



KEN PAXTON
ATTORNEY GENERAL OF TEXAS

February 4, 2016

Ms. Linda A. Samples
Assistant City Attorney
Office of the City Attorney
The City of El Paso
P.O. Box 1890
El Paso, Texas 79950-1890

OR2016-02727

Dear Ms. Samples:

You ask whether certain information is subject to required public disclosure under the Public Information Act (the "Act"), chapter 552 of the Government Code. Your request was assigned ID# 596852 (Ref No. 15-1026-6848).

The El Paso Police Department (the "department") received a request for information relating to a specified incident. The department states it has released some of the requested information. The department claims the submitted information is excepted from disclosure under sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code.¹ We have considered the exceptions the department claims and reviewed the submitted information.

Article 2.139 of the Code of Criminal Procedure, as added by House Bill 3791 by the 84th Texas Legislature,² provides:

A person stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under Section 49.04, 49.045, 49.07, or 49.08, Penal Code, is entitled to receive from a law enforcement agency employing the peace officer who made the

¹Although the department raises section 552.101 of the Government Code in conjunction with common-law and constitutional privacy, the department has not submitted arguments explaining how common-law or constitutional privacy applies to the submitted information. Therefore, we assume the department has withdrawn these claims. *See* Gov't Code §§ 552.301, .302.

²Act of May 30, 2015, 84th Leg., R.S., ch. 1124, § 1 (codified at Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.139).

stop or arrest a copy of any video made by or at the direction of the officer that contains footage of:

- (1) the stop;
- (2) the arrest;
- (3) the conduct of the person stopped during any interaction with the officer, including during the administration of a field sobriety test; or
- (4) a procedure in which a specimen of the person's breath or blood is taken.

Crim. Proc. Code art. 2.139. We note the submitted information includes a video recording made by or at the direction of an officer employed by the department that contains footage of the requestor being stopped or arrested on suspicion of an offense under section 49.04 of the Penal Code. *See* Penal Code § 49.04 (“A person commits an offense if the person is intoxicated while operating a motor vehicle in a public place.”). Therefore, the requestor is entitled to receive a copy of this video recording pursuant to article 2.139. Although the department asserts sections 552.103 and 552.108 of the Government Code to withhold this information, a statutory right of access prevails over the Act's general exceptions to public disclosure. *See, e.g.*, Open Records Decision Nos. 613 at 4 (1993) (exceptions in Act cannot impinge on statutory right of access to information), 451 (1986) (specific statutory right of access provisions overcome general exception to disclosure under the Act). Because sections 552.103 and 552.108 are general exceptions under the Act, the requestor's statutory access under article 2.139 prevails and the department may not withhold the submitted video recording under section 552.103 or section 552.108 of the Government Code. As no other exceptions are raised for the video recording, the department must release it.

Section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code excepts from disclosure “[i]nformation held by a law enforcement agency or prosecutor that deals with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime . . . if . . . release of the information would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime[.]” Gov't Code § 552.108(a)(1). A governmental body claiming section 552.108(a)(1) must reasonably explain how and why the release of the requested information would interfere with law enforcement. *See id.* §§ 552.108(a)(1), .301(e)(1)(A); *see also Ex parte Pruitt*, 551 S.W.2d 706 (Tex. 1977). The department states the remaining information relates to a pending criminal prosecution. Upon review, we conclude the release of the information at issue would interfere with the detection, investigation, or prosecution of crime. *See Houston Chronicle Publ'g Co. v. City of Houston*, 531 S.W.2d 177 (Tex. Civ. App.—Houston [14th Dist.] 1975) (court delineates law enforcement interests present in active cases), *writ ref'd n.r.e. per curiam*, 536 S.W.2d 559 (Tex. 1976). Thus, section 552.108(a)(1) is applicable to the information at issue.

Section 552.108, however, does not except from disclosure basic information about an arrested person, an arrest, or a crime. Gov't Code § 552.108(c). Basic information refers to

the information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle*. See 531 S.W.2d at 186-88; see also Open Records Decision No. 127 at 3-4 (1976) (summarizing types of information considered to be basic information). Thus, with the exception of basic information, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.³

In summary, the department must release the submitted video recording pursuant to article 2.139 of the Code of Criminal Procedure. With the exception of basic information, which must be released, the department may withhold the remaining information under section 552.108(a)(1) of the Government Code.

This letter ruling is limited to the particular information at issue in this request and limited to the facts as presented to us; therefore, this ruling must not be relied upon as a previous determination regarding any other information or any other circumstances.

This ruling triggers important deadlines regarding the rights and responsibilities of the governmental body and of the requestor. For more information concerning those rights and responsibilities, please visit our website at http://www.texasattorneygeneral.gov/open/orl_ruling_info.shtml, or call the Office of the Attorney General's Open Government Hotline, toll free, at (877) 673-6839. Questions concerning the allowable charges for providing public information under the Act may be directed to the Office of the Attorney General, toll free, at (888) 672-6787.

Sincerely,



David L. Wheelus
Assistant Attorney General
Open Records Division

DLW/bhf

Ref: ID# 596852

Enc. Submitted documents

c: Requestor
(w/o enclosures)

³As our ruling is dispositive, we need not address the department's remaining argument under section 552.103 of the Government Code, except to note that the basic information held to be public in *Houston Chronicle* is generally not excepted from disclosure under section 552.103. See Open Records Decision No. 597 (1991).