



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS
GREG ABBOTT

December 15, 2014

Mr. Steve Smeltzer
Assistant General Counsel
Office of the General Counsel
Texas Department of Criminal Justice
P.O. Box 4004
Huntsville, Texas 77342-4004

OR2014-22671

Dear Mr. Smeltzer:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 546887

The Texas Department of Criminal Justice (the "department") received a request for a specified incident report, all video and audio recordings pertaining to that incident report, other categories of information pertaining to the specified incident, a specified excessive force report, all use of force reports involving named employees, and a copy of the T.L. Roach Jr. ISF fire evacuation diagram. You state you will release some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.108 and 552.134 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[a]n internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution . . . if . . . release of the internal record or notation would interfere with law enforcement or prosecution[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(b)(1). Section 552.108(b)(1) is intended to protect "information which, if released, would permit private citizens to anticipate weaknesses in a police department, avoid detection, jeopardize officer safety, and generally undermine police efforts to effectuate the laws of this State." *City of Fort Worth v. Cornyn*, 86 S.W.3d 320, 327 (Tex.

App.—Austin 2002, no pet.). To prevail on its claim that subsection 552.108(b)(1) excepts information from disclosure, a governmental body must do more than merely make a conclusory assertion that releasing the information would interfere with law enforcement. Instead, the governmental body must meet its burden of explaining how and why release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement and crime prevention. *See* Open Records Decision No. 562 at 10 (1990) (construing statutory predecessor). This office has concluded that section 552.108(b) excepts from public disclosure information relating to the security or operation of a law enforcement agency. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 531 (release of detailed use of force guidelines would unduly interfere with law enforcement), 252 (1980) (section 552.108 of the Government Code is designed to protect investigative techniques and procedures used in law enforcement), 143 (1976) (disclosure of specific operations or specialized equipment directly related to investigation or detection of crime may be excepted). Section 552.108(b)(1) is not applicable, however, to generally known policies and procedures. *See, e.g.,* ORDs 531 at 2-3 (Penal Code provisions, common law rules, and constitutional limitations on use of force not protected), 252 at 3 (governmental body failed to indicate why investigative procedures and techniques requested were any different from those commonly known).

You explain a portion of the submitted information consists of a map showing details of the internal design and layout of secure offender housing areas, as well as the designated route for a fire evacuation. You contend you “would never release a security memorandum outlining exactly what measures will be taken in a specific emergency situation because that would allow offenders or members of the public to exploit [your] response techniques against” you. You argue “fires are a common diversion tactic for offenders” and releasing the map would “negate [your] efforts to keep [your] response procedures confidential.” Based on your arguments and our review, we agree the release of the submitted information you have marked would interfere with law enforcement. Accordingly, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(b)(1).

You assert the remaining information you have marked is excepted from release under section 552.134 of the Government Code, which encompasses information relating to inmates of the department and states, in relevant part:

(a) Except as provided by Subsection (b) or by Section 552.029, information obtained or maintained by the [department] is excepted from the requirements of Section 552.021 if it is information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the department.

Gov't Code § 552.134(a). However, section 552.029 of the Government Code provides:

Notwithstanding [s]ection . . . 552.134, the following information about an inmate who is confined in a facility operated by or under a contract with the [department] is subject to required disclosure under Section 552.021:

. . .

(8) basic information regarding the death of an inmate in custody, an incident involving the use of force, or an alleged crime involving the inmate.

Id. § 552.029(8). You assert the remaining information consists of records pertaining to an inmate confined in a facility operated by the department. Upon review, we find portions of the remaining information are about an inmate for section 552.134 purposes. However, the remaining information pertains to the conduct of department employees and, therefore, is not “about an inmate” for purposes of section 552.134. Further, the information at issue pertains to incidents involving the use of force. Therefore, the department must release basic information about these incidents pursuant to section 552.029(8). Basic information includes the time and place of the incident, names of inmates and department officials directly involved, a brief narrative of the incident, a brief description of any injuries sustained, and information regarding criminal charges or disciplinary actions filed as a result of the incident. Accordingly, with the exception of basic information, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.134.

We note portions of the remaining information are subject to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the Medical Practice Act. Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision.”¹ Gov’t Code § 552.101. Section 552.101 encompasses information made confidential by statute, such as the Medical Practice Act (“MPA”), subtitle B of title 3 of the Occupations Code, which governs release of medical records. Section 159.002 of the MPA provides, in relevant part:

(a) A communication between a physician and a patient, relative to or in connection with any professional services as a physician to the patient, is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

¹The Office of the Attorney General will raise a mandatory exception on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

(b) A record of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that is created or maintained by a physician is confidential and privileged and may not be disclosed except as provided by this chapter.

(c) A person who receives information from a confidential communication or record as described by this chapter, other than a person listed in Section 159.004 who is acting on the patient's behalf, may not disclose the information except to the extent that disclosure is consistent with the authorized purposes for which the information was first obtained.

Occ. Code § 159.002(a)-(c). Information subject to the MPA includes both medical records and information obtained from those medical records. *See id.* §§ 159.002, .004. This office has concluded the protection afforded by section 159.002 extends only to records created by either a physician or someone under the supervision of a physician. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 487 (1987), 370 (1983), 343 (1982). Upon review, we find the information we marked constitutes records of the identity, diagnosis, evaluation, or treatment of a patient by a physician that were created or are maintained by a physician. Accordingly, the department must withhold information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA.

Section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home address and telephone number, emergency contact information, social security number, and family member information of current or former employees of the department or any division of the department, regardless of whether the current or former employee complies with section 552.1175 of the Government Code. Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(3). Upon review, we find the department must withhold the information we have marked pursuant to section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code.

In summary, the department may withhold the information you have marked under section 552.108(b)(1) of the Government Code. With the exception of basic information, the department must withhold the information we have marked under section 552.134 of the Government Code. The department must withhold the information we marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with the MPA and the information we have marked under section 552.117(a)(3) of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'D. Olds', with a long horizontal flourish extending to the right.

Daniel Olds
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DO/akg

Ref: ID# 546887

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)