applicable to cellular telephone numbers paid for by governmental body and intended for official use). We also note a post office box number is not a “home address” for purposes of section 552.117(a). *See* Open Records Decision No. 622 at 4 (1994) (legislative history makes clear that purpose of Gov’t Code § 552.117 is to protect public employees from being harassed at home). Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code; however, the marked cellular telephone numbers may be withheld only if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov’t Code § 552.130. Accordingly, the sheriff’s office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the commission identification number within the submitted information is not subject to the Act and the sheriff’s office is not required to release it to the requestor. The sheriff’s office must withhold (1) the marked L-2 and L-3 declaration forms under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 1701.306 of the Occupations Code; (2) the CHRI we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code; (3) the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy; (4) the employee’s date of birth we marked under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code; (5) the information we marked under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code, but may withhold the marked cellular telephone numbers only if a governmental body does not pay for the cellular telephone service; and (6) the motor vehicle record information we marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The sheriff’s office must release the remaining responsive information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General’s Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for

providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink that reads "Claire Morris Sloan". The signature is written in a cursive style with a large, sweeping flourish at the end.

Claire V. Morris Sloan
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

CVMS/som

Ref: ID# 546304

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)