



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

December 11, 2014

Mr. L. Brian Narvaez  
Counsel for the City of Eagle Pass  
Langley & Banack Incorporated  
401 Quarry Street  
Eagle Pass, Texas 78852

OR2014-22488

Dear Mr. Narvaez:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 546532.

The City of Eagle Pass and the Eagle Pass Police Department (collectively, the "city"), which you represent, received a request for all police reports involving a named individual. We understand the city released some of the requested information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.130, 552.136, and 552.147 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. A compilation of an individual's criminal history is highly embarrassing information, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person. *Cf. U.S. Dep't of Justice v. Reporters Comm. for Freedom of the Press*, 489 U.S. 749, 764 (1989) (finding significant privacy interest in compilation of individual's criminal history by recognizing distinction between public records found in courthouse files and local police stations and compiled summary of criminal history

information). Furthermore, we find a compilation of a private citizen's criminal history is generally not of legitimate concern to the public. We note records relating to routine traffic violations are not considered criminal history information. *Cf.* Gov't Code § 411.082 (2)(B) (criminal history record information does not include driving record information).

The present request seeks unspecified law enforcement records pertaining to a named individual. This request requires the city to compile the named individual's criminal history and implicates the privacy of the named individual. Therefore, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

We note, however, you have submitted information that does not list the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant. This information is not part of a criminal history compilation and, thus, does not implicate this individual's right to privacy. As such, the city may not withhold this information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on this basis. Accordingly, we will address your remaining arguments for this information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses laws that make criminal history record information ("CHRI") confidential. CHRI generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center is confidential under federal and state law. Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 at 7 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual law with respect to CHRI it generates. *Id.* at 10–12. Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) of the Government Code authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for criminal justice purposes. *See id.* § 411.089(b)(1). We note section 411.083 does not apply to active warrant information or other information relating to one's current involvement with the criminal justice system. *See id.* § 411.081(b) (police department allowed to disclose information pertaining to person's current involvement in the criminal justice system). Further, CHRI does not include driving record information. *See id.* § 411.082(2)(B). Upon review, we find the information we have marked must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law. However, we find none of the remaining information consists of CHRI for the purposes of chapter 411. Accordingly, the city may not withhold any of the remaining information under section 552.101 of the Government Code on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses section 560.003 of the Government Code, which provides that "[a] biometric identifier in the possession of a governmental body is exempt from disclosure under [the Act]." *See id.* § 560.003; *see also*

*id.* §§ 560.001(1) (defining “biometric identifier” to include fingerprints), .002(1)(A) (governmental body may not sell, lease, or otherwise disclose individual’s biometric identifier to another person unless individual consents to disclosure). Upon review, we find the fingerprints we have marked must be withheld under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses information protected by other statutes, including section 730.004 of the Transportation Code, which provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of law to the contrary, including chapter 552, Government Code, except as provided by sections 730.005-730.007, an agency may not disclose personal information about any person obtained by the agency in connection with a motor vehicle record.” Transp. Code § 730.004. Section 730.004 applies only to an “agency” that compiles or maintains motor vehicle records. *See id.* § 730.003(1). You have not established the city compiles or maintains motor vehicle records; therefore, section 730.004 does not apply to the city, and the city may not withhold the information at issue under section 552.101 on that basis.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy. As previously discussed, common-law privacy protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found.*, 540 S.W.2d at 685. To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. Additionally, this office has concluded some kinds of medical information are generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision No. 455 (1987). This office has found personal financial information not relating to a financial transaction between an individual and a governmental body is generally highly intimate or embarrassing. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 600 (1992), 545 (1990). Upon review, we find the information we have marked satisfies the standard articulated by the Texas Supreme Court in *Industrial Foundation*. Accordingly, the city must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator’s or driver’s license or permit, a motor vehicle title or registration, or a personal identification document issued by an agency of Texas or another state or country is excepted from public release. Gov’t Code § 552.130(a). Upon review, we find the city must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

Section 552.136 of the Government Code provides, “[n]otwithstanding any other provision of [the Act], a credit card, debit card, charge card, or access device number that is collected, assembled, or maintained by or for a governmental body is confidential.” *Id.* § 552.136(b); *see id.* § 552.136(a) (defining “access device”). This office has determined insurance policy

numbers are access device numbers for purposes of section 552.136. Upon review, the city must withhold the insurance policy numbers we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code.

Section 552.147(a) of the Government Code excepts the social security number of a living individual from public disclosure. *Id.* § 552.147. Upon review, we find the city may withhold the submitted social security numbers under section 552.147 of the Government Code.

In summary, to the extent the city maintains law enforcement records listing the named individual as a suspect, arrestee, or criminal defendant, the city must withhold such information under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The city must withhold (1) the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code and federal law, (2) the fingerprints we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 560.003 of the Government Code, (3) the information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy, (4) the motor vehicle record information we have marked under section 552.130 of the Government Code, and (5) the insurance policy numbers we have marked under section 552.136 of the Government Code. The city may withhold the submitted social security numbers under section 552.147 of the Government Code. The city must release the remaining information.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Megan G. Holloway  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

MGH/cbz

Ref: ID# 546532

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)