



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 1, 2016

Ms. Diana Spiller
Public Information Coordinator
Texas Commission on Jail Standards
P.O. Box 12985
Austin, Texas 78711

OR2016-02395

Dear Ms. Spiller:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 596094.

The Texas Commission on Jail Standards (the "commission") received a request for the inmate death reporting forms of twelve named individuals. You state you do not have information responsive to a portion of the request.¹ You state you are releasing some information. You claim the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code. We have considered the exception you claim and reviewed the submitted information.

Initially, we must address the commission's obligations under section 552.301 of the Government Code, which prescribes the procedures a governmental body must follow in asking this office to decide whether requested information is excepted from public disclosure. *See Gov't Code* § 552.301. Pursuant to section 552.301(e), a governmental body must submit to this office within fifteen business days of receiving an open records request (1) written comments stating the reasons why the stated exceptions apply that would allow the information to be withheld, (2) a copy of the written request for information, (3) a signed statement or sufficient evidence showing the date the governmental body received the written

¹The Act does not require a governmental body to release information that did not exist when it received a request, create responsive information, or obtain information that is not held by the governmental body or on its behalf. *See Economic Opportunities Dev. Corp. v. Bustamante*, 562 S.W.2d 266 (Tex. Civ. App.—San Antonio 1978, writ dismissed); Open Records Decision Nos. 605 at 2 (1992), 555 at 1 (1990), 452 at 3 (1986), 362 at 2 (1983).

request, and (4) a copy of the specific information requested or representative samples, labeled to indicate which exceptions apply to which parts of the documents. *See id.* § 552.301(e). The commission received the request for information on November 3, 2015. Accordingly, you were required to provide the information required by section 552.301(e) by November 25, 2015. However, the envelope in which the commission provided the information required by section 552.301(e) was received by our office on December 1, 2015. Accordingly, we conclude the commission failed to comply with the procedural requirements mandated by section 552.301 of the Government Code.

Pursuant to section 552.302 of the Government Code, a governmental body's failure to comply with the procedural requirements of section 552.301 results in the legal presumption that the requested information is public and must be released unless the governmental body demonstrates a compelling reason to withhold the information from disclosure. *See id.* § 552.302; *Simmons v. Kuzmich*, 166 S.W.3d 342, 350 (Tex. App.—Fort Worth 2005, no pet.); *Hancock v. State Bd. of Ins.*, 797 S.W.2d 379, 381 (Tex. App.—Austin 1990, no writ) (governmental body must make compelling demonstration to overcome presumption of openness pursuant to statutory predecessor to section 552.302); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 319 (1982), 586 (1991), 630 (1994). This office has held a compelling reason exists to withhold information when third-party interests are at stake or when information is made confidential by another source of law. *See* Open Records Decision No. 150 (1977) (construing predecessor statute). Although the commission claims an exception to disclosure under section 552.108 of the Government Code, this section is a discretionary exception to disclosure that protects a governmental body's interests and may be waived. *See* Open Records Decision No. 177 (1977) (governmental body may waive statutory predecessor to section 552.108); *see also* Open Records Decision Nos. 665 at 2 n.5 (2000) (discretionary exceptions generally), 663 at 5 (1999) (waiver of discretionary exceptions). Therefore, the commission may not withhold the submitted information based on its own law enforcement interest. However, the need of a governmental body other than the agency that is seeking an open records decision to withhold information under section 552.108 of the Government Code can provide a compelling reason to withhold information from disclosure. *See* ORD 586 at 3. Because you inform us, and provide documentation showing, the Harris County Sheriff's Office (the "sheriff's office") objects to the release of the information at issue, we will consider whether the commission may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108 on behalf of the sheriff's office.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure "[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]" Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). Where an agency is the custodian of information that would otherwise qualify for exception

under section 552.108 as information relating to the pending case of a different law enforcement agency, the custodian of the records may withhold the information only if it provides this office with (1) a demonstration that the information relates to the pending case, and (2) a representation from the entity with the law enforcement interest stating that entity wishes to withhold the information. You state the submitted information relates to pending criminal cases with the sheriff's office. You have provided us with an affidavit from the sheriff's office stating it wishes to withhold the information at issue because it relates to pending investigations and release of the information would interfere with those investigations. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests that are present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Based on these representations and our review, we conclude the commission may withhold the submitted information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code on behalf of the sheriff's office.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



Paige Lay
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

PL/dls

Ref: ID# 596094

Enc. Submitted documents

cc: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)