



ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS  
GREG ABBOTT

December 30, 2014

Ms. Susan Fillion  
Assistant County Attorney  
Harris County  
1200 Baker Street, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
Houston, Texas 77002

OR2014-23543

Dear Ms. Fillion:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 548254 (HCSO File Number #14SO600239).

The Harris County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") received a request for information pertaining to a specified offense report and the personnel file of a former sergeant, including information pertaining to disciplinary actions and complaints filed against him. You claim the requested information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101 and 552.103 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted representative sample of information.<sup>1</sup>

Initially, we note the submitted information contains a peace officer's Texas Commission on Law Enforcement ("TCOLE") identification number. In Open Records Decision No. 581 (1990), this office determined certain computer information, such as source codes, documentation information, and other computer programming, that has no significance other than its use as a tool for the maintenance, manipulation, or protection of public property is not the kind of information made public under section 552.021 of the Government Code. We

---

<sup>1</sup>We assume the representative sample of records submitted to this office is truly representative of the requested records as a whole. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 499 (1988), 497 (1988). This open records letter does not reach, and therefore does not authorize the withholding of, any other requested records to the extent that those records contain substantially different types of information than that submitted to this office.

understand an officer's TCOLE identification number is a unique computer-generated number assigned to peace officers for identification in the commissioner's electronic database and may be used as an access device number on the TCOLE website. Accordingly, we find the officer's TCOLE identification number in the submitted information does not constitute public information under section 552.002 of the Government Code. Therefore, the TCOLE identification number is not subject to the Act and need not be released to the requestor.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses section 261.201(a) of the Family Code, which provides as follows:

[T]he following information is confidential, is not subject to public release under Chapter 552, Government Code, and may be disclosed only for purposes consistent with this code and applicable federal or state law or under rules adopted by an investigating agency:

- (1) a report of alleged or suspected abuse or neglect made under this chapter and the identity of the person making the report; and
- (2) except as otherwise provided in this section, the files, reports, records, communications, audiotapes, videotapes, and working papers used or developed in an investigation under this chapter or in providing services as a result of an investigation.

Fam. Code § 261.201(a). Upon review, we agree the information in Exhibit B1 was used or developed in an investigation of alleged or suspected child abuse or neglect under chapter 261 of the Family Code. *See id.* §§ 101.003(a) (defining "child" for purposes of section 261.201), 261.001(1), (4) (defining "abuse" and "neglect" for purposes of section 261.201 of Family Code). Thus, we find this information is within the scope of section 261.201 of the Family Code. You do not indicate the sheriff's office has adopted a rule that governs the release of this type of information. Therefore, we assume no such rule exists. Given that assumption, we conclude the sheriff's office must withhold the information in Exhibit B1 in its entirety under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. *See* Open Records Decision No. 440 at 2 (1986) (predecessor statute).

We note some of the information in Exhibit B2 is subject to section 552.022 of the Government Code. Section 552.022(a) provides, in relevant part:

(a) [T]he following categories of information are public information and not excepted from required disclosure unless made confidential under this chapter or other law:

(1) a completed report, audit, evaluation, or investigation made of, for, or by a governmental body, except as provided by Section 552.108[.]

Gov't Code § 552.022(a)(1). The submitted information includes completed evaluations and investigations that are subject to section 552.022(a)(1). The sheriff's office must release this information pursuant to section 552.022(a)(1) unless it is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code or is made confidential under the Act or other law. *See id.* You seek to withhold the information subject to section 552.022(a)(1) under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, section 552.103 is a discretionary exception and does not make information confidential under the Act. *See Dallas Area Rapid Transit v. Dallas Morning News*, 4 S.W.3d 469, 475-76 (Tex. App.—Dallas 1999, no pet.) (governmental body may waive Gov't Code § 552.103); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Therefore, the information subject to section 552.022(a)(1) may not be withheld under section 552.103 of the Government Code. However, because sections 552.101, 552.102, 552.117, and 552.130 of the Government Code make information confidential for purposes of section 552.022(a)(1), we will address the applicability of these sections to the information subject to section 552.022.<sup>2</sup>

Section 552.103 of the Government Code provides in relevant part as follows:

(a) Information is excepted from [required public disclosure] if it is information relating to litigation of a civil or criminal nature to which the state or a political subdivision is or may be a party or to which an officer or employee of the state or a political subdivision, as a consequence of the person's office or employment, is or may be a party.

