



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

January 7, 2016

Ms. Laura Anne Coats
Assistant District Attorney
Dallas County District Attorney's Office
133 North Riverfront Boulevard, LB-19
Dallas, Texas 75207-4399

OR2016-00557

Dear Ms. Coats:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 593157.

The Dallas County District Attorney's Office (the "district attorney's office") received a request for the complete case files for three specified cases. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.101, 552.108, 552.1325, and 552.130 of the Government Code. We have considered the exceptions you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "information considered to be confidential by law, either constitutional, statutory, or by judicial decision." Gov't Code § 552.101. This section encompasses information subject to chapter 550 of the Transportation Code. Section 550.065 applies only to a written report of an accident required under section 550.061, 550.062, or 601.004. Transp. Code § 550.065(a)(1). Chapter 550 requires the creation of a written report when the accident resulted in injury to or the death of a person or damage to the property of any person to the apparent extent of \$ 1,000 or more. *Id.* §§ 550.061 (operator's accident report), .062 (officer's accident report). An accident report is privileged and for the confidential use of the Texas Department of Transportation or a local governmental agency of Texas that has use for the information for accident prevention purposes. *Id.* § 550.065(b). However, a governmental entity may release an accident report in accordance with subsections (c) and (c-1). *Id.* § 550.065(c), (c-1).

Section 550.065(c) provides a governmental entity shall release an accident report to a person or entity listed under this subsection. *Id.* § 550.065(c).

We note the submitted information contains a CR-3 accident report form completed pursuant to chapter 550. In this instance, the requestor is not a person listed under section 550.065(c). Thus, the submitted accident report is confidential under section 550.065(b), and the district attorney's office must withhold it under section 552.101 of the Government Code. However, section 550.065(c-1) requires the district attorney's office to create a redacted accident report that may be requested by any person. *Id.* § 550.065(c-1). The redacted accident report may not include the information listed in subsection (f)(2). *Id.* Therefore, the requestor has a right of access to the redacted accident report. Although you assert section 552.108 of the Government Code to withhold this information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.,* Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because section 552.108 is a general exception under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under section 550.065(c-1) prevails and the district attorney's office may not withhold this information under section 552.108 of the Government Code. Thus, the district attorney's office must release the redacted accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c-1).

Section 552.108 of the Government Code states, in pertinent part, the following:

(a) Information held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime is excepted [from required public disclosure] if:

...

(4) it is information that:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

...

(b) An internal record or notation of a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that is maintained for internal use in matters relating to law enforcement or prosecution is excepted [from required public disclosure] if:

...

(3) the internal record or notation:

(A) is prepared by an attorney representing the state in anticipation of or in the course of preparing for criminal litigation; or

(B) reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state.

Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(4), (b)(3). A governmental body claiming an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 must reasonably explain how and why this exception is applicable to the information the governmental body seeks to withhold. *See id.* § 552.301(e)(1)(A); *Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706, 710 (Tex. 1977). In *Curry v. Walker*, 873 S.W.2d 379 (Tex. 1994), the Texas Supreme Court held a request for a district attorney's "entire litigation file" was "too broad" and, quoting *National Union Fire Insurance Co. v. Valdez*, 863 S.W.2d 458, 460 (Tex. 1993), held "the decision as to what to include in [the file] necessarily reveals the attorney's thought processes concerning the prosecution or defense of the case." 873 S.W.2d at 380. You state the request for information encompasses the entire prosecution files of the district attorney's office for the cases at issue. You further state the submitted information reflects the mental impressions or legal reasoning of an attorney representing the state in the cases at issue. Thus, upon review, we conclude section 552.108(a)(4) and section 552.108(b)(3) of the Government Code are applicable to the remaining information.

However, section 552.108 does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle Publishing Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). *See* Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information deemed public by *Houston Chronicle*). We note basic information includes, among other things, an arrestee's social security number, but does not include motor vehicle record information protected by section 552.130 of the Government Code. *See id.* at 3-4. Therefore, with the exception of basic information, the district attorney's office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(4) and section 552.108(b)(3) of the Government Code and the court's ruling in *Curry*.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of common-law privacy, which protects information if (1) the information contains highly intimate or embarrassing facts, the publication of which would be highly objectionable to a reasonable person, and (2) the information is not of legitimate concern to the public. *Indus. Found. v. Tex. Indus. Accident Bd.*, 540 S.W.2d 668, 685 (Tex. 1976). You contend the arrestee's social security number is excepted under common-law privacy. However, prior decisions of this office have determined that social security numbers are not the type of intimate and embarrassing information protected under common-law privacy. *See* Open Records Decision Nos. 622 (1994), 455 (1987), 254 (1980), 169 (1977). Therefore, the social security number at issue may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with common-law privacy.

Section 552.101 of the Government Code also encompasses the doctrine of constitutional privacy, which consists of two interrelated types of privacy: (1) the right to make certain kinds of decisions independently and (2) an individual's interest in avoiding disclosure of personal matters. *See* ORD 455 at 4. The first type protects an individual's autonomy within "zones of privacy," which include matters related to marriage, procreation, contraception, family relationships, and child rearing and education. *Id.* The second type of constitutional privacy requires a balancing between the individual's privacy interests and the public's need to know information of public concern. *Id.* The scope of information protected is narrower than that under the common-law doctrine of privacy; the information must concern the "most intimate aspects of human affairs." *Id.* at 5 (citing *Ramie v. City of Hedwig Village, Texas*, 765 F.2d 490 (5th Cir. 1985)). You contend the arrestee's social security number is excepted under constitutional privacy. However, this office has concluded that social security numbers are not excepted from disclosure under constitutional privacy. *See* ORDs 622, 455. Therefore, the social security number at issue may not be withheld under section 552.101 in conjunction with constitutional privacy.

In summary, the submitted accident report is confidential under section 550.065(b) of the Transportation Code, but the district attorney's office must release the redacted accident report to the requestor pursuant to section 550.065(c-1) of the Transportation Code. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the district attorney's office may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(4) and section 552.108(b)(3) of the Government Code and the court's ruling in *Curry*.¹

¹As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address your remaining arguments against disclosure. Furthermore, although basic information includes an arrestee's social security number, section 552.147(b) of the Government Code authorizes a governmental body to redact a living person's social security number from public release without the necessity of requesting a decision from this office under the Act. *See* Gov't Code § 552.147(b).

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'Tim Neal', written in a cursive style.

Tim Neal
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

TN/bhf

Ref: ID# 593157

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)