



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

November 24, 2014

Mr. T. Daniel Santee  
City Attorney  
City of Abilene  
P.O. Box 60  
Abilene, Texas 79604-0060

OR2014-21404

Dear Mr. Santee:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 544033.

The Abilene Police Department (the "department") received a request for the police report and photographs related to a specified incident. You state you have released some information to the requestor. You claim the remaining information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.101 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *See id.* at 681–82. The types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. However, the right to privacy is a personal right that "terminates upon the death of the person whose privacy is invaded;" therefore, it may not be asserted solely on behalf of a deceased individual. *Moore v. Charles B. Pierce Film Enters., Inc.*, 589 S.W.2d 489, 491 (Tex.

App.—Texarkana 1979, writ ref'd n.r.e.); *see also* Attorney General Opinions JM-229 (1984) (“the right of privacy lapses upon death”), H-917 (1976) (“We are . . . of the opinion that the Texas courts would follow the almost uniform rule of other jurisdictions that the right of privacy lapses upon death.”); Open Records Decision No. 272 at 1 (1981) (privacy rights lapse upon death). Upon review, we find the submitted information does not contain highly intimate or embarrassing information of a living individual. Accordingly, none of the submitted information may be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 also encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy. Constitutional privacy consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual’s interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. Open Records Decision No. 455 at 4 (1987). The first type protects an individual’s autonomy within “zones of privacy” which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual’s privacy interests and the public’s need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the “most intimate aspects of human affairs.” *Id.* at 5 (quoting *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). However, as noted above, the right to privacy is a personal right that lapses at death and therefore may not be asserted solely on behalf of a deceased individual. *See Moore*, 589 S.W.2d at 491; ORD 272 at 1. The United States Supreme Court, however, has determined that surviving family members can have a privacy interest in information relating to their deceased relatives. *See Nat’l Archives & Records Admin. v. Favish*, 541 U.S. 157 (2004). In this instance, you seek to withhold photographs of a deceased individual. You state you have notified the family of the deceased of the request for information and of their right to submit comments to this office. As of the date of this decision, we have not received any correspondence from the deceased individual’s family. Thus, we have no basis for determining the family’s privacy interest in the information at issue. Therefore, the department may not withhold the photographs under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with constitutional privacy. Additionally, we find you have not demonstrated that any of the remaining information falls within the zones of privacy or otherwise implicates an individual’s privacy interests for the purposes of constitutional privacy. Therefore, we conclude the department may not withhold any of the submitted information under section 552.101 in conjunction with constitutional privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s license, driver’s license, motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is

excepted from public release.<sup>1</sup> Gov't Code § 552.130. Upon review, we find the department must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Rustam Abedinzadeh  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

RA/dls

Ref: ID# 544033

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>1</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. See Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).