...

(c) Information relating to litigation involving a governmental body or an officer or employee of a governmental body is excepted from disclosure under Subsection (a) only if the litigation is pending or reasonably anticipated on the date that the requestor applies to the officer for public information for access to or duplication of the information.

---

<sup>2</sup>The Office of the Attorney General will raise mandatory exceptions on behalf of a governmental body, but ordinarily will not raise other exceptions. Open Records Decision Nos. 481 (1987), 480 (1987), 470 (1987).

Gov't Code § 552.103(a), (c). The purpose of section 552.103 is to enable a governmental body to protect its position in litigation by forcing parties to obtain information relating to litigation through discovery procedures. *See* Open Records Decision No. 551 at 4-5 (1990). A governmental body has the burden of providing relevant facts and documents to show the section 552.103(a) exception applies in a particular situation. The test for meeting this burden is a showing (1) litigation was pending or reasonably anticipated on the date the governmental body received the request for information, and (2) the requested information is related to that litigation. *See Univ. of Tex. Law Sch. v. Tex. Legal Found.*, 958 S.W.2d 479, 481 (Tex. App.—Austin 1997, orig. proceeding); *Heard v. Houston Post Co.*, 684 S.W.2d 210, 212 (Tex. App.—Houston [1st Dist.] 1984, writ ref'd n.r.e.); ORD 551 at 4. The governmental body must meet both parts of this test for information to be excepted under section 552.103(a). *See* ORD 551 at 4.

This office has long held that “litigation,” for purposes of section 552.103, includes “contested cases” conducted in a quasi-judicial forum. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 474 (1987), 368 (1983), 336 (1982), 301 (1982). In determining whether an administrative proceeding is conducted in a quasi-judicial forum, some of the factors this office considers are whether the administrative proceeding provides for discovery, evidence to be heard, factual questions to be resolved, the making of a record, and whether the proceeding is an adjudicative forum of first jurisdiction with appellate review of the resulting decision without a re-adjudication of fact questions. *See* Open Records Decision No. 588 (1991).

You state the Harris County Civil Service Commission (the “commission”) provides a forum for employees to contest personnel actions taken against them, and upon a final determination by the commission, an employee may appeal by filing a petition in a Harris County district court. You further state during the process testimony is taken, factual questions are resolved, and a record is created. *See* Local Gov't Code §§ 158.037, .0371, .0121. You inform us the employee at issue has appealed his termination and initiated a case with the commission. You state a hearing has been set before the commission. You further state the notice of appeal was filed prior to the sheriff's office's receipt of the instant request for information. Based on your representations and our review, we find the hearing constitutes litigation of a judicial or quasi-judicial nature for purposes of section 552.103. *See generally* ORD 301 (discussing meaning of “litigation” under predecessor to section 552.103). Accordingly, we find the sheriff's office was involved in litigation on the date it received the request for information. Further, you state the information at issue relates to the issue in the pending hearing. Upon review of your arguments and the information at issue, we find the information at issue is related to litigation involving the sheriff's office that was pending on the date the request was received. Accordingly, we find the sheriff's office may withhold the remaining information in Exhibit B2 under section 552.103 of the Government Code.

Generally, however, once information has been obtained by all parties to the litigation through discovery or otherwise, no section 552.103(a) interest exists with respect to that information. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 349 (1982), 320 (1982). Thus, information that has either been obtained from or provided to all parties to the litigation is not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103(a) and must be disclosed. Further, the applicability of section 552.103(a) ends once the litigation has been concluded. *See* Attorney General Opinion MW-575 (1982); *see also* Open Records Decision No. 350 (1982).

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information protected by other statutes, such as chapter 411 of the Government Code, which makes confidential criminal history record information ("CHRI") generated by the National Crime Information Center or by the Texas Crime Information Center. *See id.* § 411.083(a). Title 28, part 20 of the Code of Federal Regulations governs the release of CHRI that states obtain from the federal government or other states. Open Records Decision No. 565 (1990). The federal regulations allow each state to follow its individual laws with respect to the CHRI it generates. *See id.* Section 411.083 of the Government Code deems confidential CHRI that the Department of Public Safety ("DPS") maintains, except that DPS may disseminate this information as provided in chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. *See* Gov't Code § 411.083. Sections 411.083(b)(1) and 411.089(a) authorize a criminal justice agency to obtain CHRI; however, a criminal justice agency may not release CHRI except to another criminal justice agency for a criminal justice purpose. *Id.* § 411.089(b)(1). Other entities specified in chapter 411 of the Government Code are entitled to obtain CHRI from DPS or another criminal justice agency; however, those entities may not release CHRI except as provided by chapter 411. *See generally id.* §§ 411.090-.127. Thus, any CHRI obtained from DPS or any other criminal justice agency must be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with chapter 411, subchapter F of the Government Code. Upon review, we find the information we have marked consists of CHRI that is confidential under section 411.083. Thus, the sheriff's office must withhold the marked information under section 552.101 in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information that is (1) highly intimate or embarrassing, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person and (2) not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). To demonstrate the applicability of common-law privacy, both prongs of this test must be satisfied. *Id.* at 681-82. Types of information considered intimate and embarrassing by the Texas Supreme Court are delineated in *Industrial Foundation*. *Id.* at 683. This office has also found that common-law privacy generally protects the identifying information of juvenile victims of abuse or neglect. *See* Open Records Decision No. 394 (1983); *cf.* Fam. Code § 261.201. Further, we have also determined common-law privacy generally protects the identities of juvenile offenders. *See* ORD 394; *cf.* Fam Code

§ 58.007(c). We note the responsive information includes the identifying information of juvenile victims of abuse or neglect and juvenile offenders. Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the identifying information of the juvenile victims of abuse or neglect and the juvenile offenders at issue, which includes, but is not limited to, the juveniles' names, home addresses, and home and cellular telephone numbers pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. In addition, the sheriff's office must withhold the identifying information of the family members of the juvenile victims of abuse or neglect and the juvenile offenders at issue, which includes, but is not limited to, the names, home addresses, and home, work, and cellular telephone numbers of any family members of these juveniles pursuant to section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.102(a) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information in a personnel file, the disclosure of which would constitute a clearly unwarranted invasion of personal privacy." Gov't Code § 552.102(a). The Texas Supreme Court held section 552.102(a) excepts from disclosure the dates of birth of state employees in the payroll database of the Texas Comptroller of Public Accounts. *Tex. Comptroller of Pub. Accounts v. Attorney Gen. of Tex.*, 354 S.W.3d 336, 348 (Tex. 2010). Upon review, we find the sheriff's office must withhold the dates of birth we have indicated under section 552.102(a) of the Government Code.

Section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code excepts from public disclosure the home addresses, home telephone numbers, emergency contact information, and social security number of a peace officer, as well as information that reveals whether the peace officer has family members, regardless of whether the peace officer complies with section 552.024 or section 552.1175 of the Government Code.<sup>3</sup> Gov't Code § 552.117(a)(2). The sheriff's office must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code.

Section 552.130 of the Government Code provides information relating to a motor vehicle operator's license, driver's license, motor vehicle title or registration, or personal identification document issued by an agency of this state or another state or country is excepted from public release. *See* Gov't Code § 552.130(a). Accordingly, the sheriff's office must withhold the motor vehicle record information we have indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code.

In summary, the sheriff's office must withhold the information in Exhibit B1 under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 261.201 of the Family Code. The sheriff's office may withhold the information we have marked in Exhibit B2 under section 552.103 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the

---

<sup>3</sup>"Peace officer" is defined by article 2.12 of the Texas Code of Criminal Procedure.

information we have marked under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with section 411.083 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law privacy. The sheriff's department must withhold the dates of birth we have indicated under section 552.102 of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must also withhold the information we have indicated under section 552.117(a)(2) of the Government Code. The sheriff's office must also withhold the motor vehicle record information we have indicated under section 552.130 of the Government Code. The remaining information must be released.<sup>4</sup>

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at [http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl\\_ruling\\_info.shtml](http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml), or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Daniel Olds  
Assistant Attorney General  
Open Records Division

DO/ds

Ref: ID# 548254

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor  
(w/o enclosures)

---

<sup>4</sup>The information being released contains social security numbers. Section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).